

Constructing Identity in the Romantic Age: The Medical Writings of Jean-Baptiste
Antoine Bénézet Pamard (1763-1827)

A THESIS
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
OF THE UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA
BY

Joris Vandendriessche

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

Jennifer Gunn, Advisor

August, 2010

© Joris Vandendriessche 2010

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my advisor, Jennifer Gunn, for her help during the entire research period and the other members of my committee, Jole Shackelford and Susan Jones, for their support and valuable comments. My gratitude also goes to the instructors and participants of two seminars that have greatly helped shape my ideas about the research project: Sally Gregory Kohlstedt and my fellow students in the seminar on research methods and the instructors, J.B. Shank and Juliette Cherbuliez, and students of last spring's interdisciplinary writing seminar on change in time. I would also like to thank the staff of the Wangenstein Library, in particular Lois Hendrickson and Elaine Challacombe, for their help with the archival materials. Finally, I express my gratitude for the support of the Belgian American Educational Foundation, which has made this research project possible.

Abstract

This study examines the way the French surgeon Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard (1763-1827) viewed and presented himself as a learned man in the intellectual community of the early nineteenth century. It will argue that Pamard, in constructing an identity of a learned man, used both traditional and contemporary components, giving his own 'Romantic' interpretation to the eighteenth-century learned tradition. By looking at his correspondence and publications, this study will show how Pamard, a surgeon in Avignon, positioned himself as a 'local health expert', who translated his scientific expertise to a broad audience, in Avignon's urban community. Such a position gained him access to the city's learned circles in which he soon established himself by showing the literary qualities he possessed in addition to his scientific expertise. In doing so, Pamard skilfully adapted his work to fit the expectations of various audiences.

Pamard's self-image as a learned man was also 'Romantic' because of the place he gave to emotions in his professional activities. Pamard, for example, not only shared the joys and sorrows of family life with his correspondents – as was typical of eighteenth-century friendly relations between learned men – but also felt the need to deal with them more privately through reflections in his personal notebook, showing the self-awareness of the 'Romantic' generation. Moreover, his notebook, as a site of both scientific research and identity construction, shows the impact of these reflections upon his medical observations and thus demonstrates the intertwinement of self-reflection and scientific research in the Romantic period.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements	i
Abstract	ii
Table of Contents	iii
List of Abbreviations	iv
Introduction	1
1. Pamard en Bref	14
1.1. Family and Education	14
1.2. Revolution and Early Career	19
1.3. Career Building in the 1800s	26
2. Public Health and Learned Culture	34
2.1. The General Public and the Learned Community of Avignon	34
2.2. Local Expertise	37
2.3. Literary Interests	46
2.4. Framing Surgery	51
3. Family Life and Medical Practice	62
3.1. The Sources on Pamard's Family Life	62
3.2. Sharing Personal News	65
3.3. Parent and Physician	70
3.4. Reshaping Medical Expertise	78
4. Conclusion	86
Bibliography	89

List of Abbreviations

- PFA: Pamard Family Archive
- WL: Wangenstein Library (at the University of Minnesota)
- ASMPM: Annales de la Société de Médecine Pratique de Montpellier

Introduction

In a letter of thanks to Joseph-Dominique de Saint-Véran (1733-1812), a librarian-antiquarian who had sent him a few self-written poems, the French surgeon Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard (1763-1827) expressed his respect for an older mutual friend, the physician and learned man Esprit-Claude-François Calvet (1728-1810), well-known among historians since Laurence Brockliss' path-breaking study *Calvet's Web*.¹ Confirming to de Saint-Véran that he had complied with his request to give Calvet two louis, a considerable sum, and a series of de Saint-Véran's verses, Pamard added a few lines on Calvet: "few learned men ['savants'] possess as much knowledge as he does, he knows something about everything, he discusses all things, and he does so well, he has a rare characteristic for an antiquarian ['homme de cabinet'], he's both fully amiable and of fluent voice. My admiration for him verges on veneration."² Even when the high-flown language typical of late eighteenth- and early-nineteenth-century correspondence is taken into account, it is clear that Antoine Pamard knew Calvet well and had a deep-rooted respect for his intellectual qualities.

Pamard's admiration seems far from surprising since both Pamard and Calvet shared interests and had similar backgrounds. Both were physicians in the small and

¹ It seems most likely that the 'St.-Véran' Pamard corresponded with is indeed Abbé Joseph-Dominique Fabre de Saint-Véran (1733-1812), a librarian-antiquarian who frequently helped Calvet with his antiquarian interests and search for books: Laurence Brockliss, *Calvet's Web: Enlightenment and the Republic of Letters in Eighteenth-Century France* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002), 81, 84, 307-308.

² PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 26 Fructidor X (September 13, 1802) of Pamard to de Saint-Véran: " peu de savans ont autant de connaissance que lui, il a des idés sur tout, il parle de tout, et de tout il parle bien, il a jusqu'au merite rare chez un homme de cabinet, d'etre tout a fait aimable et du meilleur ton. J'ai pour lui une estime qui va jusqu'à la vénération."

exclusive medical community of Avignon, a provincial city in the south of France, and taught at the city's university. Both subscribed to the ideology of the advancement of the medical sciences, as it was being formulated in learned societies all over France. But most of all, both saw themselves as 'men of letters' ('gens de lettres') who belonged to an international community of learned men, the Republic of Letters ('republic des lettres'). It was within this context that Pamard admired Calvet, who was clearly more successful than Pamard in establishing contacts with like-minded intellectuals. As Brockliss has shown, Calvet built up a vast network of correspondents all over France, with whom he shared a varied interest in the sciences, the literary arts (like de Saint-Véran and Pamard, Calvet also wrote poetry), natural history and antiquities. Regarding those latter interests, Calvet established an impressive collection of coins, sculptures and other archaeological items. In the letter to de Saint-Véran, Pamard even worried what would happen to the collection after Calvet's death, since he never married and had no children.³

Pamard's admiration, however, should not be exaggerated. Although he respected Calvet's status and antiquarian efforts, Pamard never saw Calvet as a model for his own professional development. Pamard had a different image of the ideal learned man, which reflected the generation gap between both men. While Calvet and his fellow learned men had built their careers in the midst of Enlightenment enthusiasm, Pamard belonged to the generation that restarted intellectual life after the revolutionary turmoil of the 1790s. This generational difference resulted in a different interpretation of the learned tradition. Pamard, for example, had a different view on the social role of the ideal 'man of letters' and his attitude in life. This study examines the views of Pamard's generation

³ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 44, 127-155.

on the learned tradition by providing a case-study of the way Pamard presented himself as a learned man. By looking at the way Pamard constructed his own identity as a ‘man of letters’, it hopes to gain insight into the learned culture in the early nineteenth century.

The generational differences between Calvet and Pamard help point to the key parts of Pamard’s self-image as a learned man. Calvet, as said above, had rooted his interpretation of the ‘man of letters’ in the ideology of the Enlightenment. Brockliss, for example, describes how Calvet was haunted by an ideal of a man of letters as a disciplined ascetic ‘savant’ who – in line with the ideology of the Enlightenment – collected knowledge for the benefit of mankind. Such a ‘savant’ showed no emotions, expressed no joy or sorrow; he possessed a ‘stoical ethic’ that kept his passions in check at all times. The ideal ‘republican’ – member of the Republic of Letters – was dispassionate and detached, paid little attention to his physical needs and led a simple life, focusing rigorously on his broad intellectual and cultural interests. By organizing his life around this ideal, Calvet symbolized the ‘savant’ of the second half of the eighteenth century.⁴

Pamard, however, did not share Calvet’s emphasis on the detached and ascetic lifestyle of the learned man. For Pamard, learned men should rather be thoroughly engaged in the local community. In his view, the learned man should make his knowledge useful for the community in which he was embedded. The physician-observer (‘médecin-observateur’), a term Pamard sometimes used to stress his engagement in the medical research community, should therefore act as a local health expert and should actively contribute to local public health measures. Pamard, for example, presented

⁴ Ibid., 38-41, 104-105.

himself as such a public health expert in the letters he wrote to the local government in Avignon and in the articles on public health measures he published that reached a wider audience.⁵ In these latter texts, Pamard showed his hopes and aims to translate his medical expertise into information that was both useful for local policy makers and intelligible for non-specialist readers. His efforts in introducing smallpox vaccination in Avignon and its surroundings in the early 1800s by providing information about the scientific credibility and safety of the technique fit into this model. For Pamard, his local efforts functioned as the basis for the values and activities that were crucial in his view of the ‘man of letters’.

Pamard also did not agree with Calvet on the dispassionate character of learned men. Instead of keeping emotions in check at all times, Pamard was highly self-conscious and interested in his feelings and emotions. Pamard’s writings, for example, show his constant need for self-reflection; he tried to make sense of his emotions and talked about them in his correspondence. Pamard also kept a private notebook in which he documented his own health – unlike Calvet, Pamard worried intensely about his physical condition – and the health of his three children: Virginie, Virgile, and Paul. The notebook often takes the form of a diary – Calvet never kept one – in which Pamard reflected upon his medical theories and actions. It was a tool that allowed him to integrate personal worries, family life, and medical responsibilities. Similarly, passions, emotions, and responsibilities were key themes in his poetry and correspondence. Self-reflection through these various forms of writing therefore seemed a crucial part of Pamard’s

⁵ Calvet in contrast saw involvement in local public health activities, such as studying fever outbreaks, as ‘chores’ that distracted him from his occupations as a man of letters.

identity as a ‘man of letters’, showing a different attitude towards passions and emotions than Calvet’s generation.

Both Pamard’s reflective needs and his local engagement were thus key parts of his self-image as a learned man. In bringing these various parts together, the appellation ‘Romantic’ can be of help. Characterizing Pamard’s self-image as ‘Romantic’ seems to suit his situation well for various reasons. First, it helps point to the generational difference between men like Calvet, emblems of the Enlightenment, and the men who built their careers after the revolution in the 1800s. The latter were certainly products of the Enlightenment, but also gave a new direction to the existing learned tradition. Calling this generation ‘Romantic’ brings more cohesion to the diverse features these men shared and helps point to the changes in the early nineteenth century. Second, the ‘Romantic period’ is also associated with the development of expertise. Both literary scholars and historians of science have pointed to the first transmission of scientific knowledge to a newly emerging ‘broad audience’ in the Romantic period. As scholars such as Noah Heringman argue, broadening the formerly literary term ‘Romanticism’ to incorporate scientific historical trends allows viewing the Romantic period as a transitional phase in the process of professionalization and specialization in which new efforts were made to join and distinguish forms of cultural production, including both literary-humanistic and scientific discourses.⁶ The changing relationship between literary and scientific forms of writing in the Romantic period indeed provides an interesting perspective to study the learned tradition by looking at the ways it presented itself and the forms it used to

⁶ Noah Heringman, “Introduction: The Commerce of Literature and Natural History,” in *Romantic Science: The Literary Forms of Natural History*, ed. Noah Heringman (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003), 1-19.

communicate knowledge. In Pamard's case, such a 'Romantic' perspective helps to assess the ways, including the literary ones, in which he tried to convey his medical expertise to a broad audience.⁷

Apart from pointing to generational differences and the developments regarding expertise, the term 'Romantic' also points to the increased self-awareness of learned men in the early nineteenth century. Scholars of both 'Romantic medicine' and 'Romantic science' have pointed to the increased need to give the subjectivity of the observer a place within scientific observations. In the literature on 'Romantic medicine', this had led to emphasizing the increased place of emotions and caring in the professional ideology of the physician in the early nineteenth century. Scholars in this field have studied the poetry of Romantics such as John Keats (1795-1821) and William Wordsworth (1770-1850), together with contemporary medical textbooks, and have deduced a profile of the 'Romantic' physician in which compassion for the suffering of his patients and sensitivity and awareness of his own medical actions functioned as key components.⁸ The work of literary scholar Bernhard Kuhn helps to tie this growing self-awareness to the new forms of literary and scientific writings in the Romantic age. In his recent study, *Autobiography and Natural Science in the Age of Romanticism*, Kuhn placed the increasing 'Romantic'

⁷ The scholarship on the relationship between literature and science in the Romantic age ties into the debate on the historical emergence of the 'two cultures'. Scholars on Romanticism have warned not to view the Romantic age as a period 'before the divide', but rather as a period in which the relationship between the arts and the science displayed tensions and was constantly changing: Albert Goldbarth, "Introduction," in *The Measured Word: on Poetry and Science*, ed. Kurt Brown (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2001), IX; Bernhard Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science in the Age of Romanticism: Rousseau, Goethe, Thoreau* (Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2009), 17.

⁸ Hermione De Almeida, *Romantic Medicine and John Keats* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991); Alan Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), 34-35; The introduction to James Robert Allard, *Romanticism, Medicine, and the Poet's body* (Aldershot and Burlington: Ashgate, 2007) is also helpful to further situate the research tradition on 'Romantic' medicine.

self-awareness in scientific observations within the broader (auto) biographical turn of the early nineteenth century. As Kuhn argues, the need for self-reflection was a wider social phenomenon, but showed itself particularly in scientific observations. For Kuhn, this trend was part of the “increasing role of the subject in the perception of nature and the coming together of literary and scientific modes of representation” in the Romantic period. Following Kuhn’s characterization, Pamard’s notebook, as both a place of scientific observation and self-reflection, therefore seems typical of the Romantic age. In studying the way Pamard constructed his identity as a learned man in the early 1800s by looking at his medical writings, including his notebook, the framework of the Romantic age thus seems crucial.⁹

The Romantic perspective, however, should not obscure the more traditional aspects of Pamard’s self-image that resonated with the eighteenth-century tradition of medical research in the south of France. Indeed, Pamard, as a learned man in Avignon, built his professional identity upon older and regionally determined intellectual traditions. Avignon, located in the south of France, was only sixty miles from Montpellier, the most important medical center in the region, in which a particular tradition of medical research was developed during the eighteenth century and continued well into the nineteenth century. The medical community of Avignon, including the Pamard family, seemed to have shared the medical tradition of their Montpellier colleagues.

The work of cultural historian Elizabeth Williams on ‘Montpellier medicine’ is useful for understanding the intellectual tradition in which Pamard was embedded. In her study on the development of ‘vitalism’ in Montpellier, Williams pleads for a more

⁹ Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 1-2,12.

nuanced and complex narrative of the learned tradition during the Enlightenment, especially regarding the place of physicians. Instead of the classic image of the Enlightenment as a materialist, universalist, and radical tradition – maybe the image of the detached and dispassionate Calvet illustrates this – she presents a more complex narrative of the Enlightenment in which traditions of uniqueness and particularity, as counter movements, have a place alongside the main stream of universalist thought. The tradition of ‘Montpellier medicine’ which she broadly characterizes as ‘the science of man’ (‘la science de l’homme’) is one of those counter traditions she hopes to reveal. Williams discerns four features of this intellectual tradition: holism, belief in intimate relations between body and mind, belief in the links between intellectual, passionate and social phenomena and the well-being of the body that drove medicine in society, and the study of human ‘types’. Moreover, the belief in the social value of medicine was accompanied by an interest in local and environmental peculiarities that called for the engagement of the physician in the local community. Regarding their method of inquiry, Williams argues that Montpellier physicians worked in the tradition of the ‘philosophe’ and preferred prose over statistics, the philosophical (speculative) method over the positive method.¹⁰

Williams’ characterization of the Montpellier tradition seems to have much in common with the scholarship on the Romantic age, showing the traditional building

¹⁰ Elizabeth Ann Williams, “The French revolution: Anthropological Medicine, and the Creation of Medical Authority,” in *Re-creating Authority in Revolutionary France*, ed. Bryant T. Ragan and Elizabeth Ann Williams (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1992), 79-97; Elizabeth Ann Williams, *The Physical and the Moral: Anthropology, Physiology, and Philosophical Medicine in France, 1750-1850* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 1-9, 20-24; Elizabeth Ann Williams, *A Cultural History of Montpellier Vitalism in Enlightenment Montpellier* (Aldershot and Burlington: Ashgate, 2003).

blocks of Pamard's identity as a learned man. Her emphasis on the local engagement of physicians who were pushed into society, making their knowledge useful for the local community, resonates with the Romantic studies of scientific expertise that look at this trend from the perspective of the transmission of knowledge to a broad audience and the changing forms in which scientific knowledge was being communicated. Similarly, her work shows the deep local roots of broad philosophical thinking, including a holistic interest in the function of emotions and passions, themes that also figure prominently in Pamard's notebook. It thus seems that Pamard, in shaping his identity as a learned man in the early 1800s, could build upon strong local traditions.

By looking at the way Pamard constructed his identity as a learned man, this study therefore hopes to contribute to both Romantic studies and the research on 'Montpellier medicine'. Scrutinizing the way he presented himself and his work can tell a lot about the forms and features of scientific texts, about the place of expertise in the intellectual community, and about the role of emotions and self-awareness in scientific research, themes that are of particular interest to scholars of the Romantic period. Studying how Pamard viewed and promoted himself as a learned man also provides insights into the changing functioning of the intellectual community in the early 1800s, the interactions between learned men, the way they navigated between different audiences, the position of medicine and the public health movement in the learned community, and the place of physicians in urban life. Therefore, the study also aims to contribute to research on Montpellier medicine and the learned culture in France.

