

# Workforce Development Strategies for Brooklyn Park, MN: Group 1 Report



## Prepared by

Sean Hayford O'leary, Denetric Powers, and Angela Riffe

Students in PA 5512: Workforce and Economic Development

Instructor: Neal Young

---

## Prepared on Behalf of

City of Brooklyn Park  
Community Development Department

Fall 2016

The project on which this report is based was completed in collaboration with the City of Brooklyn Park as part of the 2016–2017 Resilient Communities Project (RCP) partnership. RCP is a program at the University of Minnesota’s Center for Urban and Regional Affairs (CURA) that connects University faculty and students with Minnesota communities to address strategic projects that advance local resilience and sustainability.

The contents of this report represent the views of the authors, and do not reflect those of RCP, CURA, the Regents of the University of Minnesota, or the City of Brooklyn Park.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported License. To view a copy of this license, visit [www.creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/](http://www.creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/) or send a letter to Creative Commons, 444 Castro Street,

Suite 900, Mountain View, California, 94041, USA. Any reproduction, distribution, or derivative use of this work under this license must be accompanied by the following attribution: “Produced by the Resilient Communities Project ([www.rcp.umn.edu](http://www.rcp.umn.edu)) at the University of Minnesota. Reproduced under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 3.0 Unported License.”

This publication may be available in alternate formats upon request.

**Resilient Communities Project**

University of Minnesota  
330 HHHSPA  
301—19th Avenue South  
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55455  
Phone: (612) 625-7501  
E-mail: [rcp@umn.edu](mailto:rcp@umn.edu)  
Web site: <http://www.rcp.umn.edu>



*The University of Minnesota is committed to the policy that all persons shall have equal access to its programs, facilities, and employment without regard to race, color, creed, religion, national origin, sex, age, marital status, disability, public assistance status, veteran status, or sexual orientation.*

# Workforce Development Strategies for Brooklyn Park, MN

Sean Hayford Oleary  
Denetrick Powers  
Angela Riffe

PA 5512 | Fall 2016

## Introduction and Key Findings

Brooklyn Park is a city with a set of unique opportunities and challenges. It contains a variety of different built environments, ranging from relatively urban neighborhoods to the south to greenfield suburban areas in the northern part of the city.

<sup>1</sup> As the second-largest suburb in the Twin Cities, it has a significant population and opportunity to attract businesses and jobs to serve residents of all walks of life.<sup>2</sup> We examined possible workforce strategies applicable to the City of Brooklyn Park, based on studies of their effectiveness and national examples of their use. We organized our examination based on the questions provided by Brooklyn Park, and this paper is divided into corresponding sections. Those key questions were:

1. What targeted workforce development strategies would be most effective in the neighborhoods with highest unemployment?
2. What is missing in the current workforce delivery models to address cultural competence to effectively connect with historically underrepresented communities?
3. Given the expected Blue Line Extension LRT investment, what local and national case studies of transit-oriented workforce development strategies exist? Are there successful examples in a suburban context?

---

<sup>1</sup> Hansen, Erik "Brooklyn Park Introduction." PA 5512 Workforce Development, 04 October 2016, University of Minnesota Twin Cities. Guest lecture in class.

<sup>2</sup> "[Annual Estimates of the Resident Population for Incorporated Places: April 1, 2010 to July 1, 2015.](#)" US Census Bureau, 2015.

## Key Findings

Our key findings were:

- Workforce development programs tend to be more successful with a diverse set of non-profit, private sector, governmental, and community stakeholders involved.
- Expanding “pre-and-post employment wraparound” services such as childcare and transportation for communities can lower the barrier of entry to workforce development programs.
- Culturally competent evaluations can be used to ensure that the nature of a problem or need is adequately understood, and that the appropriate services are selected. Measurements of cultural competency can be important and facilitate accountability.
- Connecting workers to low-skilled jobs in suburban areas with transit has had spotty success in the Twin Cities area.
- There is little evidence that transit improves income or rates of employment; however, Brooklyn Park might still try to capitalize on the Blue Line Extension LRT (which will be built regardless) for the benefit of their workforce.

