

# VII

## Language, Mind, and Knowledge

---

MINNESOTA STUDIES IN THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Minnesota Studies in the  
PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

HERBERT FEIGL AND GROVER MAXWELL, GENERAL EDITORS

---

VOLUME VII

*Language, Mind, and Knowledge*

EDITED BY

KEITH GUNDERSON

FOR THE MINNESOTA CENTER FOR PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA PRESS, MINNEAPOLIS

© Copyright 1975 by the  
UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA

All rights reserved

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

PUBLISHED IN CANADA BY BURNS & MACEACHERN LIMITED, DON MILLS, ONTARIO

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number: 74-22836  
ISBN 0-8166-0742-7

---

## *Preface*

To publish a collection of papers in any field as susceptible to change as the philosophy of language currently is, incurs the editorial risk of endorsing some odd package of intellectual curios flattened into irredeemable obsolescence by the whirring past of Time's wingèd chariot. (This calls to mind an analogous impasse in appreciating contemporary art: by the time something seems worthy of display, it's *not* indicative of what's going on.) Fortunately for the readers of this volume, the editor, by biding his time, resisting all pressures to rush into print — some felt as early as 1969 — has been able to select only papers with a high density of timeless truths. This latter quality was not, unfortunately, always perceived by the authors themselves. Their resultant impatience — typified by such banter as “When is that volume with my article going to appear?” — I prefer, however, not to parade in public, any more than I would seek to puff up my own importance as editor by making conspicuous whatever number of compliments I have received in private for my judicious “holding back” until the contents were as they should be. (Note: what was to be my own contribution to this volume — a criticism of Professor Dennett's piece — was, after years of scrutiny, judged unworthy of inclusion and, hence, self-rejected.)

Some of the papers, in one form or another, were presented at or grew out of a conference in the philosophy of language sponsored by the Minnesota Center for the Philosophy of Science in the summer of 1968 under the directorship of Professor Herbert Feigl, and funded by a grant from the Carnegie Foundation. Other pieces were written more or less from scratch by participants in the conference a year or so afterward. Some were generously donated to the volume by invitees to the conference who had been unable to attend (the papers by Noam Chom-

## Preface

sky and Jerrold Katz), and some were simply solicited from the unwary by the editor along the way.

The aim of this volume, like that of the conference, was to assemble a wide variety of approaches to issues in the philosophy of language, with an eye to scope and to the ways in which the salient issues involved have bearing on other matters such as linguistic theory, cognitive psychology, the philosophy of mind, and epistemology. Although it has proved impossible to cover such a wide and variegated waterfront within the confines of one book, I hope the collection displays some of the more fascinating wharves to be found.

For help in preparing this volume, special thanks are due Caroline Cohen, the secretary for the Minnesota Center, and, as always, to Herbert Feigl, Regents' Professor of Philosophy Emeritus and former director, and to Professor Grover Maxwell, current director of the Center. I also wish to extend my gratitude to Christopher Swoyer and Ernesto Pasquale LePore for preparing the index.

Keith Gunderson, Research Associate  
MINNESOTA CENTER FOR PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

February 1975

---

## Contents

LANGUAGES AND LANGUAGE, by David Lewis, PRINCETON UNIVERSITY .....	3
LOGIC AND LANGUAGE: AN EXAMINATION OF RECENT CRITICISMS OF INTENSIONALISM, by Jerrold J. Katz, MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY .....	36
THE MEANING OF "MEANING," by Hilary Putnam, HARVARD UNIVERSITY .....	131
REFERENCE AND CONTEXT, by Charles Chastain, UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT CHICAGO CIRCLE .....	194
LANGUAGE, THOUGHT, AND COMMUNICATION, by Gilbert Harman, PRINCETON UNIVERSITY .....	270
KNOWLEDGE OF LANGUAGE, by Noam Chomsky, MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY .....	299
LANGUAGE, RULES, AND COMPLEX BEHAVIOR, by Michael D. Root, UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA .....	321
A TAXONOMY OF ILLOCUTIONARY ACTS, by John R. Searle, UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA AT BERKELEY .....	344
ON WHAT WE KNOW, by Zeno Vendler, RICE UNIVERSITY .....	370
VENDLER ON KNOWLEDGE AND BELIEF, by Bruce Aune, UNIVERSITY OF MASSACHUSETTS AT AMHERST .....	391
REPLY TO PROFESSOR AUNE, by Zeno Vendler, RICE UNIVERSITY .....	400
BRAIN WRITING AND MIND READING, by D. C. Dennett, TUFTS UNIVERSITY .....	403
INDEX .....	417

**MINNESOTA STUDIES IN THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE**