

Arts for Academic Achievement Evaluation Report June 2009

An Evaluation Funded by Minneapolis Public Schools
Arts for Academic Achievement (AAA) Program



CENTER FOR
APPLIED RESEARCH AND
EDUCATIONAL IMPROVEMENT

COLLEGE OF EDUCATION
+ HUMAN DEVELOPMENT

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA

Evaluation Team:
Delia M. Kundin, PhD
Judy Meath, MPH

Table of Contents

◆ Executive Summary.....	2
◆ Overview	3
◆ Methods	3
◆ Tableau Professional Development for Teachers.....	4
School-based Planning Meetings	4
Artist-led Training in Tableau.....	6
Artist Visits to the Classroom	6
◆ Perceptions of Teachers Using Tableau in Classrooms.....	7
Experiences with Tableau Training	7
Understanding, Teaching, and Assessing Tableau	8
Implementing Tableau in Classrooms	9
Student Impact	9
Accomplishments with Tableau.....	11
Challenges with Tableau	11
Teachers’ Overall Impressions and Recommendations	11
◆ Summary and Recommendations	13

List of Appendices

Appendix A: AAA Planner

Appendix B: 6-Trait Writing Scoring Continuum

Appendix C: Beginning Writer’s Continuum

Appendix D: Wagner, T. (2008). Rigor. *Educational Leadership*.

Appendix E: Interview Protocol

◆ Executive Summary

This report focuses on AAA's efforts to provide professional development opportunities to teachers using a school-based planning approach for integrating Tableau during the 2008-2009 school year. Tableau is a theater arts strategy in which students interpret stories using dramatic techniques. The Arts for Academic Achievement Program (AAA) has incorporated Tableau in Minneapolis Public Schools' classrooms as a strategy to supplement reading and writing instruction.

The main goal for students participating in Tableau is to use their bodies and facial expressions to portray the meaning of a reading passage, in a "frozen picture." The strategy allows students to "bring thinking and reading to life."

Tableau Professional Development

- Twenty-one teachers participated in professional development activities related to Tableau through a combination of school-based planning meetings, artist-led training sessions, and artist visits to classrooms. School-based meetings were designed to connect Tableau activities to students' learning needs, to engage teachers in assessing students' writing, and to augment teachers' professional development.
- A majority of teachers were confident in their abilities to use Tableau, even if they did not mention using the "critical response" skills that were modeled by AAA staff during planning meetings. On average, artists visited teachers in their classrooms to provide Tableau training 11 times, with a range of 3 to 18 artists' visits.

Using Tableau in Classrooms

- The variation in the implementation of Tableau across classrooms and schools makes it difficult to observe students' academic progress as it relates to participation in Tableau. Eight out of 10 Teachers did not have a clear understanding about how often they should use Tableau in their classrooms. A majority of teachers called for processes to be more systematic in the areas of writing assessments, meeting schedules, and artists' visits to classrooms.
- Artists' visits to classrooms worked best when teachers had time available to meet with the artist beforehand, to discuss students' special needs. Teachers also mentioned that it was important for students to be able to assess their own participation.
- Teachers indicated that it was too difficult to distinguish the impact of Tableau on students' academic performance and cited several informal ways they assessed students' progress including improved focus, improved ability to recognize the beginning, middle and end of a story, improved writing and vocabulary, and improved confidence.

◆ Overview

The Center for Applied Research and Educational Improvement (CAREI) has completed several evaluation studies of the Arts for Academic Achievement (AAA) program since the inception of the program over ten years ago. During this time, CAREI has developed a keen understanding of the nature and evolving goals and objectives of the AAA program. During the 2006-2007 school year, the AAA program enlisted CAREI to evaluate an in-depth professional development course training teachers in two particular integrated arts instructional strategies, Readers' Theatre and Tableau. That effort resulted in a better understanding of the effectiveness of embedded professional development in these particular programs, both in terms of what teachers learned to do, as well as their estimation of the ways students benefited academically.

During the 2008-2009 year, AAA program administrators made two key changes to the AAA program. First, they used school-based teams as sites for AAA professional development for teachers, and second, they integrated student writing assessments into the AAA program work at four schools including Jenny Lind Community School, Lake Nokomis-Keewaydin, Kenny Community School, and Waite Park Community School. At each of these four schools, teams planned and carried out student assessments prior to the initiation of arts instructional strategies by artists in the classroom and again at the end of the period of art infusion.

The goal of AAA's work this year was to strengthen its program by providing teachers opportunities to meet with AAA program administrators, fellow teachers, and other school personnel to collaborate on Tableau and Readers' Theatre. The school-based team activities focused on implementing student assessments to develop teachers' capacities to utilize student writing, to plan integrated arts instruction, and to measure student growth.

This report focuses on AAA's efforts to provide professional development opportunities to teachers using the school based team approach for integrating Tableau. While three teachers mentioned in interviews that they worked with Readers' Theatre in addition to Tableau, the focus of their conversations was on Tableau. Thus, this report is organized around information collected by the CAREI evaluation team and used to summarize team meetings and in-depth interviews conducted with teachers who participated in Tableau activities.

◆ Methods

CAREI's evaluation plan focused on providing Minneapolis Public Schools with information to assist with its AAA program delivery decisions. The evaluation plan remained flexible to meet the changing information needs of AAA throughout the 2008-2009 school year. The final

evaluation plan focused on two primary areas and generated information to address the following questions:

1. To what extent does participation in project team processes augment teachers' understanding of teaching and assessing integrated arts (Tableau)?
2. To what extent does student writing performance change in AAA classes in the four schools included in this study ?

The CAREI evaluation team attended AAA team meetings in four schools including, Jenny Lind Community School, Lake Nokomis-Keewaydin , Kenny Community School, and Waite Park Community School. Across schools, a total of 21 teachers participated in these sessions. CAREI evaluators attended the team meetings to document professional development processes and problem solving about Tableau and the use of student writing assessments. Evaluators also conducted confidential in-depth interviews with 10 teachers who agreed to be interviewed. Several informal meetings were also held with key AAA staff members to gather additional program information. The purpose of the teacher interviews was to collect their perceptions about how AAA worked to provide professional development for the integration of Tableau in classrooms. In addition, the CAREI evaluation plan called for the AAA program to provide student writing sample scores to be included in the data analyses. This portion of data analyses became unwieldy for AAA program staff, and CAREI has agreed to supervise scoring of the writing samples. These results will not be available until after the June 30, 2009 report deadline. Further discussion regarding student writing samples is included in the summary and recommendations section below.

◆ **Tableau Professional Development for Teachers**

Tableau is a theater arts technique in which students interpret stories using dramatic techniques. For example, students pose in a statuesque manner to convey their interpretation of a story that is read in class. AAA has incorporated Tableau in Minneapolis Public Schools as a supplemental reading instructional strategy to improve students' reading skills. During the 2008-2009 school year, AAA provided teachers with professional development related to Tableau using a combination of school-based team meetings, artist-led training, and artist visits to the classroom.

School-based Planning Meetings

School-based planning meetings were used this year as a strategy for including teachers in planning for the use of Tableau in their classrooms. AAA program staff organized the meetings using an AAA Planner (Appendix A) designed to guide team discussions with teachers, an artist, and a coordinator/coach at each school. These meetings were scheduled at different points in time throughout the year and were coordinated around school team schedules and artists' visits in the classrooms. The first two meetings served as planning sessions to discuss how Tableau would be implemented and how to collect student information. The last two meetings were scheduled to discuss how things were progressing in classrooms and to assess students' progress.

Table 1 shows the meeting structure used by AAA program staff and the questions used to guide four team meetings scheduled throughout the year.

Table 1.
AAA Planner Structure

Meeting Type	Guiding Questions
Pre-Planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Who? What? Where? When? *Why this project?
Planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *What does the baseline data tell you? * What rigorous learning goals are needed? *What big, open-ended questions will spark your student’s imagination? *What big idea will invite you all-teacher, artist, and students? *How will you collect evidence of learning?
Mid-Course Reflection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *What have you learned by looking at the evidence you have collected? *Where do your students need more opportunities to learn? *What changes will you make?
Final Reflection	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *What did the students learn? *Did teachers grow as professionals? *Did artists meet their goals? *Would the team do this again?

Team meetings are summarized below into three categories: planning Tableau activities and connecting them to students’ learning needs, engaging teachers in assessing students’ writing before and after the integration of Tableau, and augmenting the professional development that teachers received with an artist. In three schools, meetings were attended by three or more teachers, but in Waite Park, one teacher participated in this AAA project.

Planning and Connecting Tableau to Student Learning Needs

Teachers regularly attended and participated in meetings at all four schools. Teachers mentioned that it was important for students to be able to assess their own participation. One recommendation that came out of these discussions was the need to videotape Tableau activities throughout the year.