# 1. Strategies for Areas with High Unemployment

## Introduction

From the literature, it is clear that no single policy or program will address the complexity of issues facing the neighborhoods of Brooklyn Park. For these neighborhoods, issues of unemployment are multifaceted. Rather than featuring a single policy or program, this section explores a combination of policies and programs to provide a more comprehensive solution to address the many barriers that exist to workforce development in Brooklyn Park. While education and worker training programs can have some measure of success, programs that also address barriers in housing, transportation, childcare provide a more comprehensive approach to enhance workforce. Furthermore, it is imperative that the City of Brooklyn Park rely on the community to help identify barriers and work collaboratively to solve them.

Workforce development programs tend to have more success when a diverse set of non-profit, private sector, governmental, and community stakeholders are included.<sup>3</sup> For example, in the early part of 2015, the Winona Chamber of Commerce in Winona, Minnesota worked in conjunction with students, education partners, workforce development programs, and local businesses to develop a program to address businesses challenges in the community.<sup>4</sup> This program called Business Education Networks maintains a partnership and communication between these entities to address local communities workforce development needs. This project developed a manufacturing and job outlook directory for each local company which included the desired skills of these positions. Local community colleges and area high schools use this

---

<sup>3</sup> McConnell, K. "[Municipal Action Guide](#)." National League of Cities. 2010.

<sup>4</sup> "[Our Goal](#)." Hot Jobs, Cool Companies. Retrieved on December 1, 2016

manual when developing curriculum for their schools. The Business Education Network also partnered to host an event where local high school students were exposed to jobs and trade opportunities within the city of Winona. The funding for this program was through the Bush Foundation with a \$300,000 grant and the Carlson Family Foundation with a grant of \$105,000.

In Burnsville, Minnesota during the early part of 2015, business, community organizations, and K-12 education partnered together to offer career specific training and technical certifications, like certified nursing assistants at the local high school.<sup>5</sup> The program has shown early signs of success in the recent hiring of full time staff to support the program. The funding for this program is supported by the St. Paul Foundation, the F.R. Bigelow Foundation and the Greater Twin Cities United Way totally nearly \$500,000.

In both examples common community partners include the local workforce investment board, chamber of commerce, educational institutions, and philanthropic funder. A critical component of success for these programs is the development of joint priorities, tracking, and accountability between partners.<sup>6</sup> The Minnesota Chamber of Commerce through the Grow Minnesota!<sup>SM</sup> program visits local businesses through the local chamber, collects data on the needs of businesses such as workforce and hiring information, and helps to provide retention resources, if requested. Partnership with Brooklyn Park's local chamber and Minnesota Chamber of Commerce could be an excellent source of business data. Literature also advises that workforce development training and community college provide outcomes reporting.<sup>7</sup>

---

<sup>5</sup> Gessner, J. "Burnsville Promise Showing Promise. *Sun*, 03 March 2016.

<sup>6</sup> "[Promising Practices Briefing Reports \(April 2016\)](#)." Workforce Strategies Initiative. 2016.

<sup>7</sup> Overman, Dana, "[Neighborhood Capital: A multidisciplinary holistic approach to neighborhood revitalization through workforce and economic development](#)." Capstone Projects – Politics and Government. Paper 11, 2011.

## Community College and Workforce Development Partnerships

A critical piece to the success of these programs mentioned above are community colleges. Community colleges are an important access point for skill improvements for low skilled workers.<sup>8</sup> A common workforce development strategy for community colleges is to offer more basic job training in remedial courses. According to Assid (2002), "courses that develop both basic academic and workplace skills make developmental education more relevant to the job market and to the student."<sup>9</sup> There is research that people with little or no labor market experience need to master "soft" employment skills."<sup>10</sup> Furthermore, successful community colleges also expanded support services such as child care, drug treatment, health care, family counseling and transportation.<sup>11</sup> For example, a community college in North Virginia expanded services and realized better retention from their lower income students of color. In order to expand services, they relied on expansion of services resulted from partnerships with community organizations.