Of course, such a study of identity construction requires an extraordinary set of primary sources and a specific methodological approach. Regarding the source materials, Pamard, indeed, left extensive personal writings behind. These varied materials, almost all in Pamard's own hand, are part of the Pamard family archive, which is currently preserved in the Wangensteen Historical Library at the University of Minnesota.¹¹ The archival collection contains source materials of six generations of the family, all surgeons in Avignon, and starts in the late seventeenth century with a few documents of Pierre Pamard (1669-1729), Antoine Pamard's great grandfather, going all the way up to the early twentieth century with documents that belonged to Alfred Pamard (1837-1920), Antoine's grandson. The collection of materials specific to Antoine Pamard contains various research notes, a private medical notebook, drafts of publications and correspondence. For this study, Pamard's letters and notebook are the most important sources. His correspondence consists of approximately a thousand letters, most of them written during the first decade of the nineteenth century. The notebook, which he referred to as his 'journal of observations on myself' ('journal d'observations sur moi-même'), consists of nearly eight hundred pages of notes and reflections mostly on his own physical condition but also on the health of his children.

In approaching these sources, this study borrows the methods of cultural historians of science that allow viewing scientific writings as literary texts in which the author constructed a certain self-image. Regarding Pamard's professional correspondence such an approach seems the most obvious; Brockliss, for example, argues, "letters, it is

¹¹ There exists a descriptive catalogue of the Pamard archives put together by the rare book dealer "Jeremy Norman & Co, Inc." that is available in the Wangensteen Library.

well-known, permit the author to fashion an often fictitious persona. Put simply, they allow the presentation of a self that will win the esteem or attention of the reader”.¹² Brockliss’ argument could certainly be extended to scientific writings in general. As Bernhard Kuhn has shown, scientific observations were also places where the self was being explored and constructed. Viewing Pamard’s notebook as a literary text thus opens up perspectives for studying Pamard’s identity construction. Cultural historian Ludmilla Jordonava hints to some of these possibilities by arguing that “treating scientific writings as literary texts involves [...] asking questions about genre, about the relationship between reader and writer, about the use of linguistic devices such as metaphor, simile, and personification, about what is *not* being said”.¹³ Looking at Pamard’s writings as literary texts can thus provide much information on the values he found crucial in his view of the learned man.

Using this methodological approach, this study will argue in the following chapters that Pamard gave his own, ‘Romantic’ interpretation to the eighteenth-century learned tradition. His image as a learned man consisted of both traditional and contemporary elements, which reflected the changing circumstances of the early 1800s. Building upon existing traditions of local engagement, Pamard, for example, constructed an image of a ‘local health expert’, who ‘translated’ his scientific expertise for a broad audience. Pamard was also ‘Romantic’ because of the place he gave to emotions in his medical work. He, for example, not only shared the joys and sorrows of family life with his correspondents – as was typical of eighteenth-century friendly relations between

¹² Brockliss, *Calvet’s Web*, 104.

¹³ Ludmilla Jordonava, *Languages of Nature: Critical Essays on Science and Literature* (London: Free Association Books, 1986), 20, cited in Noah Heringman, “Introduction”, 7.

learned men – but also felt the need to deal with them more privately through reflection, showing the self-awareness of the ‘Romantic’ generation.

The first chapter of this study consists of an overview of Pamard’s career that provides both concrete biographical information and information on the broader context and circumstances in which Pamard built his career. It first discusses Pamard’s medical education and the position of the Pamard family in Avignon, paying attention to the career of his father Pierre Pamard (1728-1793), which served as a model for Antoine Pamard’s professional development. Second, the chapter shows how the revolutionary turmoil of the 1790s delayed the execution of Pamard’s career plan by closing down learned institutions all over France, including those in Avignon. Finally, it will focus on the opportunities for Pamard to develop his career in the early 1800s by discussing the public health movement, including the vaccination campaign of 1801, and the general rejuvenation of intellectual life.

The second chapter focuses more closely on the way Pamard presented himself as a learned man in the intellectual community of Avignon in the 1800s. Pamard developed an image of a locally engaged health expert who wanted to convey his knowledge – most notably of smallpox vaccination – to a broad audience, making it useful for the local community. Because of his public health efforts, Pamard became a member of various learned societies and could establish himself as a learned man in the intellectual community of Avignon. Such a position not only required scientific expertise, but also literary qualities. Both in his correspondence and by presenting his studies as ‘literary works’, Pamard showed his literary skills, and was soon accepted in the learned

community. By the middle of the first decade of the 1800s Pamard had indeed established himself as learned man.

The third chapter focuses on Pamard's family and shows the close relations between his private life and professional identity. Pamard not only shared the major events of family life with his professional correspondents, he also constructed an identity in which the responsible physician was also a caring and compassionate father. The chapter further discusses how Pamard, apart from writing about emotions to his correspondents, felt the need for more private reflection, particularly regarding his medical actions in his own home. Pamard therefore seems typical of the 'Romantic' generation, which, in dealing with personal experiences, supplemented the public sharing of the joys and sorrows of family life with new forms of self-reflection.

1. Pamard en Bref

1.1. Family and Education

Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard was born on April 11, 1763 in the town of Avignon. He was the oldest of the three children of the surgeon Pierre François Bénézet Pamard and Marie-Rose Madeleine Chauffard, the daughter of a tanner in Avignon. All of the children of the Pamard family lived their lives and developed their careers in Avignon and its surroundings, showing the strong integration of the family into the community of Avignon. As the first-born son, Antoine Pamard was destined to continue the family tradition and become a surgeon. His sister Julie Pamard also ended up in the medical sphere, as poems directed to her in the early nineteenth century suggest that she assisted her brother Antoine during surgical operations. The third child of the family, Jean-Baptiste Marie Pamard, took a different career turn and became a priest in St. Didier near Avignon.¹⁴

At the time of Antoine's birth, the Pamard family had already established a firm position in the city. Antoine's great grandfather Pierre Pamard settled in Avignon in the late seventeenth century and became a master surgeon in 1700. His son Nicolas

¹⁴ The Pamard family has received some historical attention due to the work of Alfred Pamard (1837-1920), Antoine's grandson, and Pierre Pansier, who went through the family archives on the occasion of the centenary of the Académie de Vaucluse, a learned society founded in 1801 in which Antoine Pamard participated. Their work formed the basis for the current catalogue of Pamard collection that was put together by the rare book dealer Jeremy Norman & Co, Inc. More importantly, they also published fragments of the work of Pierre François Bénézet Pamard along with their comments: Alfred Pamard and Pierre Pansier, *Un contemporain de Daviel. Les Oeuvres de Pierre-François Bénézet Pamard, Chirurgien et Oculiste 1728-1793* (Paris: Masson et C., 1900). Pansier also collected biographical information on Antoine Pamard's colleagues in the Académie: Pierre Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon à l'Académie de Vaucluse en 1801* (s.d. [ca. 1901]); Pierre Pansier, "Les Médecins de l'Académie de Vaucluse en 1801," in *Centenaire de l'Académie de Vaucluse, 1801-1901, Mémoires et comptes rendus* (Avignon: 1901), 24-67.

Dominique became dean of the College of Surgeons of Avignon and took up a position as a city official. It was, however, his son Pierre, Antoine's father, who made the name Pamard more widely known and thus definitively secured the family's position in the city. Pierre Pamard has made it to the history books as the inventor of the 'ophthalmostat', a surgical instrument that facilitated cataract operations, Pierre's specialty. His invention brought him great fame and he became a member of various medical and learned societies, including the Academy of Surgery in Paris.¹⁵ Laurence Brockliss, in a discussion of Avignon's surgeons and apothecaries, which he characterized as an "uninspiring crowd", pointed to Pierre Pamard's contribution to the surgical arts and identified him as the only one with "a national – indeed an international – reputation". Such a reputation was the result of the attention his surgical techniques received in the French medical community. Therefore, Pierre Pamard's career seems typical of the development of surgery in France during the eighteenth century, described by Jones and Brockliss as the 'rise of surgery'; his innovative work was quickly spread among the medical community, whereas in earlier times such expertise stayed limited to just a few individuals.¹⁶ During his career, Pierre Pamard also experimented with electrotherapy, but those experiments never left the stage of the manuscript, and worked on various anatomical models and drawings.¹⁷ When Pierre reached an advanced age, the

¹⁵ For more information on Pierre Pamard's place in the history of ophthalmology, see: Julius Hirschberg, *The History of Ophthalmology* (Bonn: Verlag J.P. Wayenborgh, 1986), vol. 3, 278-283. Hirschberg also briefly discusses the Pamard family in general: *Ibid.*, 328-332; On the Academy of Surgery, see: Laurence Brockliss and Colin Jones, *The Medical World of Early Modern France* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997), 578-590.

¹⁶ Brockliss and Jones, *The Medical World*, 553-555.

¹⁷ PFA, WL, 2, S-18; Pansier and Pamard, *Un contemporain de Daviel*, 403-404.

city of Avignon, respecting his career and efforts, paid him a yearly pension to secure his services starting in 1767 and elected him second consul in 1776.¹⁸

According to Brockliss, Pierre Pamard was also a member of the Republic of Letters and a close friend of Calvet. His network of correspondents certainly shows how thoroughly he was embedded in the broader community of learned men, especially on the local and regional level. Pierre Pamard not only established relations with surgeons all over France, including famous medical men such as Antoine Louis, the widely respected Parisian surgeon and the permanent secretary of the Academy of Surgery between 1764 and 1792, but also with the local establishment, including antiquarians like Calvet, politicians such as the consul Salvador (who granted him his pension), and with religious men such as cardinal Angelo Maria Durini (for whom he wrote a celebratory poem).¹⁹ By maintaining ties with these men, stressing his national reputation, and subscribing to the religious and political ideology of Avignon's upper class, Pierre Pamard was able to establish a strong social position as a respected surgeon. Such local engagement and networking was hardly unusual for medical men in the eighteenth century. The research on the Montpellier school of medicine has shown how in smaller towns such as Montpellier – and maybe even more so in Avignon – medical men often took up local administrative positions and engaged in the broader community in order to secure their place in the social hierarchy.²⁰ Pierre Pamard's efforts seem to fit this model. His career and network shows the intertwinement of reputation, local engagement, and social status

¹⁸ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 138-139. Brockliss also points to the fact that Calvet saw himself as the true inventor of the ophthalmostat since he gave Pamard the idea of fashioning a new tool.

¹⁹ Pansier and Pamard, *Un contemporain de Daviel*, 15-16, 338-340; PFA, WL, 4, S-30, "Son Excellence Monsieur Durini" (Printed poem of Pamard to Monseigneur Durini).

²⁰ Williams, *A Cultural History of Medical Vitalism*, 17-24.

in the learned culture of the eighteenth century. For Antoine Pamard, this process of career building became a model for his own professional development.

Antoine Pamard started following in his father's footsteps by studying surgery in Avignon. He became master of surgery in 1782 and was admitted to the College of Surgeons in the city. Pierre Pansier, Pamard's biographer in the early twentieth century, also noticed the peculiarity that his diploma was signed by his grandfather Nicolas Dominique, at that time still dean of the College of Surgeons, and that his father Pierre served as his first examiner.²¹ After studying in Avignon, Pamard decided to go to Paris, as his father had done in his young age, to further study surgery and gain more experience. Pamard's decision was hardly surprising, as Paris at the time already had become a medical mecca that attracted students from all over Europe. It seems likely that Pamard could have counted on his father's Parisian contacts, most notably with Antoine Louis, to help him secure a suitable place to study. Louis might have directed him to Jean Philippe Pelletan (1747-1829), another respected surgeon and member of both the Academy of Surgery and the Academy of Medicine. It is unclear when Pamard left for Paris, but at least in 1785 and 1786 he took Pelletan's anatomy and surgery classes.²² During this time, he undoubtedly established professional contacts of his own, as Parisian surgeons and physicians figured prominently among his later correspondents.

Pamard's medical education also raises the question of his position in the age-old rivalry between the medical communities of Paris and Montpellier.²³ In general, it seems

²¹ Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon*, 15.

²² PFA, WL, 15, S-52, "Lecture notes on anatomy & surgery (surgery lectures of Philippe Jean Pelletan)."

²³ See also Williams, *A Cultural History of Medical Vitalism*, 50-79. In her chapter on the university of medicine in Montpellier, she provides a less confrontational model of the relation between Paris and

possible to argue that the physicians and surgeons in Avignon, including Pamard and his father, followed the medical tradition of Montpellier medicine, with its emphasis on the social role of the physician in the local community and ‘localized’ medical knowledge, without, however, tying themselves too closely to Montpellier’s medical faculty.

Avignon’s medical men certainly subscribed to the same general ideology of the place of medicine in the local community, an ideology that, as Williams has shown, was connected to the physical circumstances and social landscape of small towns in the south of France.²⁴ In terms of the climate and the position of the medical faculty in the urban community, Avignon was indeed very similar to Montpellier. In regards to specific theories and debates, however, the physicians and surgeons of Avignon seemed to have claimed a more autonomous position. A letter of Pierre Pomme, a well-known physician in Arles and friend of Pamard’s father, to Antoine Pamard hints at the way Avignon’s medical community positioned itself in the scientific debates between Paris and Montpellier. In the letter, Pomme recounted how to his own surprise he was received well in Paris and claimed in his analysis of this positive reception that the Parisian physicians had done so to cause offense to the Montpellier faculty, who apparently had rejected Pomme’s work. In talking about the rivalry, Pomme confidently distanced himself from the two sides, indicating that he was sure this would not offend Pamard: “the real motif of such unexpected reception was the established rivalry between the faculties of Paris and Montpellier: how odd is the passion that drives the men of letters.” Earlier in the letter, Pomme had also referred to Pamard’s father’s good advice to sometimes remain silent in

Montpellier by looking at ‘innovation’ in a broader sense than just classic Enlightenment ‘scientific progress’.

²⁴ Ibid., 16-49.

debates, strengthening the view that the medical men in Avignon, at least the Pamard family, rather stayed out of the debates.²⁵

Antoine Pamard thus seemed to have taken a position in the middle between both sides. He surely corresponded frequently with Parisian physicians, not only because of the relations he established when he was studying there, but also because the vaccination movement, as will be shown further on, was organized from there. However, the content of his work, focusing on local health conditions, the fact that he usually published his papers in the journal of the medical society of Montpellier, and the contacts he established with professors at the medical faculty of that city, such as Jean-Baptiste-Timothée Baumès (1756-1828), indicate that he was also closely involved in the Montpellier research community.

1.2. Revolution and Early Career

Returning from Paris to Avignon in 1786, Pamard immediately started practicing surgery and was appointed adjunct-surgeon to his father in the hospital of Avignon. From then on, Pamard invested a considerable amount of time in his career and tried to publish papers that would gain him the respect of the French medical community. In the early 1790s, Pamard worked on a study of sutures and ligatures that would eventually win a prize – one hundred livres and a gold medal – from the Academy of Surgery in 1793.²⁶ During this time, Pamard corresponded with Antoine Louis, who had encouraged him to

²⁵ PFA, WL, 19, S-64, Letter of 25 Messidor XI (July 14, 1803) of Pierre Pomme to Antoine Pamard: “le vrai motif d’une réception aussi inattendue, c’est que la rivalité établie entre la faculté de Paris et celle de Montpellier: que cela est drôle, la passion fut toujours, le mobile des gens de lettres.”

²⁶ Pansier, *Les médecins d’Avignon*, 16-18.

send his work to the Academy. Before his prize-winning study, Pamard had sent Louis an observation of the treatment of an extraordinary fistula, which Pamard would later publish in the journal of the medical society of Montpellier.²⁷ In his response, Louis presented himself as Pamard's tutor by giving him some feedback on the treatment of fistulas and encouraged him to send in a piece for next year's competition, which Pamard did and received an award for. Louis also graciously urged Pamard to give his deepest regards to Antoine's father.²⁸

Pamard's efforts to establish contacts with the Academy of Surgery in Paris and become a member just like his father are typical of the professional development of ambitious surgeons in the French provinces. Laurence Brockliss and Colin Jones have shown in their assessment of the Academy of Surgery how the system of prizes and honorary titles secured the Academy's inflow of surgical observations from the provinces. Provincial surgeons were eager to contribute to the activities of the Academy because of the prospect of recognition from their peers and the allocation of an honorary title. Such titles were beneficial for the local practices of these surgeons as "distinctive [signs] of their supralocal status and enlightened credentials".²⁹ For Pamard, at that point a young surgeon still in the shadow of his father, such a confirmation was of crucial importance.

The revolutionary chaos of the 1790s, however, hampered Pamard's professional development. In 1792 and 1793, the government in Paris attacked the medical colleges

²⁷ Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard, "Observation sur une tumeur singulière de la mâchoire inférieure," *ASMPM* 10(1807): 416-419.

²⁸ PFA, WL, 19, S-64, Letter of June 25, 1791 of Antoine Louis to Pamard.

²⁹ Brockliss and Jones, *The Medical World*, 584-585.

and faculties in an effort to dismantle the corporate structures of the Ancien Régime in the name of professional freedom. The old titles of master surgeon and physician were replaced by the title of *officier de santé*, which anybody could acquire by paying the necessary tax. Medical education in the various faculties all over France was disrupted and it seems that the faculty in Avignon also had to stop their medical teachings. In the following years, many plans for the reform of medical education were composed and abandoned, showing the dissension within the medical profession on the reform question. In the early nineteenth century, a final plan organized medical education around two titles: doctor of medicine and surgery and *officier de santé*, the latter receiving a more practical training.³⁰ Pamard, however, used the term *officier de santé* loosely and often maintained distinctions between physicians and surgeons. His correspondence shows the lack of clarity regarding medical titles during the early nineteenth century.³¹

The revolutionary movement also went on the offensive regarding the professional societies of the old regime and dissolved the Medical Society of Paris and the Academy of Surgery. For Pamard's early career efforts, this had immediate consequences. In the midst of the efforts of the Academy of Surgery to keep up its activities, Pamard's prize was overlooked. Shortly after being promised that the medal would be sent, Louis died and his successor was unable to make the necessary arrangements before the Academy was dissolved.³² Similarly in Avignon, the political instability of the revolutionary period complicated the functioning of the medical

³⁰ Matthew Ramsey, *Professional and Popular Medicine in France, 1770-1830. The Social World of Medical Practice* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 74-80.

³¹ Pamard for example indicates his fellow vaccinators as *officiers de santé* in his correspondence.

³² PFA, WL, 19, S-64, Letters of March 29 and April 18 1793 of Pierre Suë to Antoine Pamard.

community. Avignon, until then a papal enclave, was annexed during the revolutionary period and suffered from the political turmoil. Several members of the medical establishment, most notably Calvet, were perceived as supporting the 'status quo' and came under pressure. Calvet, for example, had to keep a low profile and had to leave Avignon several times.³³ Another colleague of Pamard, Ignace-Vincent Voulonne (1738-1807) had to flee the city to escape the patriotic party. The Pamard family seemed to have survived the revolutionary period more easily, as only one incident is known, involving Antoine's father Pierre. In August 1792, he seemed to have been publicly insulted by patriots. Antoine purportedly interfered claiming that the steel in his father's hands has only been used for good things.³⁴

Apart from this anecdote, it is also clear from Antoine Pamard's other publications and his correspondence that he showed little sympathy for the revolutionary cause. In a letter to Pierre Pomme, Pamard said he had congratulated his son, who stayed in Pamard's home in Avignon for a while, for having escaped the revolutionary terror ('tourmente revolutionnaire').³⁵ In Pamard's view, the revolution was the cause of many things in the city of Avignon that were going wrong. He discussed the current state of the town in one of his studies and could only conclude that revolutionary vandalism and the effects of the anarchist movements had left their marks on Avignon. He also pleaded for a re-opening of the hospital run by the nurses that was closed during the revolution. He

³³ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 32-33.

³⁴ Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon*, 5, 15-16.

³⁵ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Floréal XI (April 23 1803) of Pierre Pomme to Antoine Pamard.

even concluded the section on the history of Avignon in his study with the statement that he hoped the Catholic religion could now provide stability and end the turbulent times.³⁶

Pamard's assessment of the revolutionary movement is understandable given the difficult circumstances it created for positioning himself in the French medical community. Not only was he a young and relatively inexperienced surgeon, he also lost the patronage of his father, who died in 1793, shortly after the proclaimed incident with the patriots. In the following months, Pamard wrote a eulogy of his father and tried to get the work presented at the Academy of Surgery in Paris. However, by the time the eulogy was scheduled, the Academy had already been dissolved. His father not only was denied the honor of being remembered by the profession, but it also meant that Antoine was not given the chance to promote himself as the next generation of the Pamard family. It would take until the middle of the 1800s for Antoine to get his eulogy presented in Paris.³⁷

On the local level, the corporate structure of the medical community in Avignon remained sufficiently stable and functioned as a safety net for Pamard in these difficult times. The day after his father's death, he was appointed the new head of surgery of the hospital, the position his father had occupied for many years. The appointment shows the importance of family connections and patronage in the exclusive community of surgeons in Avignon. Around the time of Pierre Pamard's death, the city only counted 12

³⁶ PFA, WL, 17, S-56, "Secretarial copy of Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard, *Topographie Physique et Médical d'Avignon et de son territoire accompagnée de quelques réflexions politiques et économiques à mesure que le sujet les fournira* (Avignon: 1802)," folios 1 and 17.

³⁷ PFA, WL, 19, S-64, Letters of April 21 and May 28 1792 of Antoine Louis to Antoine Pamard, Letters of March 29, April 18, April 19, and May 9 1793 of Pierre Suë to Antoine Pamard; Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon*, 14-20.

physicians and 17 surgeons for a population of roughly 25,000 people. The number of medical men was deliberately kept small and newcomers were carefully chosen.³⁸

Pamard's succession of his father in the hospital must have been decided long before the appointment. The professorships at the university of Avignon were similarly distributed among the members of the community. Pamard, for example, taught the course 'médecine pratique' for a number of years immediately after his studies, at least until the faculty had to stop its activities. When the lessons were resumed in the early nineteenth century, he started lecturing in anatomy, another of his father's specialties.³⁹ Despite the revolutionary turmoil, Antoine Pamard, as a member of the Pamard family, was thus clearly accepted in the medical community of Avignon.

Pamard's activities in the hospital and at the university of Avignon were supplemented by a thriving private practice. Like his father, Antoine Pamard specialized in cataract operations and his correspondence indicates that he traveled widely to treat patients for this condition. In one of his letters, Pamard, for example, asked his patient to provide horses to travel from Montpellier to Florensac where the patient lived. The letter not only shows the logistical difficulties that came along with his trips to perform surgery, but also the extensiveness of Pamard's working space; Florensac was about hundred and twenty miles from Avignon.⁴⁰ Such travels also indicate Pamard's status as a widely known specialist and show the importance of professional contacts with colleagues. Most of Pamard's eye operations were indeed the result of patients being

³⁸ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 126-129.

³⁹ PFA, WL, 15, S-51, "Lecture notes 'course de médecine pratique'"; PFA, WL, S-53, "Draft of opening lecture of anatomy course."

⁴⁰ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Besombe St. Victor.

referred to him. Maintaining and expanding his professional network was therefore of crucial importance for Pamard's practice. Of course, Pamard got a head start compared to other surgeons since he was able to build upon his father's professional network. In the eulogy of his father, Pamard mentioned how he used to accompany his father on his trips and assist him during surgery.⁴¹ This way, Pamard not only learned the subtleties and technical difficulties of eye surgery, but also became known as the next generation of the surgical family. Moreover, such a specialist status also secured his financial position. As specialists like Pamard were scarce and the patients he treated were often relatively wealthy, such as the duke of Mostagny, it seems likely that his practice was lucrative.⁴² Some letters indicate that Pamard possessed substantial financial funds in Paris and tried to invest some of that money in real estate around Avignon. The successive generations of surgical specialists in the Pamard family thus seem to have accumulated a substantial capital.

Apart from cataract operations, Antoine Pamard also performed a variety of other medical interventions, treating stomach disturbances and general illnesses. His notebook also indicates that he was involved in certain obstetrical deliveries in Avignon. Around 1800, Pamard thus had secured a stable position as a surgeon, with institutional affiliations and a successful practice. However, compared to his father, he was relatively unknown outside of Avignon and its surroundings. The revolutionary instability had

⁴¹ Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard, "Eloge de M. Pamard. Lu à la Séance publique de l'Athénée de Vaucluse le 5 Vendémiaire an XI (September 27, 1802)," in *Un contemporain de Daviel. Les Oeuvres de Pierre-François Bénézet Pamard, Chirurgien et Oculiste 1728-1793*, ed. Alfred Pamard and Pierre Pansier (Paris: Masson et C., 1900), 399-400. Three drafts of the eulogy have also been preserved: PFA, WL, 5, S-32, "Eloge de mon père."

⁴² PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 25 Germinal X (April 11, 1802) of Pamard to de Mostagny.

largely shut down the intellectual network of medical and learned societies. It was only in the early nineteenth century, with the revival of intellectual life, that Pamard got the opportunity to further develop his career.

1.3. Career Building in the 1800s

The French vaccination campaign of 1801 gave Pamard the chance to become better known. The spread of Jenner's new technique of smallpox vaccination conquered Paris quickly and brought forth a hitherto unknown enthusiasm for the achievements of the medical sciences. Pamard seemed to have been one of the early promoters of the new preventive treatment in the south of France. He became involved through his contacts with François Colon, a Parisian doctor who was one the earliest advocates of the treatment in France. Later on Colon sent Pamard a brochure with information on the procedure that Pamard then spread in the city of Avignon. Colon had learned the technique in the summer of 1800 from the English physician William Woodville, who vaccinated Colon's eleven-month-old son. Soon the French elites gave their support to the project and a nation-wide vaccination campaign was set up, coordinated from the capital. The vaccination technique was disseminated and promoted through the administrative organization of the country, most notably the system of *prefectures*. The prefect of each administrative unit was ordered to create a local vaccination committee.⁴³

⁴³ Yves-Marie Bercé, *Le Chaudron et la Lancette: Croyances Populaires et Médecine Préventive, 1798-1830* (Paris: Presses de la Renaissance, 1984), 25-28; Ann F. La Berge, *Mission and Method: The Early Nineteenth-Century French Public Health Movement* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 101-108; Robert G. Durban, "The Introduction of the Practice of Vaccination into Napoleonic France," *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 5(1941): 635-650; For a good overview of the spread of vaccination in Europe see: Ann Jannetta, *The Vaccinators: Smallpox, Medical Knowledge, and the Opening of Japan* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2007), 25-52.

The prefect of the region of Avignon, the ‘département de Vaucluse’, indeed created such a committee and recruited among the Avignon physicians and surgeons. Pamard became one of its earliest and most active members.

In discussing the French vaccination campaign of the first decade of the nineteenth century, historian Ann La Berge has shown that the movement was carried and supported by the French elites, who were clearly represented in the vaccination committees: “these [local] committees typically included the prefect, mayor, and eminent physicians and surgeons”.⁴⁴ The local vaccination committee in the Vaucluse department seemed to confirm Laberge’s characterization since it was supported by both the medical and political establishment. Apart from Pamard, the physician Joseph-Xavier-Bénézet Guérin (1775-1850) was also included in the committee. Guérin had much in common with Pamard. Like Pamard, he was also introduced to the medical community under parental guidance and was now trying to establish a position of his own. For both men, the vaccination movement formed a unique chance for career improvement.⁴⁵

Promoting smallpox vaccination was undoubtedly a difficult and time-consuming undertaking. Not only did the general public show little interest in the preventive treatment and was even largely opposed to it, the procedure of vaccinating itself was not yet finalized. Pamard often wrote letters containing detailed directions of how the vaccination should be performed and often blamed unsuccessful results on incorrect administration rather than the vaccine itself. Moreover, it was difficult to stay up to date on the scientific research on smallpox vaccination, especially for a surgeon in Avignon,

⁴⁴ La Berge, *Mission and Method*, 102.

⁴⁵ Pansier, *Les médecins d’Avignon*, 2-3.

located relatively far from Paris, where most of the research was being published. His Parisian contacts were often of great help in obtaining new journals or studies. Sometimes bookstore owners were reluctant to send books and journal issues to new customers without any guarantees of their solvency. In such cases, Pamard was able to appeal to some of his friends in Paris, for example, to Dr. Guinet, who he might have met during his study in Paris and whose son appears to have done an apprenticeship at Pamard's practice in Avignon. Guinet, in this case, mediated between Pamard and the book dealer, assuring the latter that Pamard was solvent.⁴⁶ However, not all negotiations turned out well. When Pamard contacted the bookstore owner Moreau in November, 1801, the tone of his letter was almost hostile. Pamard had ordered the new journal *Observations impartial sur la vaccine* (Impartial Observations on Vaccination) from Moreau and had already sent him the required amount of money. In the letter, Pamard asked that Moreau send him the journal as soon as possible, but that if the journal had been canceled or were to be published later, Moreau should immediately return the money to him.⁴⁷ In other letters, Pamard also reacted furiously to a lack of information or problems of accessibility. In a letter to Leroux, another bookstore owner, Pamard reflected on the impact of irregularities and wrote to Leroux that his lack of punctuality damaged everything, "l'art, le commerce, la société" (the arts, commerce, and society).⁴⁸ Such letters reveal Pamard's frustration as a physician located in Avignon trying to contribute to the growing field of vaccination studies that was mainly being developed in the Parisian scientific community.

⁴⁶ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 30 Prairial IX (June 2, 1801) of Pamard to Guinet.

⁴⁷ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Frimaire X (November 24, 1801) of Pamard to Moreau.

⁴⁸ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 17 Fructidor IX (September 4, 1801) of Pamard to Leroux.

Pamard's insistence, however, did bring forth results. His archival records indicate that he vaccinated several hundreds of children, including his son Paul and daughter Virginie, who were both born in the early 1800s.⁴⁹ Pamard's move of drawing in his children was not exceptional; promoters of vaccination often used their children in public displays that aimed to convince the general public of the safety of the treatment.⁵⁰ His correspondence also shows that Pamard convinced many of his colleagues in neighboring cities to administer the vaccine to their patients and communicate the results of their efforts to Pamard. This way, Pamard created a relatively extensive research network around Avignon and established various new professional contacts.

At the same time, Pamard also became more involved in Avignon itself by advising the local government on issues of public health, an effort that provided him with occasions to set up relations with local politicians and intellectuals. As La Berge has shown, the nineteenth-century public health movement in France, particularly strong from the 1820s on, had its roots in a late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth-century Enlightenment ideology of public health as part of the progress of civilization that was widely supported by the political establishment. Already in the late eighteenth century, physicians were reaching an audience of policy makers with their studies of street cleaning, waste disposal, burials and living conditions.⁵¹ Pamard fit into this tradition as he too published a paper on the dangers of careless inhumations.⁵² The growing public health movement, together with the vaccination campaign of the early 1800s, therefore

⁴⁹ PFA, WL, 6, S-44, "Vaccination records."

⁵⁰ Bercé, *Le Chaudron et la Lancette*, 67-68.

⁵¹ La Berge, *Mission and Method*, 11-18.

⁵² PFA, WHL, 5, S-38, "Avis au public. Sur le danger des inhumations précipitées."

provided Pamard with the opportunities to become a local health expert in Avignon. The way by which Pamard developed and cultivated this position in the community of Avignon will be discussed more elaborately in the second chapter.

Pamard's most famous work, *The Medical and Physical Topography of Avignon* ('topographie physique et médicale d'Avignon), written shortly after his first vaccinations, also fits into the public health framework. The study, which Pamard wrote for the journal of the medical society of Marseille, but was also published separately in Avignon in 1802, discussed various aspects of the city of Avignon in relation to the diseases that troubled its inhabitants. Pamard described the organization of the city, its water supply, the winds and storms during the different seasons, and the occupations and nature of the different groups in the city. The Rhône river, for example, got much attention as both the source of economic wealth and the source of many diseases. The annual floods brought moisture to the walls of many houses creating unhealthy living conditions that caused fevers to emerge during the winter. He also discussed the urban eating and drinking habits, warning against too much consumption of coffee, and more generally the style of living in the city. The subtitle of Pamard's study, 'accompanied by some political and economical reflections', however, indicates that the topography was not an entirely medical work. Pamard made political suggestions by pleading for digging more canals to open up the region to more economic development and, as shown above, by distancing himself from earlier revolutionary policies. Even moral recommendations figured prominently in his view of a healthy lifestyle that excluded too much amusement. The medical topography of Avignon, and especially the recommendations it contained for

local politicians, certainly confirmed and increased Pamard's status as a physician engaged in the local community.⁵³

At the same time as his topography was getting wide attention, Pamard also published his eulogy of his father. In the text, Pamard gave an overview of his father's career, stressing the invention of the ophthalmostat as one of his most important achievements. The work is typical of the genre and displays the expected features of a eulogy: thorough education (in Avignon, Paris, and Montpellier), vigor and hard work, striving for the well-being of the general public, and especially dedication to the interest of the poor. Pierre Pamard's appointment in the hospital, for example, was depicted as a request from the people of Avignon: "The position of chief of surgery at the hospital became vacant: the people called him, the local government offered him the job, he accepted. He who has always been the friend of the poor gladly took on a position that gave him the means to become their father so to speak".⁵⁴ Antoine Pamard, at that moment the current chief of surgery, certainly knew that such statements also bolstered his position.

Both the eulogy and the medical topography of Avignon were widely read among the medical community in the south of France. Their good reception, together with the enthusiasm Pamard's promotional campaign of smallpox vaccination generated in the medical community, brought him associate memberships in various medical and learned societies, which were being founded or were restarting their activities after the political

⁵³ PFA, WL, 17, S-56, "Secretarial copy of Pamard, *Topographie Physique et Médical d'Avignon*."

⁵⁴ Pamard, "Eloge de mon père": "Une place de chirurgien-major à l'hôpital vint vaquer: la voix publique l'y appela: l'administration lui offrit, il l'accepta. Celui qui s'était toujours montré l'ami des malheureux se vit avec plaisir pourvu d'un emploi qui alloit lui fournir les moyens d'en devenir pour ainsi dire le père."

instability of the 1790s. The most important one seems to have been the Académie de Vaucluse, a regional learned society founded in 1801, in which Pamard played an important role because of his interests in vaccination. Pamard also became a member of the medical societies of Marseille, Montpellier, Lyon, Toulouse, and of the Institut de Gard in Nîmes, an institution similar to the Académie de Vaucluse that awarded a prize to Pamard for his medical topography of Avignon.⁵⁵ His most prestigious appointment was his title of corresponding member of the Medical Society of Paris ('Société de Médecine de Paris') which he gained because of continued efforts to promote vaccination.

After having firmly established himself in the medical network in the early years of the nineteenth century, Pamard continued his medical research and sporadically published his observations, mostly in the journal of the medical society of Montpellier. Pamard seemed most of all interested in the development and treatment of tumors, the subject of various papers in the second half of the first decade of the nineteenth century.⁵⁶ He also kept careful notes on every eye operation he performed. His notes would later form the basis for his son Paul's dissertation for the Academy of Surgery in Paris.⁵⁷ Pamard apparently remained active as a practitioner and researcher until shortly before his death; his notes with operational and meteorological observations— Pamard closely

⁵⁵ PFA, WL, 19, S-69, "Ordre de la Séance publique de l'Institut de Santé de Gard."

⁵⁶ Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard, "Observation sur une tumeur rare et singulière située sous la langue et s'étendant beaucoup au-dessus du menton avec la description du procédé et l'histoire du traitement," *ASMPM* (1805): 156; Idem, "Observation sur une tumeur singulière de la mâchoire inférieure," *ASMPM* (1807): 416-419; Idem, "Mémoire sur quelques tumeurs de la tête et notamment sur celles qui portent le nom de taupe ou de tortue," *ASMPM* 9(1808): 201-334.

⁵⁷ PFA, WL, 9, S-47, "Records of Cataract Operations"; Paul Antoine Marie Pamard, *De la cataracte et de son extraction par un procédé particulier* (Paris, 1825); Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon*, 23.

observed the weather conditions in relation to the reigning diseases – stretch until the late 1820s.⁵⁸ Pamard died in Avignon on March 16, 1827.⁵⁹

⁵⁸ PFA, WL, 15 and 16, “Météorology.”; 12 and 14, S-50, “Case Records.”

⁵⁹ Pansier, *Les médecins d'Avignon*, 21.

2. Public Health and Learned Culture

2.1. The General Public and the Learned Community of Avignon

In the first decade of the nineteenth century, Pamard's career was clearly on the right track. He introduced smallpox vaccination in his native town and its surroundings, became increasingly known in the regional and national medical community, set up relations with local politicians, and participated in the city's intellectual life. Part of the explanation of this professional success must be sought in Pamard's ability to play into to the local circumstances of the early 1800s. By positioning himself as a 'local health expert', Pamard indeed made use of the opportunities provided by the public health movement and was able to successfully present himself and his work to various audiences.

Pamard first of all succeeded in reaching an emerging 'broad audience' in Avignon. At the turn of the eighteenth century, such an audience not only consisted of the local establishment but also of the urban population at large who read local newspapers and placards. By publishing for example in the *Courrier d'Avignon* and writing open letters to the city government that were then printed and posted across the city, Pamard positioned himself in the growing public sphere of Avignon. In these texts, Pamard tried to translate his scientific expertise into 'useful knowledge' that met the expectations of both the urban community and the local politicians. Some of his readers, especially political leaders and intellectuals, might also have purchased or read his medical

topography of Avignon, which similarly was designed to communicate scientific knowledge to a non-specialist audience.

The excellent publishing conditions in Avignon, a widely known printing center at the time, contributed to such an effort. With the financial help of the town's politicians, under the leadership of Mayor Guillaume Puy (1751-1820), described by emperor Napoleon as a model-mayor ('maire-modèle'), Pamard was able to publish his studies as separate treatises. Puy, in the name of the progress of civilization, was eager to support Pamard's public health efforts by spreading his open letters on vaccination and paying for the publication of the medical topography. Puy's help shows the favorable political atmosphere in which Pamard could position himself publicly as a local health expert.⁶⁰

Apart from establishing himself on the 'public scene', Pamard's public health activities also strengthened his position in the more exclusive learned community of Avignon. Because Pamard built his image as a public health expert upon existing learned traditions of engagement in the local community and 'localized knowledge', positioning himself in the tradition of Montpellier medicine, as will be shown further on, such a position fit easily into his image of a learned man. Pamard thus succeeded in presenting himself both in line with existing learned traditions and as part of the new enthusiasm of the public health movement and the vaccination campaign.

Given the state of intellectual life in the 1800s, such a blending of old and new views was a successful way to present oneself and enter the learned community. In the first decade of the nineteenth century learned institutions all over France were only just

⁶⁰ Williams, *A Cultural History of Medical Vitalism*, 30; PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 29 Germinal X (April 19, 1802) of Pamard to dr. Achard.

restarting their activities after the revolutionary turmoil of the 1790s. In Avignon too, the intellectual elite refounded the learned societies that had been abolished under Jacobin rule.⁶¹ The medical community, for example, restarted giving lectures at Avignon's university and founded a new professional organization, the medical society of Avignon.⁶² In this climate of revival of intellectual life Pamard's image as a locally engaged public health expert was highly successful.

The most important learned society of which Pamard became a member was the Académie de Vaucluse. The society had eighteenth-century roots and was refounded under the name of the Lycée de Vaucluse in 1801. However, when Napoleon created new secondary schools also using the name 'lycée', the society was renamed Athenée de Vaucluse and a few years later was finally called Académie de Vaucluse.⁶³ Laurence Brockliss has stressed the increased importance of these provincial societies for the local Republic of Letters after the revolution. While private correspondence dominated before the revolutionary period, afterwards these local societies gradually became the centers of intellectual life. As Brockliss argues, "membership of the Republic of Letters henceforth required an institutional affiliation".⁶⁴ Pamard's membership in the Académie certainly allowed him to establish relations with a variety of figures from the scientific and intellectual world, including literature professors, judges, religious men, politicians – Puy was also a member of the Académie— and medical men.

⁶¹ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 371-372.

⁶² Maxime Pazzis, *Mémoire Statistique sur le Département de Vaucluse* (Carpentras: D.G. Quenin, 1808), 215.

⁶³ *Centenaire de l'Académie de Vaucluse, 1801-1901, Mémoires et Comptes Rendus* (Avignon: François Seguin, 1901), 10-13.

⁶⁴ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 371.

For Pamard, his membership in the Académie was thus of crucial importance in establishing himself as a learned man within Avignon's intellectual community. Such a position not only required scientific expertise, but also the necessary literary skills to engage in the intellectual life according to its behavioral standards. Both in letters and through the promotion of his studies as 'literary works', Pamard showed his literary qualities to the members of the learned community. By doing so, he was accepted in the learned community of Avignon, which legitimized and celebrated his medical efforts. On such celebratory occasions, which were often part of the public sessions held by the Académie, Pamard's status as a learned man was confirmed by placing his medical activities within the shared ideological of the intellectual community. In the first decade of the 1800s – the most active period of self-fashioning in his career – Pamard had thus established himself as a 'public health expert' within the learned tradition and, as a learned man, was participating fully to the activities of Avignon's learned community.

2.2. Local Expertise

Showing his engagement in the local community was certainly a key part of Pamard's effort to establish himself as a public health expert in the community of Avignon. In the eulogy of his father, Pamard had already stressed service to the local community and gaining the respect of one's fellow citizens as important features of his father's success. Pamard himself, however, developed this idea of service to the community further, adding an advisory component to the public role he envisioned. The open letter Pamard wrote to the board members of Avignon contains most of the elements that constituted

Pamard's image of a local health expert. In the first place, the letter hopes to convince the town's politicians to support the vaccination campaign, but it also tells a great deal about Pamard's self-appointed role:

“You remember the devastation smallpox brought here alone last time; this created the desire in all of you to prevent similar perils in the future. You immediately looked for ways to accomplish this. One of those ways is the Vaccine, which has been discussed so many times in the newspapers. I have looked for a man of skill to teach me the specifics of everything that touches upon this phenomenon. I've read everything that has been written on the subject; I've corresponded with all of my colleagues in the capital and elsewhere who have used and practiced the inoculation of this unique disease & everything that I have learned has convinced me.”⁶⁵

In the description of his preparatory work, Pamard presents himself as an authority on vaccination who wants to bring his acquired knowledge to the benefit of the people of Avignon. As an educated physician, he had access to information other than newspapers and had learned the specifics from a man of skill, presumably Colon. His advice as an expert to the local government was clear: vaccination was safe and needed their support.

For Pamard, this advisory role of the physician was not a noncommittal attitude. Rather, he saw it as the duty of educated medical men to put their work to public use. Pamard's correspondence contains various letters in which he formulated this ideal image of the engaged physician. Especially letters of thanks and letters of congratulations formed occasions for Pamard to reflect on the public role of the learned physician. In a letter of thanks to Mayor Puy, for example, Pamard wrote about the desire of learned men ('gens de lettres') to be useful: “The author who sacrifices his time and his rest to perfect

⁶⁵ PFA, WL, 19, S-66, “Lettre du Citoyen Pamard”, 10 Nivose l'an IX (December 31 1800): “Vous rappeler les ravages, qu'a faits, seulement ici en dernier lieu, la petite Vérole, c'est faire naître chez vous le desir de prévenir pareils dangers à l'avenir. Déjà vous en cherchez les moyens. Ils existent dans la Vaccine, de laquelle vous avez entendu parler tant de fois dans les Journaux. J'ai cherché moi en homme de l'Art à m'instruire d'une manière plus particulière de tout ce qui rapport à ce phénomène. J'ai lu tout ce qui est déjà écrit à son sujet; j'ai correspondu avec ceux de mes Confrères de la Capitale & tout ce que j'en ai appris m'a convaincu.”

his understanding and then spread the fruit of his observations and experience is undoubtedly affected by the desire, by the need to be useful”.⁶⁶ To colleagues Pamard similarly mentioned the pleasure he received from using his experience to present useful insights (‘vues utiles’) to the local government.⁶⁷

It is within this framework that Pamard’s undertaking of the medical topography of Avignon needs to be placed. The project of the medical topography offered Pamard the chance to put his experience into broader use and cultivate his identity as a public health expert. At the time, the genre of medical topographies, rooted in the Hippocratic tradition of studying disease in relation to the environment, was gaining increased popularity in the medical profession because of new techniques in physics and chemistry, for example the development of the barometer, that allowed more accurate and quantitative measurements of the environment. The medical topography also captured the growing ambition of physicians to study of the health needs of the general public by broadening the scope of their investigations to include the climate, water supply, and even the nature of the local people in their observations. The Royal Medical Society in Paris, for example, had started such investigations in the late eighteenth century, spurred on by its permanent secretary Félix Vicq d’Azyr.⁶⁸ In the case of Pamard’s study, the initiative had come from the

⁶⁶ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 21 Germinal X (April 11, 1802) of Pamard to Puy: “L’auteur qui sacrifie son tems et son repos pour perfectionner son entendement et répandre ensuite le fruit de ses observations et de son expérience est sans doute animé de désir, du besoin d’être utile.”

⁶⁷ See for example: PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 10 Germinal X (March 31, 1802) of Pamard to Larrey.

⁶⁸ Williams, *The Physical and the Moral*, 69-70; Caroline Hannaway, “Medicine, Public Welfare and the State in Eighteenth Century France: The Société Royale de Médecine of Paris (1776-1793)” (PhD diss., Johns Hopkins University, 1976), 147-148.

medical society of Marseille, which had asked Pamard to undertake the medical topography of his native town.⁶⁹

The medical topography of Avignon, more than the vaccination movement, allowed Pamard to highlight his integration in the community of Avignon. According to Pamard, such a study could only be accomplished by an experienced practitioner, who has seen many cases of illness and has served in the community for a long time. Not any skilled physician could observe the weather, investigate the economics of Avignon, and discuss the relations of these factors to the present diseases. There was a need for a certain familiarity with the local circumstances; an expertise built up through local interactions and experiences. It was precisely this aspect of the medical topography that Pamard highlighted in a letter to Monier, a younger physician who was settling down in the small town of Apt and tried to establish a medical practice there. Monier was debating writing a medical topography himself, and Pamard gave him advice, stressing the need for hard work and experience:

“Work, observe, meditate, and don’t push yourself into public display before you have the means to do so advantageously. I’m pleased to see you have the ambition of earning the trust of your fellow citizens, but I fear you’re mistaken about the ways to obtain it. Before writing, thinking is necessary. The subject one just got to know needs to be examined for a long time and reflected upon. One must know it perfectly and although Apt is not a considerable city, I strongly doubt that you can write its topography. These types of studies are more difficult than you think; the mass of things that need to be included demand an extended and varied knowledge that can only be the fruit of study and experience. [...] I have written a topography. The journal of medicine, the French Library [Bibliothèque Française], other journals have said good things about it, thus I suggest it as a model”⁷⁰

⁶⁹ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 12 Nivôse X (January 2, 1802) of Pamard to Société de Médecine de Marseille.

⁷⁰ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 6 Fructidor X (August 24, 1802) of Pamard to Monier: “Travaillés, observés, médités et ne vous pressés pas de paraitre avant d’avoir acquis les moyens de vous montrer avec avantage. J’aime de vous voir l’ambition de mériter la confiance de vos nouveaux concitoyens, mais je

For Pamard, the prospect of a young physician moving into a new town and making his presence known by writing a topography was ridiculous. Monier did not possess the necessary medical experience or explicitly local knowledge that was needed to successfully write such a work. However, Pamard did encourage Monier to work on the project in the long run, confirming the topography as a respectful undertaking to settle into the local community and turn the knowledge gained from one's local medical practice into useful knowledge that could benefit the general public. In the latter case, the medical topography would be the result of accumulated experience, almost a 'gift' from the engaged physician to the community he was so invested in. Pamard's presentation of the medical topography thus emphasized both traditional and 'modern' aspects. On the one hand, the study built on established views of the importance of particular local circumstances in medical research and was thus in line with the tradition of Montpellier medicine. On the other hand, it was typical of the early nineteenth century in the way it translated medical expertise and knowledge into a form of information that was accessible to a broader audience. From that perspective, the broad synthetic value of the work should also be stressed.

The letter to Monier also shows how Pamard actively promoted and developed his public image as a locally engaged physician. A key part of that effort was giving greater publicity to his studies. Pamard therefore published both his medical

crains que vous ne vous trompés sur les moyens de l'obtenir. Avant d'écrire, il faut penser. Il faut avoir long tems exminés, reflechi sur le sujet que l'on vient faire connaitre, il faut enfin le connaitre soi-même parfaitement et quoique Apt ne soit pas une ville considérable, je doute fort que vous puissiez encore en faire la Topographie. Cette sortes d'ouvrages sont plus difficiles que vous ne pensés, la foule d'objets qui doivent y trouver place exige des connaissances étendues et variées qui ne peuvent guère être que le fruit de l'étude et de l'expérience. J'ai fait une topographie. Le journal de médecine, la Bibliothèque française, d'autres journaux ont bien voulu en dire du bien que je vous le propose pour modèle."

topography and the eulogy of his father as separate works he could spread among his colleagues. In the case of the topography, Pamard first tried to obtain additional copies of the printed version of the study through the medical society of Marseille, at his own cost. But as things were delayed in Marseille, he seemed to have decided to publish the study himself in his hometown.⁷¹ As said earlier, the local government of Avignon even helped with the publication costs. Given the variety of societies and colleagues Pamard sent his work to, he must have ordered at least thirty copies of both his topography and his eulogy. The proximity of publishers in Avignon and Pamard's own financial means and initiative clearly contributed to the creation of a public image of locally engaged health expert.

In distributing the copies of his works, Pamard appeared particularly skillful in adapting them, and by extension his image as a locally engaged health expert, to fit the expectations of various audiences. To Monier and other younger or less experienced physicians in the region of Avignon, Pamard stressed the accumulated experience and local knowledge needed to write the medical topography. Pamard for example sent his topography to the physicians he had come to know through the vaccination campaign who were working in smaller towns and did not participate to the medical research that was going on in the medical societies. In those cases, the topography helped him to present himself as their preceptor and as a regional leader and public health expert.⁷² To more experienced physicians in the region, for example to Baumès, professor of medicine at Montpellier, Pamard stressed the scientific aspects of the

⁷¹ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 12 Nivôse X (January 2, 1802) of Pamard to Société de Médecine de Marseille.

⁷² See for example: PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 30 Germinal X (April 20, 1802) of Pamard to Farbès.

study and the prize it had won of the Institut de Santé in Nîmes.⁷³ Among those more eminent physicians were also friends of his father with whom he had lost touch and wanted to reestablish relations. The publication of both the topography and the eulogy of his father formed excellent occasions to restart correspondence with them. In a letter to Pierre Pomme, for example, Pamard apologized for not having written earlier and argued that his topography now provided him with an opportunity to write to him.⁷⁴ Pamard similarly contacted the physician Marc-Antoine Petit, who had worked at the faculty of Montpellier and now resided in Lyon, sending him a copy of his father's eulogy and his topography.⁷⁵ Regarding the eulogy, Pamard described in another letter to Pomme the applause the work received at the public session of the Académie de Vaucluse, adding that Pomme would certainly appreciate a work that had collected public praise for his old friend's efforts.⁷⁶

When corresponding with Parisian physicians, Pamard was more modest. To the vaccination specialist Colon, he sent his work as a promotional gift to strengthen their friendship and to highlight his publishing efforts. Regarding the content, however, Pamard added that the study would probably not interest him much.⁷⁷ To the physician-academician Fourcroy, Pamard similarly downplayed the value of the

⁷³ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 29 Germinal X (April 19, 1802) of Pamard to Baumès.

⁷⁴ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Pomme.

⁷⁵ The relationship between Pamard and Petit was very fruitful: Petit introduced Pamard's studies to the Société de Médecine in Paris, which eventually led to Pamard's membership, and Pamard arranged an honorary membership for Petit in the Académie de Vaucluse. See: PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 30 Germinal X (April 20, 1802) of Pamard to Petit; Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Petit; Letter of 25 Pluviôse XI (February 14, 1803) of Pamard to Petit; 19, S-64, Letter of 24 Brumaire XI (November 4, 1802) of Petit to Pamard.

⁷⁶ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Pomme.

⁷⁷ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 29 Germinal X (April 19, 1802) of Pamard to Colon.

topography, describing the work as “a small study I have done on the local region”.⁷⁸

The contrast to the hard work, experience, and local engagement necessary for the topography in the letter to Monier could hardly be greater. To his Parisian contacts, Pamard instead stressed his leadership in the Vaucluse region as a vaccination specialist rather than his local topographical work. He often emphasized the many towns to which he had brought the benefits of the new treatment and the coordinating role he played in gathering observations. For Pamard, it was of great importance that he also received recognition for these efforts in the capital, where the vaccination movement was being coordinated. When a new report was published on the progress of the vaccination movement in the journal of the medical society of Paris in which the Vaucluse region was not mentioned, Pamard started corresponding with Jean-Baptiste Emonnot (1761-1823), author of the report.⁷⁹ Noting that his name was mentioned in Colon’s latest report, he now asked the same from Emonnot, stressing that he wanted “to be included in the ranks of the men who have served humanity well by embracing, propagating, accepting the vaccine and to be given my part in the recognition they

⁷⁸ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 9 Frimaire XI (November 30, 1802) of Pamard to Fourcroy. Fourcroy has started correspondence with Pamard after the latter had responded to a call from Chouret, the director of the Parisian Ecole de Médecine, to send in observations on bladder stones for Fourcroy’s study. Later on, Fourcroy advised Pamard on an operation he was about to perform. Through his contacts with Chouret and Fourcroy Pamard had also established relations with the Académie de Chirurgie since Chouret’s institute was responsible for the administration of the Académie. See: PFA, WHL, 19, S-64, Letters of 20 Vendémiaire VII (October 11, 1798), 25 Nivôse VII (January 14, 1799) and 4 Fructidor (August 21, 1799) of Fourcroy to Pamard; Letters of 13 Fructidor VI (August 30, 1798) and 16 Vendémiaire VII (October 7, 1798) of Chouret to Pamard. On Fourcroy: William Arthur Smeaton, *Fourcroy: Chemist and Revolutionary, 1755-1809* (Cambridge: Heffer and Sons, 1962), 147-153 (study on bladder stones); The Pamard Archive contains a number of observations on bladder stones, possibly the ones he shared with Fourcroy: PFA, WL, 6, S-43, “Records of Lithotomies.”

⁷⁹ On Emonnot see: Louis Gabriel Michaud, *Biographie universelle ancienne et moderne ou histoire, par ordre alphabétique, de la vie publique et privée de tous les hommes qui se sont fait remarquer de leurs écrits, leurs actions, leurs talents, leurs vertus or leur crimes* (Paris: 1855), vol. 12, 448.

surely deserve”.⁸⁰ In pointing to the efforts of a number of other physicians in the region, Pamard certainly did not want to take all the credit; rather, he seemed to speak as the representative of the region. Pamard also wanted Emonnot to give recognition to Puy, the mayor of Avignon, who had taken up the plan to build a vaccination hospital in the city, together with Peret, the prefect of the department of Vaucluse. It was certainly one of the strengths of Pamard that he kept good relations with the political world and tried to include them in the recognition given to local vaccination efforts. Around the same time, Pamard also sent a portrait of Woodville, “the man who gave us the benefit of vaccination in France”, to Puy, to thank him for his help.⁸¹ The correspondence between Pamard and Emonnot clearly shows how important it was for Pamard to be able to present himself as a vaccination specialist and to be known as such. Pamard eventually received the recognition he was seeking when he was made corresponding member of the medical society of Paris because of his vaccination efforts.⁸²

⁸⁰ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 6 Nivôse XI (December 27, 1802) of Pamard to Emonnot: “dans le rang des hommes qui ont si bien servi la cause de l’humanité en adoptant, propageant, prenant la vaccine et d’avoir ma part à la reconnaissance qu’ils ont si bien méritée” ; Pamard also refers to: François Colon, *Histoire de la vaccine en France* (Paris: 1801).

⁸¹ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 19 Pluviôse XI (February 8, 1803) of Pamard to Puy.

⁸² Pamard also helped Emonnot to become an associate member of the Institut de Santé et Salubrité de Gard, a learned society comparable to the Académie de Vaucluse: PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 13 Germinal XI (April 3, 1803) of Pamard to Emonnot; Letter of 7 Prairial XI (May 27, 1803) of Pamard to Emonnot.

2.3. Literary Practices

The contacts Pamard established through his vaccination efforts, for example with the mayor of Avignon, already show the potential of the vaccination movement to be incorporated into a larger social and political framework. Pamard similarly never saw his status as a vaccination expert as a narrow or exclusive public image, rather he viewed it as a part of his broader identity of a medical ‘learned man’ who dedicated himself to the advancement of the sciences. As Ann La Berge has shown, the ideology of the vaccination movement – the vaccine as an example of the benefits the medical sciences could bring to mankind – was easily incorporated in the general ideology of the progress of civilization that was cultivated by the intellectual elite.⁸³ In Avignon, Pamard’s membership as a vaccinator and surgeon to the Académie de Vaucluse illustrates this incorporation. Through his presence in the Académie, Pamard became part of the local intellectual world and became acquainted with a variety of intellectual figures, for example the professor of rhetoric Hyacinthe Morel (1756-1829), who taught poetry at the Collège d’Aix in Avignon.⁸⁴ The Académie, through the contacts it facilitated and the public sessions it held, thus provided Pamard with occasions to establish himself as a ‘learned man’.

Presenting oneself as a ‘learned man’ required more than strictly medical expertise. In the intellectual world of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century, scientific undertakings, such as Pamard’s observations on vaccination, and literary

⁸³ Laberge, *Mission and Method*, 11.

⁸⁴ *Biographie universelle et portative des contemporains ou dictionnaire historique des hommes vivants et morts depuis 1788 jusqu’à nos jours*, ed. Vieille de Boisjollin, Alphonse Rabbe, Charles Augustin Sainte-Beuve (Paris: 1836), vol. 3, 689 (“Morel, Hyacinthe”).

occupations such as the poetry by men such as Morel were coextensive. Moreover, ideal learned men ('savants') were both scientifically strong and literary skilled, or as Bernhard Kuhn argues, "were expected to be equally well versed in the physical sciences as they were in poetry".⁸⁵ It was within this intellectual tradition of the Republic of Letters that physicians such as Calvet and Pierre Pamard had positioned themselves in the second half of the eighteenth century. Both composed poems and paid careful attention to writing style. For Pamard, it was thus necessary to highlight his literary skills to establish himself as a learned man within the intellectual milieu of Avignon.

Pamard therefore presented some of his publications as literary works. The eulogy of his father along with the medical topography of Avignon definitely lent themselves to being fit into such a literary framework. Pamard sent the two works to the Academy of Sciences, Arts, and Belles-Lettres of Dijon, which had only restarted its activities a few years earlier, and to the Literary Society of Lyon, soliciting in both cases for membership. He also sent the eulogy to the publisher Defessarts in Paris, hoping to get it published in the form of an article in a literary journal.⁸⁶ In his efforts to position himself in the literary world, Pamard seemed less confident in establishing new contacts and relied heavily on his father's reputation and connections. Writing to Vallot, the secretary of the Academy of Dijon, Pamard for example mentioned his father in his plea for membership: "If you think after forming an opinion on these works that the son of your

⁸⁵ Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 1.

⁸⁶ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Defessarts.

old colleague is worthy at his turn of joining, I would be flattered”.⁸⁷ Acknowledging the lack of proper introduction (besides the reputation of his father), Pamard also stressed his faith in the functioning of the Republic of Letters in which learned men recognized and helped each other. In the case of the society in Lyon, he asked Petit, again an old friend of his father, to function as his liaison.⁸⁸ Although Pamard indeed started out hesitantly, he nevertheless succeeded in linking up with the literary network his father had been involved in, gaining the institutional affiliations that were becoming increasingly important for a man of letters.

The format of the medical topography of Avignon and the eulogy of Pierre Pamard was also suitable for showing off literary qualities. The celebratory framework, typical not only of the eulogy but also of the assessment of the efforts of local policy makers in the medical topography, provided Pamard with the opportunity to use historical quotations, demonstrating his knowledge of the local circumstances, and to capture the present enthusiasm of re-emerging intellectual community in praising prose. In describing the city, for example, Pamard eloquently used historical anecdotes, referring to medieval chronicles in Italian and to archaeological finds that were in Calvet’s possession, placing himself in the tradition of the eighteenth-century savant.⁸⁹ At the same time, however, he also sang the praises of the new local government and its hitherto unseen public health efforts and struggle against poverty. The celebratory framework of

⁸⁷ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 9 Frimaire XI (November 30, 1802) of Pamard to Vallot: “Si rassemblement votre opinion sur tous ces objets vous pensés que le fils de votre ancien collègue fut digne à son tour de vous appartenir, j’en serais flatté.”

⁸⁸ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Petit.

⁸⁹ PFA, WL, 17, S-56, “Secretarial copy of Pamard, *Topographie Physique et Médical d’Avignon*,” folios 8 and 22.

the medical topography also shows how scientific knowledge could be conveyed in a literary form, providing him with the opportunity to firmly tie his own medical efforts to the views of the local government and the intellectual community in Avignon. Pamard, for example, placed his discussion of vaccination, “which contributed in its turn to diminishing the plagues that tormented the population”, in the list of all the good things that were happening now that peace had returned after the revolution, including for example the increased rate of marriages and the foundation of new schools.⁹⁰ By using such a praising tone, Pamard thus succeeded in showing his qualities as a writer and his participation in the ideology of the new elite.

In letters, too, Pamard demonstrated his literary qualities and presented himself as a well-read man. He often used metaphorical language and included quotations to illustrate his ideas. In a letter to marquis Fortia d’Urban, at that time vice-president of the Académie de Vaucluse, he used the Latin aphorism “Te penes in te omnis domus inclinata recumbit”, “You are the pillar on which each falling house rests”. The quotation was borrowed from Vergil’s *Aeneid* and used to strengthen Pamard’s plea for Fortia d’Urban to make a lasting commitment as a patron to the Académie. When Pamard wrote his letter, Fortia d’Urban was in Paris and the young Académie was having trouble bringing together enough people to hold sessions. The quotation from the *Aeneid* was part of the flattering tone of the letter that hoped to secure Fortia d’Urban’s lasting support for the young learned society.⁹¹ Using a quotation from one of the classic authors in discussing the functioning of the Académie also dovetailed well with the course of events

⁹⁰ Ibid., folios 26 and 27.

⁹¹ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 12 Messidor X (July 1, 1802) of Pamard to Fortia d’Urban. The quotation was drawn from the twelfth book of the *Aeneid*, vers 59.

in the sessions of this learned society. From another letter to Fortia d'Urban, it is clear that during the sessions parts of the works of authors such as Xenophon were being recited. In the letter, Pamard stresses the joy a “delicate Hermes” such as Fortia d'Urban would have taken in listening to such a performance, again expressing their shared literary interests.⁹²

Pamard seemed to have been well prepared to engage in these learned literary exchanges. He kept extensive literary notes, in which he accumulated quotations from a variety of authors. They contain quotations from the Roman writers Vergil, Juvenal, Horace, Ovid, and Cicero, from the father of medicine Hippocrates, and also from eighteenth-century writers such as Voltaire. They clearly show that Pamard actively studied the classic authors and also had an impressive command of various languages. From these notes and his publications, it seems that Pamard understood French, Latin, Italian, and English, undoubtedly the result of a thorough and broad general education before the start of his medical studies.⁹³ Seen in their totality, Pamard's literary notes appear as a catalogue of ideas and quotations, which had gained his interest and therefore might use in letters and publications.⁹⁴

Pamard's literary notes also include a number of self-written poems. Just like his father, Antoine Pamard thus composed poems of his own, mostly dealing with themes that consider nature and medicine. Given the tradition in the Republic of Letters of exchanging poetry, it would be interesting to know whether Pamard participated in these

⁹² PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 3 Brumaire XI (October 25, 1802) of Pamard to Fortia d'Urban.

⁹³ Pamard for example wrote a letter in elegant English to doctor Nicholas who had visited him on his travels around the southern countries: PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 17 Pluviôse XI (February 6, 1803) of Pamard to Nicholas.

⁹⁴ PFA, WL, 18, S-61 and S-62, “Literary notes.”

exchanges, using poetry to show his appreciation for the arts. From his correspondence, however, it seems that Pamard only received poetry from correspondents, but never sent poems of his own to colleagues. Among the people that sent him verses was de Saint-Véran, who addressed poems to Pamard that described his work and must have been praising, as Pamard went to great trouble to modestly deny the qualities de Saint-Véran attributed to him.⁹⁵ The interaction with de Saint-Véran is therefore typical of the stylized process of paying tribute to one's correspondent and replying modestly and fit into the general tradition of flattering and expressing one's love for the literary arts. Both poetry and literary references were thus integral parts of these behavioral rules and standards between learned men.⁹⁶

2.4. Framing Surgery

Pamard's literary notes also direct attention to another aspect of poetry and literary interests in the tradition of the 'learned man'. Pamard did not only gather quotations and use them in correspondence and publications to cultivate his literary interests or to show off his writing skills, there was also an important ideological component to his efforts, at which the brief discussion of the medical topography as a literary work has already hinted. As various literary scholars and historians have shown, literary practices in general and poetry in particular have the ability to synthesize and integrate scientific practices with broader views of the world. In the celebratory atmosphere of the topography, for example, Pamard had been able to tie his vaccination practices to the

⁹⁵ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 26 Fructidor X (September 13, 1802) of Pamard to de Saint-Véran.

⁹⁶ On behavioral rules of learned correspondence, see also: Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 107-108.

efforts for the ‘benefit of mankind’ of the local government. Poetry and literary references, even more than celebratory prose, are capable of putting thoughts into a larger framework and can thus function as places of reflection where shared ideology could be expressed.⁹⁷ In the learned community of Avignon, poetry and belles lettres thus provided an opportunity to establish oneself within a shared ideological framework.

Looking at Pamard’s literary notes from this perspective, it seems important to highlight the creative and reflective aspects of these writings. Pamard indeed reflected upon broader ideological issues – nature, religion, medicine – by gathering aphorisms, quotations and poems. In compiling his notes, Pamard did not just copy literary verses, he altered them slightly, highlighted a few words and added comments. By doing so, he showed which parts of the quotations attracted his attention and made him include the quotation in the first place. The notes thus show a process of selection and adaption that formed crucial skills for Pamard as a ‘man of letters’. Comparing a part from the original text from Voltaire, for example, to Pamard’s version illustrates this method:

“Mandez-moi donc si le grand musicien Rameau est aussi maximus in minimis, et si, de la sublimité de sa grande musique, il descend avec succès aux grâces naïves du ballet. J’aime les gens qui savent quitter le sublime pour badiner. Je voudrais que Newton eût fait des vaudevilles ; je l’en estimerais davantage. Celui qui n’a qu’un talent peut être un grand génie; celui qui en a plusieurs est plus aimable”

(letter to M. Berger, in: *Les Œuvres Complètes de Voltaire*, XXXIII, Paris, 1877, 514)

“J’aime les gens qui savent quitter le sublime. Je voudrais que Newton eût fait des vaudevilles; Je l’en estimerais d’avantage. Maximus in Minimus. Celui qui n’a qu’un talent peut être un grand génie, celui qui

⁹⁷ Most scholars who study the relationship between science and poetry seem to agree on the ‘framing’ function of poetry. Literary scholar Miroslav Holub shows how the terminology of the sciences enriched the vocabulary of literary texts, and both Alison Hawthorne Deming and Mary Midgley point to the integrative function of poetry in the construction of world views: Miroslav Holub, “The Science of Poetry/The Poetry of Science,” in *The Measured Word*, ed. Brown, 49-50; Alison Hawthorne Deming, “Science and Poetry: A View from the Divide,” in *The Measured Word*, ed. Brown, 182; Mary Midgley, *Science and Poetry* (London and New York: Routledge, 2001), 1-10.

en a plusieurs est plus aimable.”
(Literary notes of A. Pamard)

In copying Voltaire's sentences, Pamard isolated the part of the quotation that was of interest to him and rebuilt the quotation around this main idea. Apparently, Pamard was intrigued by the idea of 'maximus in minimus', and therefore gave these words a central place and also underlined them. This process is somewhat similar to Pamard's use of quotations in letters, since Pamard in those cases similarly placed the main idea, illustrated by the quotation, in the middle of the text and underlined it. In the letter to Fortia d'Urban, he did the same thing with the quotation from Virgil.

Pamard's interest in the idea of 'maximus in minimus', of not only being successful in well thought-of disciplines but also devoting one's time to more ordinary things and being equally successful doing so, was also typical of the broader themes Pamard addressed in his notes. Pamard for example collected quotations about the differences between people, about the notions of using one's talents wisely and about the virtue of discretion, in the latter case referring to the myth of Polyphemos: "a man with great talents, but void of Discretion, is like Polyphemus in the fable, strong & blind, indeed with an irresistible force, which for want of sight is of no use to him".⁹⁸ In trying to explain Pamard's interest in the theme of discretion, it is not unlikely that he was thinking of the way he positioned himself with respect to his patients. Such an hypothesis is certainly strengthened by the work of scholars such as Hermione de Almeida who have pointed to the early nineteenth century as an important period in the development of

⁹⁸ Joseph Addison, "Nullum numen abest si sit Prudentia -Juv. Sat. x. 365. Prudence supplies the want of every good," *The Spectator* (17 Nov. 1711).

medical ethics. Of course, the Polyphemos metaphor must also have been appealing because of its references to eye sight, Pamard's surgical specialty.

The hypothesis that Pamard had indeed medical issues in mind when he wrote down the verses on 'Discretion' also fits well with a number of other quotations that deal with medical themes in Pamard's literary notes. These quotations seem to have attracted Pamard's attention precisely because of the broader framework they placed medical issues in. Several of them deal with religion and nature, for example with the idea of a 'knowable nature', which was also the subject of one of Pamard's rare self-written poems.⁹⁹ Such ideological frameworks certainly supported the medical research and efforts in which Pamard was engaging. Regarding nature and health, Pamard for example copied following poem from Edward de Monlulé:

La Nature a voulu, sans doute mère sage,
entre tous ses enfants faire un égal partage;
aux brutes n'accorder qu'un instinct limite,
mais au lieu de l'esprit leur donner la santé.

Nature made sure, undoubtedly a wise
mother,
that between all of her children there was
an equal distribution;
to the brutes she gave a limited instinct,
but instead of wisdom she gave them
health.

From the quotations Pamard included just before he copied this poem, it is clear that he read this poem in an edited medical volume, *Maladies des yeux* (Diseases of the Eye), published in 1809.¹⁰⁰ The author of the text used the poem to stress that physicians should take the features of each individual into account by referring to an idea of natural diversity. The example also shows how poetry was used in medical publications to substantiate claims and place medicine within a certain world view.

⁹⁹PFA, WL, 18, S-61, "Literary notes."

¹⁰⁰ P. Lessere, "Coup d'Oeil Générale Sur les Sensations et les Idées qui en sont la suite; conséquences qu'on peut en tirer relativement à l'éducation," in *Les Maladies des Yeux* (Paris: 1809), 82.

It is difficult to assess the extent to which Pamard wanted to use these poems and quotations in the letters he wrote to his colleagues, or in public speeches, at the time he was composing his private literary notes. Nevertheless, it is clear that there is an important public aspect to these literary practices. Not only were they part of learned correspondence, as the letter to Fortia d'Urban shows, and sometimes used in publication, such as the poem by Monlulé, but some poems were also explicitly written to be sung publicly. These often highly celebratory poems show the clear public function of poetry in placing one's occupation – in the case of Pamard, his surgical efforts – into a certain framework.

The Pamard archive contains a number of these poems, most of them written by the professor of rhetoric Hyacinthe Morel. The small notes that accompanied the poems make clear that the poems were intended for celebratory festivities for Pamard, “for Mr. Pamard, the day of his celebration,” which occurred at least in 1818 and 1827, the year of his death.¹⁰¹ The poems were most likely read or sung in the public session of the Académie de Vaucluse, in which Morel as the perpetual secretary played a prominent role in the early nineteenth century. Pamard, in the letter to Fortia d'Urban, describes such a public celebration, in this case of Viot, judge at the civil court of Avignon,¹⁰² providing us with some information on the course of events in the Académie: “we had a very interesting session [...] the applause was rising, they admired the views of our member, poems written by Morel ended the session and were given even more charm by

¹⁰¹ PFA, WL, 18, S-62, “Literary Notes.”

¹⁰² *Mémoires de l'Athénée de Vaucluse contenant le compte rendu des travaux de cette Société depuis son institution; et le Recueil des ouvrages en prose et en vers, lu à la séance publique le 2 Brumaire an xii* (Avignon: Alph. Berenguier, 1804), 12.

the mouth of Mme Louise Collière, who sung them with the elegance and taste that we're accustomed to."¹⁰³ Pamard's description shows how Morel's poems were part of a celebration of the career and views of Viot, in his capacity as member of the Académie. Such celebrations, and the poems that were sung on these occasions, were acts of public legitimization, of firmly grounding someone's career and efforts in the shared ideology of the learned society. Morel's celebratory poems to Pamard can thus provide important insights into the way he fitted into the intellectual culture of the Académie.

The following verses that form the first paragraph of a poem directed to Pamard are typical of Morel's poetry and provide a general idea of the tone and style of the genre of celebratory poetry:

Pamard est un savant; tout son art est divin	Pamard is a learned man; his entire art is divine
Mortel, qui crains la mort, reconnais sa puissance:	The mortal, who fears death, recognizes his power:
La Nature en secrêt lui découvre son sein,	Nature secretly uncovers her bosom to him,
Il sait guérir le mal, prolonger l'existence	He's able to cure disease, prolong existence

In these verses, Pamard was clearly confirmed in his status as a 'learned man' and a medical man, who investigates nature successfully to the benefit of his fellow citizens. Most of Morel's celebratory poems contain six or seven such four-verse paragraphs. Regarding the content, these poems discuss a variety of medical, intellectual and religious themes, which, although individual poems differ, seem to have been arranged by Morel following a fixed layout. In most of the poems, the first parts contained

¹⁰³ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 12 Messidor X (July 1, 1802) of Pamard to Fortia d'Urban: "nous eûmes une séance fort intéressante, [...] les applaudis se montaient, mais on admira les vues de notre associé, des complets faits par Morel terminaient la séance et reçurent un charme de plus en passant la bouche de Mme Louise Collière qui les chante avec la grace et goût que vous lui connaissez."

religious references, the middle parts vary but usually focus on Pamard's healing skills, and the final parts often consist of hopes and wishes for good health for Pamard and his family.

The most striking aspect of Morel's celebratory poetry, however, is the Christian framework in which he places Pamard's medical efforts. The following fragment, in which he compared Pamard to a saint, is an example of this:

Tout comme le saint de son nom	Just as the saint of his name
Pamard sait rendre des oracles	Pamard can provide oracles
Comme les doigts de son patron	Just as the fingers of his patron
sa main opère des miracles.	his hand creates miracles

Such a comparison was rhetorically powerful because it positioned Pamard as an intermediary between God and the natural world. Moreover, since Pamard was protected by a saint, his surgical practices could therefore be seen as 'miracles'. In other poems, Morel developed the theme of Pamard's divine patron even further and described how Pamard's saint descended from the skies to guide Pamard's actions. For Morel, member of the Congregation of the Christian Doctrine in Avignon, medicine and religion clearly went hand in hand.

Given the public recital of these poems, it seems likely that Morel's religious views were shared by the other members of the Académie and by the upper class in Avignon in general. For Pamard, it was thus important to present himself as a surgeon doing his work in harmony with religious principles. In the eulogy of his father, for example, Pamard had constructed a Christian image of the surgeon similar to that of Morel's poems, although obviously in prose. In a description of the appreciation of the

gathered crowd for his father's work, this religious framing of surgery is most obvious:

“Everyone wanted to see the man who cured the calculous, illuminated the blind, straightened the limping, who obtained of his profession in one word the wonders of religion; a concert of blessings and praises spread among all quarters.”¹⁰⁴ Pamard's description of the various surgical operations his father performed is clearly full of Christian symbolism, especially the evoked image of Pierre Pamard curing the blind and the gathered crowd cheering around him. Surgery in harmony with religion was thus a key component of Pamard's image within the learned community of Avignon.

Of course, Morel went a step further than Pamard in the eulogy by comparing him to a saint. For Morel, such a comparison functioned as a rhetorical tool for treating the theme of health more profoundly. Entire poems, for example, are presented as prayers to saint Pamard, enabling Morel to ask the listeners to pray for the health of the surgeon Pamard. The reasoning Morel presents in these prayers is almost of a mathematical kind: Pamard should enjoy the same number of days of good health as he has given to other people by curing them. Framed in this way, health appeared as something essentially temporal, and therefore also measurable. The temporality of health also reinforced the comparison of Pamard with his sacred patron since he gave countless days of health to his patients and, therefore, if all of these were added to his own lifetime he would be immortal.

In the literature on medicine and romanticism, the notion of temporality has been identified as a crucial feature of romantic culture. Bernard Kuhn, for example, discusses

¹⁰⁴ Pamard, “Eloge de M. Pamard,” 400: “Chacun vouloit voir cet homme qui guérissoit les *pierreux*, éclairoit les aveugles, redressoit les boiteux, qui obtenoit en un mot de son art les prodiges de la religion; un concert de bénédictions et de louanges se répandoit dans tous les quartiers.”

‘the temporalization of nature and the self’ as part of a process of redefining the relationship between nature and human nature.¹⁰⁵ The question, however, remains whether Morel’s poetry can be interpreted as part of this trend. It seems more likely that Morel’s motives were directed towards the effect of Pamard’s surgery on his patients. By discussing health in terms of ‘days’, Pamard’s surgical practices were transformed from a short, singular act into a form of long-term preservation. This patients’ perspective also added an almost selfish aspect to the theme of praying for Pamard’s health, since praying for his health also meant securing their own. In Morel’s poems, this was sometimes bluntly stated: “Because we would live long, make it, Great Lord!, that Pamard lives.”¹⁰⁶ Moreover, this added to the image of Pamard as an intermediary figure, distributing health in the name of God.

The theme of praying for the health of Antoine Pamard could also be extended to praying for the health of his family. Julie Pamard, Antoine’s sister and surgical assistant, for example, was often mentioned in the poems that Morel sent to Pamard. In addition, Morel also wrote poetry that was intended uniquely for her, and some of these poems suggest that she too was celebrated, separately from Antoine. Although they might be celebrated on separate occasions, that does not alter the fact that Julie and Antoine were often mentioned in relation to each other in poems intended for either of them. The following poem is typical of this interplay and of the poetry to Julie in general and had a note attached to it saying “The verses are for Mrs., the bouquet for Mr.”¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁵ KUHN, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 3-4.

¹⁰⁶ PFA, WL, S-62, “Pour que nous vivions longuement, faites, Grand Dieu! que pamard vive.”

¹⁰⁷ PFA, WL, S-62, “Les vers son pour madame, le bouquet pour mr.”

Ministre éclairé d'esculappe
 Joignant le savoir à l'esprit
 Parant les coups que la mort frappe
 Pamar console et nous guérit
 Mais quoiqu'à son expérience
 L'art doive de nombreux succès
 L'art n'en a pas moins d'impuissance
 sur ceux qu'ont blessés tes attraits

Enlightened server of asclepius
 combining knowledge and mind
 averting the blows death strikes
 Pamar comforts and heals us
 But although his experience
 entailed numerous successes of the arts
 the arts are in just as much cases powerless
 for those who have been injured by your charms

In this poem the qualities of Antoine and Julie were discussed in relation to each other.

Antoine was described as a skilful healer and embodied the art of medicine. Julie, however, was associated with powerful sentiments and emotional feelings. Her 'charmes' and tenderness are a recurring theme throughout Morel's poetry and seem always related to the risks of surgery. In a different poem, for example, Morel described how "at her breast one might find death, but the comfort of a united tenderness solidly ties me to you".¹⁰⁸ Here Morel might point to Julie's assisting role of holding the patient while Pamard operates. Morel however suggested that Julie does more, since she also comforted the patient who feared surgery. While Antoine's experience symbolized rational medicine and the hope for cure, Julie's tenderness seems to have symbolized the emotions and fears that go hand in hand with surgery.

Of course this adds a gendered perspective to Morel's poetry. Julie seemed to represent the 'caring' aspect of medicine. As Colin Jones has shown in his study of charity in revolutionary France, female care was often associated with compassion.¹⁰⁹ Although Jones mostly discussed religious sisters and orders, and, interestingly enough, Julie was also discussed as 'Saint Julie', the image of the tender and

¹⁰⁸ PFA, WL, 18, S-62, "Sur votre sein peut-être il trouvera la mort, mais la reconnaissance à la tendresse unie, m'attache à vous par des liens constans."

¹⁰⁹ Colin Jones, *The Charitable Imperative: Hospitals and Nursing in Ancien Regime and Revolutionary France* (London and New York: Routledge, 1989), 7.

compassionate surgical assistant seemed to draw upon the same set of beliefs and associations. The few preserved poems to Julie, however, do not allow a further discussion of this relationship. The collection of Morel's poems does allow the conclusion that these poems, in the setting of the public session of the Académie de Vaucluse, were important for Pamard's public image in the community of Avignon. They not only confirmed his status as skilled healer and a learned man, but also placed him and his family within a religious framework.

3. Family Life and Medical Practice

3.1. The Sources on Pamard's Family Life

The turn of the nineteenth century was not only a period of active career building for Antoine Pamard, it was also a period of intense family life. Pamard became a father several times during these years. First his daughter Virginie was born and later on his son Virgile. Both, however, lacked good health. Virginie was often ill during her early life and experienced sudden faintings; her brother Virgile died at a young age of hydrocephalus, according to Pamard. A year after Virgile's death, the family celebrated the birth of Paul, who would carry on the family tradition by becoming a surgeon. All of these moving events left their mark on family life in the Pamard home, stirring up emotions and bringing about feelings of responsibility and parenthood. At the time Pamard was finding his way and establishing himself as a surgeon in the intellectual community of Avignon, he was thus also establishing himself as a parent and family man.

The variety of sources that deal with Pamard's family life provide insights into the intertwinement between Pamard's private life and his professional efforts during this period. In his letters to colleagues and friends, for example, Pamard included general information about health and disease within his family, often presenting himself as a caring father. However, in his private notebook, which contains observations of his own health and the health of his children, Pamard not only included more elaborate reports of his children's physical condition, but also wrote differently about them, including reflections on the difficulties and uncertainties of treating one's own children. The

differences between both types of sources thus show that Pamard felt the need to incorporate family life into his professional identity on various levels: privately through personal notes and more publicly via correspondence with his colleagues.

Pamard's letters show the choices he made to include certain information about his family and exclude other aspects. These choices reflect the behavioral standards of learned correspondence and the shared ideology of the intellectual community. Sharing the joys and sorrows of family life was indeed part of the eighteenth-century intellectual tradition of learned men. As correspondence between two men evolved into a genuine friendship, exchanging personal news and important events within one's family became part of their letters.¹¹⁰ On the ideological level, establishing a family could even be considered part of successful life and career. Pamard thus picked those familial events that fitted this ideology, presenting himself as a caring father and devoted family man, and shared them with his close friends.

His private notebook served a different purpose. It shows the need Pamard felt to reflect and write privately about his own health and the health of his children. As a surgeon, he felt personally responsible for the physical condition of his children. His notebook, as will be shown further on, allowed him to monitor their health closely and provided an opportunity to write down parental thoughts. Because of that function, it was also a place of identity construction, where Pamard could present himself, for example by describing his actions, as a compassionate and responsible parent and surgeon. Although such notes were not intended for his colleagues, Pamard may have had an audience in mind when writing down his observations. Maybe he hoped his children would read the

¹¹⁰ Brockliss, *Calvet's Web*, 95-98.

notes later on. Nevertheless, the notebook was a place of self-fashioning, despite its 'private' nature, and therefore served as a tool to establish himself as both the parent and the physician of his children.

Pamard's private reflections are also insightful because they point to changes in the intellectual culture of the early nineteenth century. They show a need for self-reflection that did not exist to the same degree before. Neither his father nor Calvet, for example, kept personal notes or a diary. It rather seems that Pamard's notebook, which in its elaborate descriptions of Pamard's feelings almost takes the form of a diary, needs to be put in the context of the (auto) biographical turn of the 1800s, which has been associated with the Romantic age. Pamard was 'Romantic' in the sense that he wanted to express his emotions – not keep them in check at all times as men like Calvet did – and reflect upon his own life. His notebook can be placed among the many new forms of self-representation, such as journals, memoirs, diaries and travelogues, whose popularity increased dramatically in the early nineteenth century.¹¹¹ It was an effort to deal with a number of personal experiences, which seem to have become increasingly important. His notebook, as a place of self-reflection, helped Pamard to cope with these experiences by reshaping the way he viewed himself as a father and a physician-savant.

Pamard's family life therefore forms an interesting perspective on the way personal experiences of health and disease were handled within the learned culture of the early nineteenth century. If Pamard is taken as an example, it seems that publicly sharing the joys and sorrows of family life was increasingly supplemented by various new forms of self-reflection and self-consciousness.

¹¹¹ Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 5.

3.2. Sharing Personal News

Within the circle of Pamard's closest friends, writing about events in family life was considered a sign of genuine friendship. It showed the trust between two correspondents, the familiarity that had grown between them and the willingness to share their happiness and suffering with each other. Pamard sometimes explicitly thanked his correspondents for the trust they placed in him and expressed his interests in their familial situation. Answering a friendly letter, he wrote "your letter was highly pleasant, I have thus received with gratitude another proof of your friendship, of the interest you take in the things that concern us."¹¹² In a letter to one of his best friends, Doctor Bomans, who practiced in Martigues, Pamard confirmed their friendship by asking him for personal news and guaranteeing that he would keep writing to him about his family: "provide me with news, and be assured that I will not stop sharing all of the pleasures of family life with you."¹¹³ Typically, Pamard ended such letters with a reference to the wife of his correspondent, expressing his best wishes for her. Sometimes he drew in his own wife, who would then ask to give her best wishes to the wife of his correspondent. Such exchanges of hopes and wishes were part of the cordial and informal tone of these letters that strengthened the interest in each other's private lives that was seen as a sign of genuine friendship.

The major events of family life, such as the birth of children, were outstanding occasions to reinforce such friendly ties. Pamard, for example, wrote affectionate letters

¹¹² PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of Fructidor X (September 6, 1802) of Pamard to Labarre, "votre lettre m'a été fort agréable, j'y ai recueilli avec reconnaissance une nouvelle preuve de votre amitié, de l'intérêt que vous prenez à ce qui nous regarde."

¹¹³ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 26 Nivôse X (January 16, 1802) of Pamard to Bomans, "donnez-moi de vos nouvelles, comblez que je ne manquerai pas de partager avec vous tous mes plaisirs de famille."

about the birth of Paul to Bomans and a number of other friends, providing details about the recovery of ‘Madame Pamard’ and the joy of having a new-born child. The birth of Paul was also an occasion for Pamard to establish closer relations with some of his correspondents by generously sharing his happiness. In the latter case, Pamard open-heartedly wrote about Paul’s birth, but also stressed the exclusivity of the information. In a letter to Labarre, who had acquainted Pamard with some of the developments in his own private life in an earlier letter and seems to have practiced medicine in Nîmes, Pamard stressed that he only talked about private matters “with discretion and only to a small number of persons who we [Pamard and his wife] found fitting”.¹¹⁴ Labarre was thus taken into a smaller circle of friends who were privileged to acquire personal news of the Pamard family. The letter showed the importance of sharing personal information through correspondence in establishing friendships.

Pamard also shared misfortune with his friends and colleagues, seeking their comfort and understanding of his personal difficulties. The letter to Bomans in which Pamard told him about the death of Virgile serves as an example. Pamard started his letter by mentioning that he was on the road to Martiques to visit a patient and had asked local fishermen for news on Bomans, ordering them to pass on his best wishes to him. This anecdote functioned as the introduction to a more emotional part of the letter:

“I’m not sure if they [the fishermen] have delivered the message, I strongly doubt it and therefore I’m doing it myself. I renew sincerely and with great pleasure the prayers I make every day to preserve you, to preserve my work, which I see as one of the most precious monuments of my glory and well-being. Live for yourself, live for me, and well, and long, that’s how it should be. I wish I had the power to stop

¹¹⁴ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 19 Fructidor X (September 6, 1802) of Pamard to Labarre, “avec discernement et au petit nombres de personnes que nous croyons propres à les sentir.”

time and give you a life similar to that of your esteemed father, but if he has the pain of outliving you, he will hope for his part of serving as a monument of your glory and immortalize the memory of his past and beloved son [...] Why must I stop these pleasant thoughts which have occupied this letter so far to inform you of one of the worst things that could happen to me. [...] Virgile who made his father happy, who offered him such a wonderful future. Virgile is no more, it's already three months ago, and his father still mourns because of him when passing on this sad news to you, as if it was yesterday, never will it be consoled, it aggrieves you too, you who have known him and knew what society could expect from him [...] It's a loss for all of us, it's irreparable for his father who can only be comforted by talking about him, by sharing his heart with those of his true friends."¹¹⁵

In the letter, Pamard not just reported the death of his son; he placed the event within an ideological framework that was familiar to both of them. By addressing the themes of glory and father-son relationship early on, he set the stage for communicating the death of Virgile and the way he felt about it. Pamard wanted to stress how the death of Virgile had interrupted the 'wonderful future' he had imagined of having a son who would follow in his footsteps. By first referring to Bomans' father, who apparently was also a medical man of some reputation, he reinforced the element of family tradition and reputation. The death of his son indeed had destroyed Pamard's hopes of continuing the family tradition of 'serving society' through surgery. The fact that Pamard brought up these aspects to Bomans was not an accidental choice. Bomans apparently was in a

¹¹⁵ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 14 Nivôse X (January 4, 1802), "Je ne sais si ma commission aura été faite, j'en doute fort aussi je m'en acquitte moi-même. Je vous renouvelle bien sincèrement et avec grand plaisir les vœux que je fais tous les jours pour vous conserver, pour conserver mon ouvrage que je regarde comme un des plus précieux monuments de ma gloire et de mon bonheur. Vivez pour vous, vivez pour moi, et bien, et long tems, aussi soit-il, je voudrais qu'il fut en mon pouvoir d'arrêter le cours du tems pour vous procurer une existence égale à celle de papa éllumé, mais s'il a le douleur de vous survivre, il espère à son tour de servir de monument à votre gloire en éternisant la mémoire de son vieux enfant gâté [...] Pourquoi faut-il que je renonce aux dispositions agréables où m'avait mis jusqu'à présent cette lettre pour vous faire part d'un des plus fâcheux événement qui put m'arriver. [...] Virgile qui fésait les délices de papa, qui lui offrait un avenir si agréable. Virgile n'existe plus, il ya déjà près de trois mois, et papa le pleure necore en vous donnant cette triste nouvelle, comme si elle était de hier, jamais il ne sera consolera, vous vous affligerez aussi vous qui l'aviez connu, vous qui savez que la société avait à attendre de lui [...] C'est une perte pour tous, c'en est irréparable pour pour papa qui ne peut s'en consoler qu'en parlant de lui, qu'en épenchant son coeur dans celui de ses véritables amis."

situation similar to Pamard and would therefore understand his particular grief. Not only was he part of a medical family, Bomans was also starting a family of his own at the same time as Pamard. Another letter to him indicates that his son was born just a few weeks before Pamard's son Paul.¹¹⁶ Both also seem to have visited each other regularly; Bomans at least had met Virgile. In Bomans, Pamard had thus found someone he could share his worries with and – as he indicated himself at the end of the letter – who could assist him in the process of coping with the death of his first-born son.

The genuine comforting aspect of letters such as the one to Bomans, however, must not obscure that these personal letters were also occasions for self-fashioning. They were places where Pamard could present himself as the parent he wished and claimed to be. In the letter to Bomans, for example, Pamard depicted himself as a sensitive parent by mentioning that he was still mourning when he was writing the letter and thus showing how deeply Virgile's death had affected him. Such sensitivity was part of the general image of the proud and caring father that Pamard claimed to be. For Pamard, sensitivity was one of the most important qualities of a good father. In the eulogy of his own father, Pamard therefore stressed precisely this aspect, writing full of praise about his father's parental qualities:

“His eulogy would not be complete, if I did not stop for a moment at his domestic virtues. Tender father and without blind predilection, he had for all of his children an equal solicitude. His generosity towards them would have been uncountable, if he had not had the delicacy to limit it. A loving and respectful son, because he was a sensitive father, he showed his father the obedience and courteous respect of a son for 50 years. His feelings for him were as lively as delicate.”¹¹⁷

¹¹⁶ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 5 Fructidor X (August 23, 1802) of Pamard to Bomans.

¹¹⁷ Pamard, “Eloge de M. Pamard,” 407-408, “Son éloge demeurerait incomplet, si je ne m'arrêtois quelques instants sur ses vertus domestiques. Père tendre et sans aveugle prédilection, il avoit pour tous ses enfants une égale sollicitude. Sa générosité envers eux eût été un véritable dévouement, s'ils n'avoient

The passage not only presented Pierre Pamard as a sensitive father, it also highlighted the special father-son relationship in the Pamard family. The message Antoine sought to convey was that Pierre Pamard respected his father Dominique just like Antoine respected Pierre Pamard. In the accompanying letters to the people he sent the eulogy, Pamard stressed the great respect he had for his father, who had gently guided him through life.¹¹⁸ This way, the image of the sensitive and caring father and the respectful son became part of the way Antoine Pamard presented the tradition of the Pamard family to his colleagues.

The fact that Pamard included this parental side in his eulogy also shows how easily the image of the caring father was incorporated in the professional image of the physician-savant. In general, establishing a family was of course seen as part of leading a happy and successful life. Pamard's advice in a letter to Monier, who was setting up a medical practice in Apt, illustrates this. After providing Monier with some professional recommendations regarding keeping good relations with his patients, Pamard also wished him happiness with his wife and expressed the hope that she would give him a child, adding "nothing is missing except that to be totally set."¹¹⁹ On a deeper ideological level, however, parenthood, and especially the image of the caring father, was tied to the profile of the successful medical man. Being a tender and

pas eu la délicatesse d'y mettre des bornes. Fils aimant et respectueux, parce qu'il était père sensible, il avoit à 50 ans pour le sien la soumission, la déférence d'un enfant. Ses sentiments pour lui étoient aussi délicats que vifs."

¹¹⁸ In those letters, Pamard would also stress that he could say many more loving things about his father that were not included in the eulogy in an effort to give more credibility to a eulogy written by the son of the deceased.

¹¹⁹ PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 6 Fructidor X (August 24, 1802) of Pamard to Monier, "il ne vous manque plus que cela pour être tout-à-fait couverte."

caring father was highly compatible with being a good physician because it reinforced the ability of the physician to show compassion, which was increasingly becoming the cornerstone of patient-doctor relationships in the early nineteenth century. According to literary scholar Hermione de Almeida, the ideal physician of that time showed “a sensibility that fosters both a concern for the suffering of others and an increased sense of self-awareness.”¹²⁰ In the eulogy also, the discussion of Pierre Pamard’s parental qualities fit into such a broader discourse of alleviating suffering and being gentle towards patients. The ‘caring and sensitive father’ could indeed easily be incorporated in the professional ideology of the medical profession.

3.3. Parent and Physician

Pamard’s private notebook provides a different account of the close relations between family life and medical practice. It bears witness to the tension between his parental and medical roles on the practical level. When performing medical practices in his own home, Pamard’s emotions as a father sometimes hampered his medical observations and therapeutic actions. In the sections of Pamard’s notebook that deal with his children, Pamard’s observations of their health conditions were mixed with the parental emotions and uncertainties that came with seeing his children ill. Such notes included both rigorous observations – with almost anatomical descriptions of lesions and skin conditions and detailed lists of the food his children ate – and emotional accounts of despair and speculation on the causes of their diseases. In his notes, Pamard thus placed his parental worries in a framework of medical observations.

¹²⁰ De Almeida, *Romantic Medicine and John Keats*, 34-38.

The connection between personal and scientific elements in Pamard's notebook makes the document typical of the Romantic age. Its combination of 'scientific' observations that reflect Pamard's ambitious engagement with the medical sciences as he tried to figure out the etiology of the diseases his children encountered, and personal reflections that turn the document almost into a diary that tried to cope with the emotional aspects of illness in Pamard's home, show the loosely drawn boundaries between the arts and the sciences during the Romantic period. For literary scholar Bernhard Kuhn, who recently published his study *Autobiography and Natural Science in the Age of Romanticism*, such personal reflections were fundamentally tied to scientific observations. Observing the natural world, Kuhn argues, was always connected to exploring the self. Kuhn therefore places scientific observations among the various forms of 'life narratives' that gained increasing popularity in the early nineteenth century. The latter perspective allows viewing these scientific texts as literary practices that functioned as tools for self-reflection and identity construction.¹²¹

If Pamard's notebook is placed within such a framework, it becomes more than just a testimony of the tension between his parental and medical roles. As a place of self-reflection, it was a tool for Pamard to deal with these difficulties and reconcile both roles. Over the course of a series of illnesses experienced by his children, Pamard's notebook shows how he gradually found a way to establish himself as both a caring father and a responsible physician. His notes were thus places where Pamard could cultivate both by carefully writing down detailed observations of his children and reflecting upon his therapeutic actions.

¹²¹ Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 4-5.

The death of Pamard's son Virgile was the starting point of a series of observations of his children's illnesses in his notebook. Similar to the letters Pamard wrote to his friends about the event, the entry on Virgile's death in the notebook was highly emotional and shows how the event had stirred up emotions in the Pamard family. Written the day after the death of his son, the entry, however, also shows the more personal and direct character of the personal reflections in his notebook. Unlike the letter to Bomans, Pamard's notebook entry combined personal reflections with the listing of facts, showing how Pamard's emotions were incorporated in a framework of medical observations:

“Horrible misfortune, excruciating pain, death of Virgile. This ill-fated and beautiful child had been somewhat restless the previous day, even more in the morning of this day, however, he didn't appear to me to be in any danger, he was feeling bad towards noon, his restlessness grew, he wanted to be put to bed after we had undressed him, at 2:30 new convulsions took hold of him and never left him until the moment of agony, my poor child that I adored and that was the object of my hopes for stimulating his talents, perished in my arms around 6”¹²²

In the entry, Pamard also wrote down that he had not anticipated the disease. His description shows the despair of a parent who sees his child dying without being able to stop it. Soon this despair turned into guilt as Pamard started feeling personally responsible for the death of his son. Pamard believed he could have saved Virgile if he had understood the disease earlier and had used the right therapy: “I should have purged

¹²² PFA, WL, 15, S-54, “Journal d'observations sur moi-même,” Folio 2, Entry for 13 Vendémiaire X (October 5, 1801): “Malheur affreux, douleur épouvantable, mort de Virgile. Ce malheureux et bel enfant avait été un peu inquiet la veille, il le fut d'avantage le matin de ce jour là, il me paraissait pourtant pas être dans aucun danger, il se trouva un peu mal vers la midy, l'inquiétude augmenta, il voulu qu'en le couchat après l'avoir déshabillé, à 2 heures et ½ des nouveaux convulsifs les prirent et ne le quitterent qu'au moment de l'agonie, mon pauvre petit que j'idolatrais, qui était l'object unique des mes espérances à qui je devais ambition émulation talents perit entre mes bras vers les 6 heures.”

him, oh God! I should have saved him and I lost him”.¹²³ For Pamard it was clear that Virgile had died from an illness concentrated in the bowels. He had compared Virgile’s case with similar cases and concluded that Virgile showed all of the characteristic signs. The only conclusion Pamard could draw was that he had failed to see the signs and that he was therefore responsible for Virgile’s death.

Although Pamard’s feelings of guilt never fully disappeared from his notebook, they were eased to a certain extent after a conversation with Vaulier, who probably practiced as a physician in Avignon. Pamard’s notebook suggests that Vaulier questioned Pamard’ diagnosis and suggested hydrocephalus as the cause of Virgile’s death to Pamard. According to Vaulier, the illness, ‘le mal’, was located in the brain and it was the brain that had caused the convulsions and the subsequent death. One of the signs of this condition was that the patient looked serious and showed almost no joyful feelings. Pamard then agreed with Vaulier: Virgile had displayed ‘l’air sérieux’ and Vaulier’s diagnosis therefore matched the signs better than his own. Accepting this brought some relief to Pamard. He no longer held himself personally responsible for Virgile’s death to the same extent since these signs came extraordinary late: “It [the condition] was irreparable when it showed itself.” At least Pamard now accepted, as Vaulier suggested, that he couldn’t have stopped the disease in its final stage.¹²⁴

Vaulier’s suggestions, however, seemed to have done more than merely support Pamard emotionally. The thought process they triggered helped Pamard to reposition

¹²³ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 3, Entry for 3 Brumaire X (October 25 1801): “Il eut fallu purger, oh Dieu! Il eut fallu le sauver et je l’ai perdu.”

¹²⁴ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 3, Entry for 5 Brumaire l’an X (October 7 1801): “Il fut irréparable quand il se manifesta.”

himself as a physician within his own family. Vaulier's focus on the mind and the study of its signs by looking at behavior and emotions forced Pamard to re-evaluate his own observations. When he encountered a similar case to that of Virgile a few months later, his guilt regarding Virgile's death came up once again and he again believed he could have saved his son if he had seen the signs. This time, however, he added that his position as both father and physician was part of the problem. In his notebook, Pamard wrote: "my tenderness had blinded me", and later on he addressed a passage to Virgile: "Papa still mourns because of you and is still affected by a loss that maybe had not taken place if you would have been the child of another."¹²⁵ Pamard no longer doubted his own capabilities to diagnose and treat the illness; he had done so successfully for other children. The problem was that his position as a parent made him interpret signs differently or even ignore some of them. This insight, together with the speed at which the disease had hit Virgile, led Pamard to start writing down detailed observations of the behavior of his other children.

The process of observing the actions and emotions of his children and carefully writing them down in his notebook allowed Pamard to turn his close relationship with his children into an advantage. Rather than 'blinding' him, his position as father allowed him to monitor the health of his children more closely. At the same time, the written record made his observations more authoritative. Especially during the months after the birth of

¹²⁵ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 4, 25 Brumaire l'an XI (16 November 1802): "Mais la tendresse m'aveuglait"; folio 5, 18 Nivôse l'an XI (8 January 1803): "Papa te pleure encore et s'afligera long tems d'une perte qui n'eut peut-être pas eu lieu si tu avais été l'enfant d'un autre"; The place of 'tenderness' in medical debates is further complicated by the emphasis contemporary physicians have placed on an 'atmosphere of tenderness surrounding the newborn child': Marie-France Morel, "City and Country in Eighteenth-Century Medical Discussions about Early Childhood," in *Medicine and Society in France* (Selections from the *Annales. Economies, Sociétés, Civilisations*: 6), ed. Robert Forster and Orest A. Ranum (Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980), 52.

Paul, on the twenty-sixth of August in 1802¹²⁶, Pamard started experimenting with writing such observations in his notebook. At first he wrote them in between observations of his own health. Gradually, however, he started to write ‘Paul’ in the margins of the notebook when he wrote about his youngest son. Regarding the health of his daughter Virginie, he even kept a completely separate and parallel medical diary for a short period of time. For Pamard, including these observations in his notebook functioned as a strategy to successfully combine his role as both parent and physician.