Teams discussed general school-wide learning goals such as writing, increasing higher level questioning, or increasing active responses. Teachers reported that they examined students’ performances on standardized tests and determined where the greatest needs were in terms of language arts – comprehension, vocabulary, story structure, and so on. They then discussed how

best to address those needs using Tableau strategies. For example, one teacher decided to use a fable in Tableau to teach concepts of main idea and speculation.

Assessing Student Writing

AAA program staff provided the schools with digital images of fine art pieces and asked teachers to have their students write a response to the question, “what is happening in this picture?” AAA staff then walked the teachers through a rubric to evaluate the writing using the 6-Trait Writing Scoring Continuum (Appendix B). These conversations yielded information to improve such efforts in the future. For example, some teachers asked a slightly different question of their students, such as “what do you see in this picture?” In looking at student writing responses to various questions posed by the teacher, it became clear that “What do you see?” often elicited a list, rather than sentences and thus did not allow for assessment of sentence of story structure in student writing.

Professional Development in Critical Response

Critical Response is a strategy utilized in Tableau to focus students on story details. AAA program staff modeled Critical Response in team meetings by asking teachers questions about a picture they were seeing, a story they read aloud, or a “freeze frame” from Tableau. Four core critical response questions are used to elicit teachers’ (and students’) reactions including:

- What did you notice, see, hear?
- What makes you say that?
- What questions does it raise?
- What do you think the author’s intent is?

In team meetings, teachers reported that they were incorporating the question “what makes you say that?” in class throughout the school day.

AAA program staff provided teachers with related written materials, such as Beginning Writer’s Continuum (Appendix C) and an article titled “Rigor” (Appendix D).

Artist-led Training in Tableau

Teachers participated in one or more Tableau training workshops facilitated by an experienced theater artist. The workshops were experiential in which teachers observed and participated, while artists demonstrated how Tableau could be used in classrooms. For example, artists modeled teachers’ roles and teachers took on the role of students and eventually the artist role.

Artist Visits to the Classroom

Teachers commented that artist visits worked best when they had enough time to meet with an artist beforehand to discuss students’ needs.

During classroom visits, artists conducted Tableau with students while teachers remained in their classrooms to observe the process. These visits were intended to train teachers to integrate

Tableau into their regular classroom studies. Teachers were expected to practice using Tableau with an artist present as well as without an artist present.

The main goal for students participating in Tableau was to use their bodies and facial expressions to portray the meaning of a reading passage, in “frozen picture.” The strategy allowed students to “bring thinking and reading to life,” according to one teacher.

By broadening students’ range of expressive modes, the use of Tableau allowed many students who otherwise would not be able to participate (e.g., ELL students or students with Autism) to engage in Tableau participation.

◆ Perceptions of Teachers Using Tableau in Classrooms

Teachers were invited to participate in either a phone interview or a face-to-face interview scheduled at their convenience. The following descriptive analysis summarizes the results of interviews with 10 teachers who agreed to participate in the study. These teachers represented grades K-5 as shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2.
Grade Level and Teachers

Grade Level	No. of Teachers
Kindergarten	2
First	2
Second	2
Third	1
Fourth	2
Fifth	1

The CAREI evaluation team scripted the interview protocol and used it to conduct the interviews (Appendix E). Interview questions focused on identifying the degree to which participation in AAA project team processes augmented teachers’ understanding of teaching and assessing integrated arts and how these strategies were implemented in classrooms. Teachers identified some potential challenges they encountered and they offered some recommendations for future planning.

Experiences with Tableau Training

Teachers who participated in interviews had from one to three years of Tableau experience in their classrooms. With regard to training, teachers mentioned several ways they participated in Tableau training this past year. Most teachers recalled receiving artists in their classrooms. The majority of these teachers attended three planning meetings interspersed throughout the year where they practiced Critical Response and planned and discussed work on student writing

assessments. Finally, some teachers attended a workshop or training in the arts integration strategy. Table 3 shows the various ways teachers indicated that they participated in Tableau training this past year.

Table 3.
Tableau Training Experiences

Type of Training	No. of Teachers
Artist in Classroom	8
On-Site Sabbaticals	5
Workshops/trainings	4
Group Meetings	3

The amount of time teachers worked with artists ranged from three to 18 visits. Some teachers practiced a few times with an artist in their classrooms, while others worked with an artist up to two times per week. When asked what they found most useful about planning meetings and working with an artist, teachers indicated that it was important to learn how to incorporate Tableau into their curricula and classrooms. For example, one teacher described her experiences with AAA trainers.

“[AAA] demonstrated what we were to do with our kids. She modeled. She showed us -- what questions to ask, and how you get them to talk. We did it, we looked at something [an image] and we talked about it. ‘What do you see now, What does this remind you of?’ She went through all of that and didn’t tell us until afterwards what exactly the purpose was and then encouraged us to do the same thing with our classes. The work with the artist was very useful as well. We talked about strategies and how to encourage the children to talk about what they read and then how to show that.”

Understanding, Teaching, and Assessing Tableau

Teachers’ perceptions regarding the extent to which AAA team meetings enhanced their understanding of Tableau in their classrooms were mixed. Four teachers mentioned that the meetings did not have an impact on their understanding, while three teachers described the ways they benefited from the meetings. In the latter three cases, teachers indicated that they had a better understanding of how to help improve students’ writing with the use of vocabulary, and thinking strategies.

“It’s really helped me to develop a deeper understanding of the kinds of things I need to scaffold for students to get better writing out of them. It’s not just about write and write better, it’s more about what do you see, how does it make you feel, what do you hear? Like really engaging their senses in a lot of ways.”

“It’s made me realize how looking at a piece of artwork could develop their vocabulary and their thinking strategies. We read the story together and kids who had difficulty writing, the physical manipulation of holding a pencil, they could make a freeze frame of it and show what they knew. It’s another modality.”

“I picked up a lot of vocabulary from [the artist] that he used. I have incorporated that back into the class.”

Eight teachers were confident in their abilities to carry out Tableau in their classrooms. They described using “frozen pictures,” “freeze frames,” “beginning, middle, end,” and “hard and soft focus” as skills they acquired to integrate arts in their classrooms. One teacher mentioned using “actors’ tools” in warm up sessions and the confidence teachers need to use arts strategies.

“I warm up the kids with actors’ tools for both Readers Theatre and Tableau. It’s a whole new ball game that I had never done anything like that nor was I comfortable doing it. And to understand that it’s open-ended; that can be very threatening to a teacher. It’s not as structured so there is the opportunity for things to get a little crazy. That can be hard for a teacher.”

Implementing Tableau in Classrooms

Eight teachers said they did not have a clear understanding about how often they should use Tableau. One of these teachers indicated that she used Tableau as a “little strategy” where it made sense. The following statements are examples where teachers described their understanding of how often to implement Tableau.

“I don’t know that there’s an expectation of once a week or once a month -- That hasn’t been clearly defined. You use it when it’s appropriate. For example, when a story comes up that would really adapt to it. It’s a good way to do beginning, middle, and end, which we do all the time, but we usually write it out. Tableau makes it physical; they’re using their faces and bodies. It’s physical.”

“I never really felt like it was overly emphasized that we had to include it a lot once the artist was not working with us. As teachers that’s a horrible thing to say, because when you learn something you want to be able to integrate it and implement it the way it’s supposed to be done. But in reality, I wasn’t exactly sure.”

When asked how much time they spent on Tableau in the classroom, four teachers said they used Tableau once or twice a week for 30 to 50 minutes. Three teachers did not use Tableau beyond the time they spent working with an artist, while one teacher used Tableau one day a week for 90 minutes throughout the year.

Student Impact

Descriptions about how writing assessments were used were mixed. Three teachers mentioned that the writing assessments were very useful to show change in students’ writing. However,

two of these teachers believed that the writing assessment process was not systematic enough. Another three teachers indicated that it was difficult to separate the impact of Tableau on students' academic progress from other teaching strategies they used in their classrooms. One teacher said, *"I don't know because it is impossible to take that out, or just make that single connection. I think there is no way to know."* Two teachers did not assess writing at all.

Nine teachers mentioned a variety of informal ways they assessed students' progress. Table 4 shows the ways these teachers observed changes in students' performances. Seven teachers observed that students improved their focus. This included examples of students participating in impressionistic conversation and paying close attention to a story's structure, the characters, the setting, the details and the problems addressed in stories. Students' abilities to recognize the beginning, middle, and end of a story; improved writing and vocabulary; and improved confidence were other ways teachers observed students' progress. One teacher mentioned that the biggest change she observed was with her "lower reading groups." She said,

"My biggest gain was with my lower students and their ability to break up stories into beginning, middle, and end and the ability to stop and pull back and think about the important parts you need to have from the beginning...All of a sudden they got involved and were participating. I thought it raised their confidence, and this was something they could feel comfortable doing. They knew they could figure out what to do. We kept talking about how you would do this in Tableau."