One suggestion from the Greater Washington policy think tank is to integrate literacy and basic education training skills.<sup>12</sup> It appears that North Hennepin Community College in Brooklyn Park already offers both job skills and English proficiency. Expanding "pre-and-post employment wraparound" services such as childcare and transportation for communities help to lower the barrier of entry for people seeking skills improvement.

---

<sup>8</sup> Alssid, J. L., Gruber, D., Jenkins, D., Mazzeo, C., Roberts, B., & Stanback-Stroud, R. "Building a Career Pathways System: Promising Practices in Community College-Centered Workforce Development." 2002.

<sup>9</sup> Ibid.

<sup>10</sup> Moss, P., & Tilly, C. "'Soft' skills and race: An investigation of black men's employment problems." *Work and Occupations*, 23(3), 252-276, 1996.

<sup>11</sup> Browning, Bill. "[Northern Virginia Community College's Comprehensive Solution to the Adult College Completion Challenge](#)." Aspen Institute, 2016.

<sup>12</sup> The Poverty to Prosperity Program and the CAP Economic Policy Team. (n.d.). [Expanding Opportunities in America's Urban Areas](#).



In Flint Michigan, a community college developed an innovative strategy to improve funding streams for low income students.<sup>13</sup> They devised a strategy for federal Pell Grants to cover the cost of non-credit occupation programs. Pell Grants are awarded through the number of hours a student is in a classroom, or “clock hours.” The college raised the number of hours a student was in the classroom to the federal minimum of 600 hours and helped students apply for federal funding. As of March 2016, this program has funded 43 students and 93% of these students finished the program.

Centralized one-stop workforce development location with individualized case managers is a hallmark of successful workforce development strategies.<sup>14</sup> Ideally, these centers provide social services, job skill training, and educational opportunities. Several cities offer these services. Baltimore has a neighborhood-based workforce development strategy that features a one-stop shop job seekers complete with child care, transportation, housing and legal service assistance.<sup>15</sup> Beginning in early 2017, the City of Minneapolis will also feature a one-stop shop that is designed to help small businesses navigate city permitting regulations.<sup>16</sup> Research also suggests that the closer the proximity one-stop shops are to the population being served, the better the outcome.<sup>17</sup>

## **Municipal Influence**

The role of the City of Brooklyn Park should be to engage and facilitate conversations between non-profit, community and neighborhood organizations, educational institutions, local businesses, and the workforce development board. The

---

<sup>13</sup> Altstadt, David. "[The Power of Pell](#)," Aspen Institute. 2016.

<sup>14</sup> Overman, Dana, "[Neighborhood Capital: A multidisciplinary holistic approach to neighborhood revitalization through workforce and economic development](#)," Capstone Projects – Politics and Government. Paper 11, 2011.

<sup>15</sup> "[Career Center Services](#)," Baltimore Mayor's Office of Employment Development. Retrieved 14 December 2016.

<sup>16</sup> Lewis, A. "[Minneapolis cuts red tape for small business owners](#)," KARE-TV, 10 December 2016.

<sup>17</sup> Overman, Dana, "[Neighborhood Capital: A multidisciplinary holistic approach to neighborhood revitalization through workforce and economic development](#)," Capstone Projects – Politics and Government. Paper 11, 2011.

National League of Cities (NLC) developed a Municipal Action Guide around the city's role in workforce development.<sup>18</sup> First, they suggest for a city to ask questions and listen to key stakeholders to fully understand the needs of your regional economy. Important questions include: What are the main barriers facing business? What are the communication channels between organizations tackling workforce development challenges? The next step is to work with your workforce investment board to discover their existing programs and strategies, and then engage the broad audience of organizations that workforce development touches, like non-profit organizations. Next, after connecting with community organizations, champion clear workforce development policies to the city at large through media and city council meetings. Lastly, as a city, be an excellent source of information to the community. This may include hiring additional staff to manage resources Brooklyn Park's website, or offering to connect individuals with relevant organizations.

An example of a city that followed the suggestions of the Municipal Guide to Action is the city of Seattle, Washington. Beginning in 1995 and continuing today, the City of Seattle created a sector-based, community initiative complete with expanded services to address workforce challenges for low-income workers.<sup>19</sup> The initiative prioritized the development of soft skills along with the technical skills needed in the community. In addition to soft skills, they prioritized training for positions with opportunities for advancement. In 2011, the Seattle Jobs Initiative began a Career Pathways program. Graduates of the program have average wages of \$14.05 with a three month retention of 77%.<sup>20</sup>

---

<sup>18</sup> McConnell, K. "[Municipal Action Guide](#)." National League of Cities, 2010.

<sup>19</sup> Fitzgerald, J., & Leigh, N. G. *Job centered economic development: an approach for linking economic and workforce development. Implementing economic development: strategies and cases for regeneration*, Sage, Thousand Oaks, CA. 2001.

<sup>20</sup> "[Facts & Results](#)." Seattle Jobs Initiative. 2015.

Several other cities have also prioritized neighborhood workforce development strategies, housing policies to protect low income workers, and work with existing non-profit, community organizations, and religious organizations in neighborhoods. Working with a diverse set of partners creates an awareness of local and neighborhood issues and can provide emergency services to families who need them. The city of Denver views housing policies as a workforce development issue.<sup>21</sup> Policies are in place to ensure that low income residents are not disproportionately affected by increased property taxes and rent that could lead to displacement. Funding for these program comes from a mix of state, local, foundation, and private donors.

## Models

The Competitive Workforce Initiative can serve as a successful model for how to develop a community-based workforce development delivery model.<sup>22</sup> This initiative is born out of the federal Promise Zone, which is a federal initiative that features collaboration across the non-profit, public, and private sectors along with development joint priorities and metrics. The Competitive Workforce initiative is located in Kentucky. The program built built networks to connect businesses with qualified workers through streamlining. Another priority has been to align education with employers need through sector strategies. Furthermore, they collect and analyze data on current needs and future workforce trends and create and implement a comprehensive communications plan around workforce efforts. New York City used a similar initiate and expand industry partnerships while establishing a one-stop shop for job seekers.<sup>23</sup>

---

<sup>21</sup> Sesay, A., O'Connor, K., & Garcia-Eckstein, L. (n.d.). [Neighborhood Revitalization Strategy](#).

<sup>22</sup> "Priorities." Partners for a Competitive Workforce. Retrieved 12 December 2016.

<sup>23</sup> "[Career Pathways: One City Working Together](#)." City of New York, 2015.

## 2. Reaching Underrepresented Communities

Traditional workforce development models focus on different methods of building skills and strategies to meet the need of underrepresented communities. Understanding that employers need to be supported in order to understand the needs of potential employees, there have been an increasing number of strategies to provide support to meet the needs of employers. Though there is evidence that traditional workforce development models decrease unemployment rates in disadvantaged communities, there are still many things that can be learned.<sup>24</sup> Other professional fields such as health care and social services have developed many cultural competence models that have improved the recruitment and training of staff in response to growing diversity of clients. By understanding the cultural differences between racial ethnic groups and the effects of gentrification, effective methods can be discovered.

The City of Brooklyn Park and other local municipalities across the country use traditional workforce development efforts to address issues of unemployment and racial disparities in income. These traditional efforts use a problem-based approach that identifies the core barrier as a lack of education and skills. By addressing workforce development using this approach, strategies using vocational training methods are created that focus on teaching technical and trade skills. Other traditional methods of workforce development include one-on-one counseling and career pathway programs aimed at increasing post-secondary education opportunities for targeted groups.<sup>25</sup> Since the implementation of the Workforce Investment Act and workforce centers, local

---

<sup>24</sup> Mahony, C. "Models of Workforce Development". (May 2007).

<sup>25</sup> Israel, R. "[Workforce Development Program Guide](#)." Education Development Center.

municipalities have used comprehensive strategies creating partnerships and using sector based strategies.

