Community Supervision and Health: A Scoping Review

Elizabeth L. Shaver,1 Katherine Rosenow,2 Tyler Winkelman, MD,3-4 Rebecca Shlafer, PhD MPH4
1Institute of Child Development, 2Department of Psychology, 3Department of Medicine, 4Department of Pediatrics
University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN

Introduction

- Incarceration is strongly associated with poor health outcomes.
- The majority of adults involved in the criminal justice system are not currently incarcerated, but are instead under community supervision (e.g. probation and parole).
- There is minimal research documenting the intersections between community supervision and health.
- The research has explored the experiences of children and families of those who are incarcerated, but has largely ignored the experiences of children and families of adults under community supervision.

Purpose

- The aim of the current study is to conduct a scoping review to better understand the current state of the literature regarding the collateral consequences of community supervision on health.
- An additional aim is to understand the intersection between community supervision and children and families.

Methods

- This scoping review is part of an ongoing Grand Challenges team project “Identifying and Addressing Disparities in the Criminal Justice and Health Care Systems.”
  - Co-Pls: R. Shlafer, T. Winkelman, K. Reitz, M. Phelps
- In collaboration with the University Libraries, the Grand Challenges team participated in a “Research Sprint” in January 2018. One goal of the Sprint was to begin a scoping review on community supervision and health.
- 2000 articles were identified based on specific search criteria related to community supervision and health. An additional search criteria of “Children and Families” was included to address a secondary research question.
- All articles were imported into Rayyan, a web-based software for systematic reviews.
- Two undergraduate students (ELS, KR) independently reviewed each abstract and excluded those that met one or more parameter(s) of the exclusion criteria:
  - Not related to health
  - Publication prior to January 1, 1984
  - No mention of probation, parole, or community supervision
  - Juvenile population only
  - Editorial or commentary
  - Intervention in a jail or prison
  - Case reports or case example(s)

Preliminary Results

- To date, Student 1 (ELS) has included 8.3% of the articles reviewed, has excluded 21.3% and has not yet reviewed 70.4%.
- To date, Student 2 (KR) has included 6.6% of the articles reviewed, has excluded 14.9% and has not yet reviewed 78.6%.
- To date, there are conflicts with 41 articles that need to be resolved between ELS and KR.

Discussion

- This scoping review provides background for the larger Grand Challenges project.
- In our initial review of study titles and abstracts, we are excluding about 2/3 of the articles and including about 1/3.
- Even with standard exclusion criteria, there are still 41 articles of conflict between the two reviewers. After an initial meeting, it was decided to include rather than exclude an article if unsure at this stage.
- ELS also added the label “Children and Families” to articles that discuss the intersection between community supervision and children and families. These studies will likely be summarized in a separate paper.
  - Of 646 articles reviewed, only 6 (0.9%) meet this criteria.

Next Steps

- After each abstract is independently reviewed by the two reviewers, there will be a meeting with the Grand Challenges team to discuss the abstracts where conflicts occur.
- We will then review the full text of each article that was included. Additional articles will likely be excluded at this next stage.
- When the second review of the articles is complete, there will be another meeting to discuss any conflicts between the reviewers.
- In order to complete this in a timely manner, more research assistants will be added, and will use Rayyan to aid in the exclusion/inclusion of abstracts, as well as articles.
- The Grand Challenges team will use this scoping review as the background for their project, which aims to understand the intersection between community supervision and health.