**Table 4.
Student Impact**

Teacher Observations	No. of Teachers
Improved Focus (e.g., Characters, Setting, Problem, Details, Story Structure)	7
Improved Writing	4
Beginning, Middle, End	3
Improved Vocabulary	2
Improved Confidence	2
Increased Engagement (e.g., visual, auditory, kinesthetic learners, ELL)	2
Improved Comprehension	2

Another teacher described her observations regarding to students' reading scores. She said,

"My students' reading scores went way up from beginning of the year until the end. I know it's not all due to Tableau, but I did compare my students' writing to students in another 1st grade class who didn't get Tableau and my students were pretty far ahead."

Accomplishments with Tableau

Seven teachers believed they were successful at implementing Tableau in their classrooms. Five teachers offered several examples of what they enjoyed most about working with Tableau. For example, teachers enjoyed splitting their classes with an artist and/or a teaching assistant. Having someone else in the classroom meant that every student had an opportunity to participate. One teacher said, *“That was the best day. The [students] were in the audience, but they knew their turn was coming and they would get to act.”*

In another example, a teacher appreciated that her students had opportunities to learn about alternative ways to look at books. She said,

“I loved the exposure that our kids got. Being inner city kids, I think that’s so important even if it’s something that isn’t so much carried through as diligently as we’d like to do it. I do think the exposure is fantastic...With Tableau, it gave them a way to look at books differently and how they would re-enact a scene. I hadn’t seen them do that outside of the time we spent with the artist. It was interesting to have them break their focus and break their concentration.”

Challenges with Tableau

Three teachers were challenged by time and scheduling constraints when attempting to use Tableau in their classrooms, while another teacher struggled with special needs students’ reactions to Tableau activities. She said,

“The biggest challenge was working with students [with development disorders]. One of them did great and one struggled and one fell apart when [the artist] was here...That was hard because [the artist] didn’t have a lot of up front information about it. He knew they were there but he wasn’t sure who they were or what we did with them. After the first couple of weeks he observed how we dealt with it and he used the same words.”

In another example, a teacher expressed frustration with inconsistent time spent with an artist, and with difficulty teaching students how to express emotions. She said, *“[The artist] was here once a week and then two times the next. It just got too much. I don’t think we need nine sessions. That was one challenge. Then being able to portray an emotion besides happy and sad, and standing still, that’s been a big thing.”*

Teachers’ Overall Impressions and Recommendations

Four teachers cited attending staff development, working through processes with AAA trainers, transferring Tableau to other subjects (e.g., math), and planning as positive aspects of using Tableau. For example, one teacher expressed her satisfaction with working with AAA trainers this year. She said,

“I feel like [AAA program staff] was very supportive and helped us out as much as she could. We had never had anybody like that, that cared about what was going on. I thought it went well.”

Areas where teachers thought improvements should be made included clarifying expectations for using Tableau, improving scheduling (e.g., team meetings and time spent with artists), and using systematic writing assessments. Specific recommendations in each of these areas are summarized below.

Expectations

One teacher suggested that AAA include a demonstration video in introductory workshops to help teachers understand what Tableau would look like in their classrooms. She said,

“I think that when you first start these things, you don’t really know what to expect. So you expect this artist to come in and it’s not really clear, the roles aren’t clear enough for me and it would be nice if I had a video demonstrating how this is done for a specific grade and this is how it will go in my room and the ways that I can support the artist’s work by preparing students.”

Scheduling

Four teachers mentioned their concerns about overall scheduling for training and AAA activities in their schools. One teacher suggested that training start early in the summer months before school starts. Another teacher had a concern about how decisions were made with respect to which AAA activities were scheduled in her school. She said, *“We were asked in the fall and then what we were asked didn’t happen anyway, so I don’t know why we were asked. Teachers don’t have input.”*

Writing Assessments

Teachers agreed that writing assessments were key components for knowing how students grew as writers and readers. Three teachers suggested that more systematic writing assessments need to be developed. One teacher called for monthly writing assessments. She said,

“If we were going to look at writing, we should be more precise in that. So we should look at it every month and we’re going to implement it more frequently and more specifically. Okay now we want to teach them this or that strategy or skill and the way we’re going to do that is this, and now we’re going to look at the writing and consider whether or not they demonstrate that and we don’t really do that. It’s much more general.”

Time With an Artist

Two teachers mentioned that nine sessions with an artist was too long, while another teacher mentioned that refresher sessions with artists would be useful. She indicated that she would not use Tableau without this type of incentive. Two teachers suggested that training with artists should be broken into two sessions with a few months break between the two. One teacher recommended that an effective way to work with an artist would be to split the training into two sessions with time between (i.e., fall and spring) so they would be “bookend” sessions. She said,

“I love it. I love having [AAA Artist] come in. I want him to do the same next year – two cycles, fall and spring. It’s nice to bookend it like that because he sees such growth. I get tips on doing Tableau every time he comes.”

Another teacher believed that having artists work on students' writing in classrooms was not useful. She believed that the artist's time was better spent focusing on the acting component of Tableau.

◆ Summary and Recommendations

In this section we summarize the evaluation results as they pertain to the two evaluation questions used to guide our work.

1. To what extent does participation in project team processes augment teachers' understanding of teaching and assessing integrated arts (Tableau)?

AAA program staff worked with the four schools to identify opportunities where Tableau activities could take place throughout the school year. These training opportunities included workshops, artists' visits, day-long sabbaticals, and study groups. For the most part, a decision about when and how to use Tableau was left up to the discretion of teachers. This helps to explain the variation in Tableau implementation. Some teachers mentioned that they worked on training with an artist over the course of three visits, while others trained for 18 visits. Some teachers used Tableau once or twice for 30-50 minute sessions, while one teacher used Tableau every week for up to 90 minutes each time. Still others did not use Tableau at all once they completed their training with an artist. This variation in the implementation of Tableau makes it difficult to observe students' academic progress as it relates to participation in Tableau. Areas where teachers did observe positive changes included students' improved reading focus, improved writing, improved ability to identify parts of a story (i.e., beginning, middle, end), improved vocabulary, and improved confidence. While these types of student changes are not formal compared to standardized tests, teachers considered them important aspects of students' overall success.

Teachers were confident in their abilities to use Tableau, even if they did not mention using the "critical response" skills that were modeled by AAA staff during team meetings. For example, when teachers were asked to identify the skills they used in their classrooms, they mentioned using "frozen pictures," "freeze frames," "beginning, middle, end," (parts of a story), and "hard and soft focus." While these are important features of implementing Tableau, they do not address how teachers engaged students to think critically using the four critical response questions (What did you notice, see, hear? What makes you say that? What questions does it raise? What do you think the author's intent is?) However, in team meetings, teachers reported that they were incorporating the question "what makes you say that?" in class throughout the school day.

Overall, teachers had positive experiences with Tableau this year, they attended staff development sessions, they worked with AAA through team meetings, and they planned. In two cases, teachers mentioned transferring some aspects of Tableau to other subjects. Teachers' suggestions for improvements included making expectations clear, scheduling training early in the year, making writing assessments more systematic, and splitting training sessions to occur in fall and spring as "bookend" sessions.

2. To what extent does student writing performance change in AAA classes?

As mentioned in the methods section of this report, the AAA program intended to score writing samples from four schools for the purpose of analyzing students' progress. Initially, the 6-Trait Writing Scoring Continuum (used by Minneapolis Public Schools) was believed to be an appropriate guide for scoring students' writing samples. However, during the course of scoring papers, AAA determined that the rubric was too broad and it did not allow for enough variation in students' writing. As a result of this challenge, AAA will further explore more appropriate scoring options and use this year's work to develop those scoring processes. AAA's plans for next year include the development of writing rubrics that focus on writing samples for Tableau.

Recommendations:

- ◆ Continue with the building-level planning meeting approach, as it provides opportunities for teachers to plan for integrating arts into curriculum and assessment.
- ◆ Clarify for teachers the expectation of how often Tableau should be used in classrooms. This also needs to include an expectation that artists' visits to classes include teacher practice of the Tableau strategy. This should be communicated to artists and teachers.
- ◆ Clarify for teachers which preferred critical response prompts should be used when providing instructions for students' writing assessments (e.g., "What is happening in this picture?").
- ◆ Continue to develop systematic writing assessments that can be used in multiple school sites. This may help to track students' academic progress through Tableau
- ◆ Schedule Tableau training workshops early in the year. Provide information that demonstrates what happens in a classroom when implementing Tableau (e.g., training video).
- ◆ Consider splitting up classroom training with artists to accommodate a request for training sessions to occur in fall and spring as "bookend" sessions.
- ◆ Investigate developing formal processes for capturing students' progress focusing on informal indicators articulated by teachers including improved focus, improved writing, improved vocabulary, improved confidence, and increased engagement.