Using sector-driven strategies, cities across the country are strengthening ties between businesses and the community by matching workforce demand with job opportunities for workers. In 2012, the Los Angeles County Workforce Investment Board (WIB) adopted a 5-year Local Area Strategic Workforce Development Plan to reshape the city's workforce system by placing a high priority on training in high-growth industry sectors. By analyzing WIB designs across the country, and devising a plan to serve more people with less money, Los Angeles County focused on offering a number of demand-driven business services.<sup>26</sup>

Although innovations in workforce development have led to sector-based approaches to serve both unemployed and employers, differences in culture continue to be a hurdle for some. Hurdles such as language, being uprooted from their native community, and separation from family and friends can have profound impacts that sector-based trainings have minimal impacts on. Organizations in the Minneapolis area such as the Neighborhood Development Center, African Development Center, and the Asian Economic Development Association provide classes spoken in multiple languages to overcome language barriers. Another major function of their success is by hiring staff that relate to clients through like ethnicities and backgrounds.

Social service and healthcare firms have experienced pressures related to cultural and linguistic diversity since the late eighties.<sup>27</sup> Realizing disparities in health and social outcomes has strengthened a resulting cultural competence movement. Metro Transit's Blue Line Extension light rail project used a health impact assessment in order to analyze

---

<sup>26</sup> National Association of Counties. "A Workforce That Works: County Innovations in Workforce Development". July 2014.

<sup>27</sup> Calzada, E., Suarez-Balcazar, Y. "Enhancing Cultural Competence in Social Service Agencies: A Promising Approach to Serving Diverse Children and Families." 2014.

impacts of the intended project from a Public Health perspective.<sup>28</sup> Utilizing the same approach there are many things that we can learn from the fields of public health and social services.

Numerous fields such as psychology, social work, and education contribute to a growing body of literature on the topic of cultural competence, yet no universal definition is accepted by all. Three key dimensions of cultural competence have been identified as cognitive, behavioral, and organizational. cognitive component is one that emphasizes critical awareness and knowledge (understanding of a specific cultural group's history, religion and historical context).<sup>29</sup> A behavioral component that emphasizes putting skills into practice and communicating effectively; and lastly, an organizational component that emphasizes contextual issues and support for culturally competent practices from an organization committed to diversity and innovation.<sup>30</sup>

Implementing appropriate programs and policies can help to foster cultural competence among individual staff and service providers. At the organizational level, cultural competence can be developed by rooted ongoing self-reflection about how culture impacts personal beliefs, values and attitudes. Awareness also involves explicit acknowledgement of potential stereotypes, biases and misconceptions. Culturally competent service providers, also advocate for the involvement of families.

Culturally competent staff and service providers, that are engaged in the process and receive organizational support, are well positioned to select and implement culturally and linguistically appropriate programs. An initial step in cultural competency is to determine whether a program is appropriate for a given group. Culturally competent

---

<sup>28</sup> Myslajek, C. "[Bottineau Transitway Health Impact Assessment Final Report](#)." Hennepin County Public Works. December 2013.

<sup>29</sup> Cardel Gertsen, M. "*Intercultural competence and expatriates*." International Journal of Human Resource Management. December 1990, Vol. 1 Issue 3, p341-362. 22p.

<sup>30</sup> Ibid.

staff who are attuned to the unique needs of a particular ethnic group may be able to readily recognize the incompatibility of existing programs and the cultural context of individuals and families.<sup>31</sup>

Culturally competent evaluations can be used to ensure that the nature of a problem or need is adequately understood and that the appropriate services are selected. To meet those standards evaluations should include six different components. First evaluations should tap into unique cultural experiences such as acculturation, racial socialization and discrimination. Second, the evaluation should use measures with established psychometric properties and measurement equivalent to the ethnic group. Third, the evaluation should use surveys or interviews in the native language of the families served. Fourth, they should consider levels of education and issues of literacy. Fifth, they should offer feedback in culturally appropriate ways, and sixth, they should use qualitative methods such as focus groups and open-ended interviews.<sup>32</sup>

Measurement of cultural competency itself is also important and facilitates accountability. Cultural competence can be measured using self-ratings of perceived competence or consumer ratings of staff competence. An example of an individual assessment tool that has been validated with data is the Cultural Competence Assessment Instrument. A variety of Cultural Competence Assessment Instruments have been developed among health care and social service providers and can easily be adapted to workforce development and local government staff.<sup>33</sup> A summary of Culturally Competent Assessment Instruments can be found on the New York State Psychiatric Institute's Center of Excellence for Cultural Competence website.

---

<sup>31</sup> Calzada, E., Suarez-Balcazar, Y. "Enhancing Cultural Competence in Social Service Agencies: A Promising Approach to Serving Diverse Children and Families". 2014.

<sup>32</sup> Ibid.

<sup>33</sup> Capitan, J. "Defining diversity: a primer and a review". Generations (GENERATIONS), Fall 2002; 26(3): 8-14. (7p)

### 3. Transit-Based Workforce Development

There are three aspects in which we viewed transit and workforce development. The first was a brief review of transit-workforce strategies in Minnesota and studies of their effects; the second is the need and basis for transit to support workforce development; and the third is national empirical data related to the possible effects of transit on workforce needs. In general, there is a high potential need for transit to support entry-level and lower-skilled jobs, but little evidence and few examples of it actually fulfilling the need. Transit focused on workforce access for suburban Minnesota communities has also had limited success. However, the Blue Line Extension is slated to be built regardless of workforce implications; Brooklyn Park may still wish to capitalize on the line for improving access to jobs, even if the investment could not be justified solely for that purpose.

#### Need and Basis

Auto ownership is very expensive — according to AAA, the average cost of owning and operating a car is \$6,700 per year even for an inexpensive compact car.<sup>34</sup> This can rival the cost of rent, especially for a two-car household. Obviously, transit is a much lower-cost alternative; even without any subsidy from the employer, a rush hour pass costs only about \$1000 a year.<sup>35</sup> Popular sources like the Atlantic<sup>36</sup> and the New York Times<sup>37</sup> argue that inadequate and inequitable transit prevents low-income citizens from gaining employment or improving income. These critiques apply well to Minneapolis-St. Paul, which has a largely suburbanized job market, especially for industrial and retail

---

<sup>34</sup> "[Your Driving Costs](#)," American Automotive Association. 2015.

<sup>35</sup> "[Go-To Cards](#)," Metro Transit. Accessed 07 December 2016.

<sup>36</sup> White, Gillian B. "[Stranded: How America's Failing Public Transportation Increases Inequality](#)," The Atlantic, 16 May 2015.

<sup>37</sup> Bouchard, Mikayla. "[Transportation Emerges as Crucial to Escaping Poverty](#)," New York Times. 07 May 2015.



jobs. Put simply: those who work for the lowest pay are most forced to use the most expensive form of transportation.

### **Transit and Workforce in Minnesota**

With regard to potential for expansion of workforce options on transit, we have the benefit of at least one local study. Fan, Guthrie, and Levinson (2010)<sup>38</sup> looked at the improvement in accessibility of jobs from the first segment of the Blue Line — the Hiawatha corridor. The scope of their analysis was specifically accessibility of jobs within 30 minutes of transit. Because the Hiawatha Line was a spine for transit and served to improve the accessibility through connection bus routes, the benefits were well beyond the Hiawatha corridor itself. Specifically relevant to Brooklyn Park, their spatial analysis found that the greatest accessibility gains were made outside of the core of Minneapolis. They found that access to low-wage jobs increased 53% in station areas and 36% in connecting areas. They also found that the largest accessibility improvements were in areas around stations in far south Minneapolis and Bloomington, rather than the areas near downtown (although their accessibility rates were higher in absolute terms). Fan, et al have updated this article in a 2016 report published by the Center for Transportation Studies (but not a peer-reviewed journal).<sup>39</sup> This analysis looked at the planned expansions specifically, and anticipated slight improvement in accessibility to job vacancies in southern Brooklyn Park. Although improvement is anticipated, the number of job vacancies accessible by 45 minutes of transit is still vastly lower than most of Minneapolis and first-ring suburbs.

---

<sup>38</sup> Fan, Yingling, Andrew Guthrie, and David Levinson. "Impact of light rail implementation on labor market accessibility: A transportation equity perspective." *Journal of Transport and Land Use*: 5.3 (2012), pp. 28-39.

<sup>39</sup> Fan, Yingling, Andrew Guthrie, and Kirdi Vardhan Das. "[Spatial and Skills Mismatch of Unemployment and Job Vacancies](#)." *Center for Transportation Studies*, 2016.

Although Twin Cities transit improvements improve job accessibility, the examples tried have not proved effective at connecting real workers to real jobs — and certainly haven't justified their cost. Minnesota Valley Transit Authority attempted a suburb-to-suburb express bus route earlier this year; however, it failed after only a few months and was quickly scrapped. One driver reported picking up only nine riders in three weeks.<sup>40</sup> However, Minnesota Valley Transit Authority is using leftover funding to create a new line to serve Amazon's Shakopee warehouse from the Mall of America. Aaron Isaacs, a retired transit planner for Metro Transit, criticized the line, noting that it would take over an hour each way for most Minneapolis residents to access Shakopee through this line.<sup>41</sup> However, this line is one of the most analogous to Brooklyn Park's goals to serve jobs connecting to the Blue Line Extension, and should be watched closely. With the LRT line making the primary connection, it may be possible to fill the final pieces with a shuttle service; however, this would likely be a financial loser and may have to be subsidized by the City or private employers.

### **Effects of Transit**

Although many sources indicate transit improves *potential* for employment, the evidence that it actually has a result of improving employment rates of low-income individuals is relatively unproven. National examinations of improved transit and its effects on low-wage workers have conclusions that are anything but hopeful. Specifically, Sanchez<sup>42</sup> looked at households received Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) recipients in six major cities. Although they did not look at before-after status of

---

<sup>40</sup> Lytton, Barry. "[Route 494 suburb-to-suburb bus line struggles out of the gate.](#)" Star Tribune, 15 February 2016.

<sup>41</sup> Issacs, Aaron. "[The Quarterly Transit Report-December 2016.](#)" Streets.mn, 15 December 2016.

<sup>42</sup> Sanchez, Thomas W, Qing Shen, and Zhong-Ren Peng. "Transit Mobility, Jobs Access and Low-income Labour Participation in US Metropolitan Areas." *Urban Studies* 51:7, 2004. pp 1313-1331

specific transit improvements, they measured whether or not the status of the household was more likely to change in light of higher access to transit. They found that there was no such correlation, but, instead, “personal and household characteristics” were more important. They also noted that TANF recipients with a car were significantly more likely to be employed.

Blumenberg and Pierce did a similar examination of Welfare to Work Voucher recipients.<sup>43</sup> They found that “access to an automobile has a significant, positive effect” on recipients gaining employment. However, they did not note any improvement among subjects who lived or moved to transit-rich neighborhoods. They speculate that benefits of transit access may be hampered by negative aspects of those neighborhoods — crime, lack of income diversity, etc. Like Sanchez, this finding centers around existing transit systems in existing neighborhoods, and does not directly consider the effects of a transit improvement.

Of course, these conclusions offer little policy guidance for Brooklyn Park: regardless of workforce alternatives, the Blue Line Extension will be built. Even if a workforce program as generous as giving a car away to a family that needs it were available, those individuals would still suffer from the ongoing cost of operating that vehicle.

### **Conclusions for Brooklyn Park**

The relevance of these studies to Brooklyn Park are not totally clear. Both the Sanchez and Blumenberg studies consider mainly transit-rich neighborhoods in central cities. In this case, many low-income neighborhoods may not be spatially isolated from

---

<sup>43</sup> Blumenberg, Evelyn and Gregory Pierce. "The Drive to Work: The Relationship between Transportation Access, Housing Assistance, and Employment among Participants in the Welfare to Work Voucher Program." *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, 2016.

transit at all — that is, there would be no change from a major transit improvement. On the other hand, Fan and Guthrie's 2016 analysis shows that much of Brooklyn Park *is* isolated from transit-accessible job vacancies. However, Fan and Guthrie's earlier work may indicate limited impacts to transit accessibility, since they found the most benefits concentrated in station areas. That may be even more dramatic in Brooklyn Park, as it has a lower level of service for connecting local transit.