The observations of the behavior of his children therefore helped Pamard construct his own identity. They made it possible to channel and cultivate his emotions as a parent within a framework of medical observations. On the eighteenth of March 1804 he for example wrote: “Paul starts to take a few steps without holding the walls or the furniture.”¹²⁷ Similarly, he wrote proudly of his daughter taking in medicine without moaning: “she took in the little medicine as a reasonable woman.”¹²⁸ Parental emotions also seeped through into his observations in a more subtle way. Pamard for example “saw with intense regret” that a rash had not faded or that a swelling persisted and thus “presented a sad aspect that was painful to consider.”¹²⁹ By writing down these observations in this way, Pamard was able to reconcile the caring role of the parent with the observational responsibilities of the physician and thus constructed a self-image that combined both. Although he suffered from seeing his children ill, Pamard nevertheless

¹²⁶ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 7, Entry for 4 Fructidor l’an XI (26 August 1802).

¹²⁷ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 11, Entry for 28 Ventôse XII (19 March 1804): “Paul commença à faire quelques pas sans se tenir aux murs, ni aux meubles.”

¹²⁸ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 19, Entry for 3 Germinal XIV (29 March 1806): “Elle prit cette petite médecine comme une femme raisonnable.”

¹²⁹ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 5, Entry for July 19, 1807: “je vis avec un vif regret”; 20 July 1807: ‘présentait un aspect triste et pénible à considérer.’

took up his responsibility as a physician to analyze their medical condition thoroughly: some things were “painful to consider,” but Pamard nonetheless did so.

Even more than his short and factual medical observations, Pamard’s lengthy descriptions of his actions during the start of an illness and his therapeutic practices afterwards show the self-fashioning function of his notebook. Some of these descriptions took up several pages and almost took the form of full ‘reports’ of Pamard’s deeds. Because of the descriptive component, these ‘reports’ formed excellent opportunities for Pamard to emphasize the aspects of his actions that he found important and thus to further develop his self-image of a caring father and responsible physician. Pamard, for example, stressed his fast and responsible behavior in a long descriptive entry on Virginie’s illness during a family trip. In the entry, Pamard described that he had noted that something was wrong with his daughter when the family went for a drive in their coach in the countryside of Avignon. He then goes on to say that he immediately made the coach return to their house in the city. Back home he laid Virginie on the bed and gave her some hot tea. At the end of the entry, Pamard evaluated his actions, considering them a success: “I immediately recognized the signs [...] fortunately I made no mistakes.”¹³⁰ In this description, Pamard clearly comes forth as the responsible physician who acted fast and practically when faced with disease.

Some of the lengthier descriptions also include passages that reinforced the caring and compassionate aspects of Pamard’s actions. They show how deeply he was touched by the suffering of his children. These passages often recounted personal interactions

¹³⁰ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 8, Entry for October 16, 1807: “Je reconnus en un mot tous les signes [...] heureusement je ne fus point trompé.”

between Pamard and his children, most notably conversations between them. In those cases, Pamard described in his notebook how he had gently asked his children how they felt and had recorded their answer in his notebook, often adding a reflection or interpretation of their answer to the notebook entry. On the twenty-second of July in 1807, Pamard wrote about such an encounter with his daughter, who at the time was suffering from a pulmonary condition and tried to cheer up her father who was expecting the worst: “don’t cry, she told me, I will smile, and she smiled in a truly touching and angelic way [...] The poor child, what a horrible condition! She’s weighed down by the sleep, she’s dying from the need to sleep, but the constant spitting doesn’t allow it.”¹³¹ In this episode, Pamard not only showed his sensitive side – he was apparently crying because of Virginie’s illness – but also demonstrated compassion by writing about the ‘horrible condition’ of Virginie and her constant struggle against the illness. Through the lengthy descriptions of his medical actions and encounters with his children Pamard thus also reinforced the compassionate aspects of his position as both father and physician. Pamard could not only read the signs immediately and act upon them, as the episode of the family trip showed, he was also a caring figure, sympathetic to the suffering of his children.

In their totality, the notebook sections on his children show Pamard’s need for self-reflection. They show an engaged father who was highly aware of both his parental and medical responsibilities and therefore felt the need to think and reflect upon his position and the events within his home. For Pamard, keeping a notebook was a way to

¹³¹ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 5, Entry for July 22, 1807: “ne pleure pas, me dit elle, je vais rire, et elle sourit en effet d’une manière touchante et angelique [...] Le pauvre enfant, quel état affreux! Elle était accablé de sommeil, elle mourait de besoin de dormir, mais les crac[hats] ne lui en laissaient pas de tems.”

meet this desire. If only because of his self-awareness Pamard was indeed ‘Romantic’. The label ‘Romantic’, however, is even more suitable if the image of the ideal parent and physician that was the result of his reflections is taken into account. Pamard’s self-fashioned identity indeed included all the qualities that scholars such as Hermione De Almeida and James Allard have attributed to the ‘Romantic physician’: concern for the suffering of others, caring and compassion, and personal responsibility.¹³² Moreover, it is remarkable how well the characteristics attributed to the ‘Romantic physician’ by these scholars, based on analyses of mostly poetry and medical textbooks, correspond with the self-image Pamard constructed through writing down medical observations. Pamard’s notebook therefore shows that the self-awareness and compassion of the ‘Romantic physician’ were fundamentally tied to both the observational method and the professional ideology of the early nineteenth century.

3.4. Reshaping Medical Expertise

The concept of ‘Romanticism’ is also useful to point to the scientific aspects of Pamard’s observations of his children. Following historian and literary scholar Alan Richardson’s definition, the concept involved “promoting feelings and emotions at the expense of ‘mere’ reason, [...] advancing the claims of the body, reassessing the significance of natural development, emphasizing sensation and sensibility, [and] prizing development and growth.” Using this framework, Richardson characterized the emerging brain science in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century as ‘Romantic’. For Richardson, the

¹³² De Almeida, *Romantic Medicine and John Keats*, 9-10, 34-38; Allard, *Romanticism, Medicine, and the Poet’s Body*, 11.

concept of ‘Romanticism’ functioned as a way to show the connections between brain science and literary culture in the early nineteenth century. As physicians were increasingly placing the brain at the center of the neural system and studying the relationship between body and mind, poets were creating a new language to describe subjective experiences. According to Richardson, both groups were dealing with the same broader – Romantic – questions and themes.¹³³

If Pamard’s notebook is placed within Richardson’s framework of ‘Romantic’ brain science, his descriptions of his children’s behavior and emotions and his own speculations on the brain as the site of illness gain a new scientific importance. It seems that the caring and compassionate attitude Pamard adopted in observing his children also opened up the behavioral and emotional state of his children as a fruitful area of medical research. The proximity Pamard enjoyed and cultivated allowed him to study certain aspects of disease more thoroughly. Emotions and behavior, which were at the core of Pamard’s parental gaze, became especially interesting medical phenomena. From this more scientific perspective, the experiences of the illnesses Pamard encountered within his own home seemed to have reshaped his medical ideas about the role of emotions and behavior in the disease process. Increasingly, Pamard paid more attention to these

¹³³ Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, 34-38. In his study, Richardson also provides an interesting discussion of the re-evaluation of Romanticism. According to Richardson, the Romantic Age was not just characterized by difference and diversity (compared to the universalism of the Enlightenment), but should be interpreted as an ‘embodied universalism’, which “rejected the ‘timeless’ universalism of the Enlightenment, which located human uniformity in reason, language, and logic, with a time-bound and biological universalism that instead grounded ‘primary’ human features in the body, in the material organization of the mind, and in the emotions.” Such a view of the Romantic period helps explain Richardson’s interest in physiological theories as manifestations of Romanticism: *Ibid.*, 151-152; In light of this discussion, the work of Allard should also be mentioned. Allard points in the introduction of his study on medicine and romanticism to the recent emergence of ‘Body Studies’ as an ‘interdisciplinary “field” of inquiry’, contributing to ‘a greater appreciation of the degree of interpenetration in literature and medicine, in literary- and medical-historical study’: Allard, *Romanticism, medicine, and the poet’s body*, 1.

emotional aspects and gave them an important place in his speculations on the etiology of the diseases from which his children were suffering.

For Pamard, the home became the laboratory in which he could closely monitor the development of diseases and especially the role of emotions and behavior in the disease process. The proximity of the physician to the patient within the home allowed him to study the ‘signs’ of the disease. As De Almeida has shown, early nineteenth-century physicians distinguished ‘symptoms’ from ‘signs’. While symptoms were linked to the patient’s subjective report, signs required the physician’s perception. Signs were the original and generative markers of the disease that could distinguish between diseases and hint at the developments over a longer period of time. In that sense, understanding the signs of the disease gave physicians some sort of predictive power and enhanced their knowledge of the disease process. What was needed to uncover these signs was the thorough engagement of the physician in the process of observation. Within the home such an engagement was possible.¹³⁴

Pamard believed his observations of the emotional state of his children could lead to exposing such signs. The strategy he used in his observational research was to first identify the ‘normal state’ of his children, ‘l’état normal’, and then look for changes in their emotional state that preceded the onset of illnesses. In October 1807, for example, Pamard’s daughter fainted and only regained consciousness after a while. In the following weeks these incidents – Pamard called them ‘accidens’ – happened more often and Pamard started looking for signs to predict them and understand the disease process better. Regarding a dinner party at their cousin’s home, Pamard wrote about his daughter:

¹³⁴ De Almeida, *Romantic Medicine and John Keats*, 49-50.

“We had hardly left the table when I recognized from her worried and serious look and her unwillingness of getting off my knees, on which I had placed her, that she didn’t feel at ease, I feared a new incident.”¹³⁵ Here, Pamard had noted a change in his daughter’s normal emotional state and immediately connected this to her medical condition. The predictive value of such an observation also reinforced Pamard’s self-image of a caring and responsible physician, as he could anticipate disease and act accordingly.

Viewing health as ‘l’état normal’ and illness as a deviation from it opened up many aspects of daily life in the home of the Pamard family to medical scrutiny. Especially the concept of ‘gaieté’, cheerfulness, proved to be flexible as Pamard equated this idea with the normal state of his children. The concept could cover both sentiments and practices. His children being ‘gaie’ could mean that they were enjoying their games in the garden or that they wanted to go for a walk or for a ride in the coach to Monplaisir, one of the green suburbs of Avignon. In describing these emotions Pamard used a rich vocabulary: he, for example, wrote of his daughter as being ‘charming’ or ‘vivacious’. Pamard seemed to explore the boundaries of his own literary skills as he tried to write detailed accounts of his children’s emotional states.¹³⁶

In his notebook, Pamard thus put health and an idealized view of family life on the same level. From that perspective, the home was indeed the perfect environment to study disease, since any deviation from Pamard’s idealized view of family life could be

¹³⁵ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Folio 1, Entry for October 26, 1806: “A peine fûmes nous sortis de table que je connus à son air occupé et sérieux, au soin qu’elle avait de ne pas quitter mes genoux sur lesquels je l’avais placée, qu’elle n’était pas à son aise, je craignais un nouvel accident.”

¹³⁶ Scholars interested in the ‘divide’ between the arts and the sciences have made the argument that detailed scientific observations are places where the arts and the sciences meet, especially in the Romantic period. Kuhn for example writes on the link between literary imagination and scientific observation: “the abundance of detail in the most rigorous empirical works betrays the natural historian’s enthusiasm for the visible splendors of the world”: Kuhn, *Autobiography and Natural Science*, 13.

put into medical terms. However, the realities of family life – and to a certain extent his position as a father – also limited Pamard’s efforts to use the home as a laboratory to study disease. His children, for example, were not passive objects of study but active players in the process of observation. They seemed to have realized their father’s preoccupation with their health and emotional state and at least one passage in the notebook hints at the fact that they sometimes pretended feeling sick to get to their room and play on the bed.¹³⁷ In the passage, Pamard saw through the play-acting of his children, but the episode nevertheless makes clear that the relation between the rigorous observations of the physician and the behavior of the patient was more complex than Pamard’s account of it. Pamard’s children saw him in the first place as their parent and tested his authority. For studying health and disease, parental proximity was not always beneficial. It is thus clear that there were also boundaries to the home as an ideal place to study the disease process.

Pamard, however, was naively unaware of these boundaries and displayed total confidence in his observational skills. Such confidence surely contributed to the great impact of his elaborate observations of the emotions and behavior of his children on his medical theories. Pamard’s investigations into the causes of his daughter’s faintings during the fall of 1807 illustrate this process. As said above, Pamard first looked for signs that preceded the fainting. Eventually, he established an etiology of the illness in which ‘sentiments affectueux’, affectionate feelings, played a key role as signs, ‘signes’ in

¹³⁷ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 2, Entry for May 11, 1807. Of course for Pamard, the passage reinforced his ability as a physician to differentiate between ‘true’ and ‘false’ signs.

Pamard's words.¹³⁸ For Pamard, these emotional signs hinted at the underlying cause of the disease. The shift from cheerful to serious and affectionate told Pamard that the illness was linked to the brain. In this case, Pamard's focus on emotions in his observations of the disease process had led to a physiological explanation that included the brain as the place and origin of the disease.

In his speculations and interests regarding the role of the brain in the disease process, Pamard joined in with the developing research lines of the early nineteenth century. Physicians such as Pierre-Jean-George Cabanis (1757-1808), who drew on the French anti-dualist tradition that located the mind in the body and sought the explanation of its abilities not in the soul but in the specific organization of the brain and the body in general, were developing more complex and organic theories of the relation between brain and mind. Cabanis, for example, argued that the brain digested impressions as the stomach digested food and saw the brain as the center of the nervous system.¹³⁹ It is difficult to assess whether Pamard was aware of these studies and had, for example, read Cabanis's *On the Relations between the Physical and Moral Aspects of Man*, which was published in the late 1790s. It seems that Pamard at least knew the general ideas of this developing field and took the interaction between the mind and the body seriously. In the

¹³⁸ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 7, Entry for August 18, 1807.

¹³⁹ Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, 17-19. Richardson also describes how Cabanis' position evolved to supporting a theory of the embodied character of human cognition and its gradual development in a living desiring being. Among the early-nineteenth-century scientists Richardson studied, the theme of 'development' gained increased importance, for example in Franz Joseph Gall's (1758 -1828) theories of degrees of development. From that perspective, it is worth mentioning that Pamard throughout his notes also monitored the development of his children. One of his letters even indicated that he ordered the tables of the development of children drawn up by the the French physician François Chaussier (1746-1828). See: Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, 19-21; PFA, WL, 18, S-63, Letter of 1 Prairial XI (May 25, 1803) of Pamard to Duroucet. On Chaussier, see: *Dictionnaire de Médecine et de Chirurgie Pratique*, ed. Andral et. al. (Paris: Méquignon-Marvis, J.B. Baillière, 1831), vol. 6, 332.

summer of 1806, for example, Pamard speculated in his notebook on the cause of his daughter's indigestion and concluded that her emotional state had started the illness. According to Pamard, Virginie's illness had been caused by the thought that her father was mad at her for pushing around her brother, whose finger eventually got trapped in the door.¹⁴⁰ Pamard's concluding reflection was typical of the many speculations on the role of emotions in his notebook during the late 1800s. Especially his interest in facial expressions, exemplified by his theory of 'affectionate feelings' in 1807, was crucial. Pamard undoubtedly was unaware of – or at least never referred to – the work of Charles Bell (1774-1842), published one year earlier in 1806, *The Anatomy and Philosophy of Expressions, As Connected with the Fine Arts*, in which Bell explores facial expressions as places to study the union between mind, brain, and body. Bell advocated the close observation of expressions of feelings as the road to new neurological discoveries.¹⁴¹ Pamard never went as far as Bell in his observations of facial expressions, and never made the same radical claims of the relation between mind, body, and brain as Cabanis, but he did seem to have shared the same interests into these developing lines of research.

Over the course of the first decade of the nineteenth century, Pamard's medical ideas thus seemed to have changed profoundly under the influence of the close observation of his children. Starting with his speculations and Vaulier's suggestion on the cause of Virgile's death, and continuing with Virginie's illnesses and faintings later on, Pamard was always questioning the relation between the brain and the bowels as the places of illness. While his behavioral observations pushed him towards greater emphasis

¹⁴⁰ PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Entries for August 24 and 25, 1806.

¹⁴¹ Richardson, *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*, 33-34.

on the brain, his long-established medical views and his other observations, including studying stools and spitting, led him to direct his attention to the bowels. Regarding Virginie's illness, for example, the occurrence of both types of observations and 'signs' made him feel uncertain and question the relation between these parts of the body. During such reflections, emotions again became mixed with medical observations and Pamard even went back as far as Virgile's death: "But if it's the brain itself that is suffering, what then is the cause that irritates it and disturbs its functions at intervals? Virgile died hydrocephalous. I strongly believe this. The same [...] might be happening to Mini [Virginie]." ¹⁴² His reflections eventually seemed to have guided Pamard to thinking of Virgile's and Virginie's illness as a hereditary condition. This episode thus shows how Pamard's medical practices and theories changed dramatically over a period of almost ten years, from 1801 when Virgile died to early 1808 when Virginie's illness was the most intense. Pamard's observations of his children in his notebook bear witness of the impact of the personal experiences of illness and suffering in his own home upon his medical theories. Those close and personal encounters, determined by the proximity of the parent-child relationship, thoroughly reshaped his medical views, putting greater emphasis on behavior and emotions in the disease process. Because of this increased emphasis, Pamard's observations were also 'Romantic', following Richardson's characterization, from a scientific point of view.

¹⁴² PFA, WL, 15, S-54, Inserted folio 9, Entry for January 4, 1808: "Mais si c'est le cerveau même qui souffre, quelle est la cause qui l'irrite et trouble ses fonctions par intervalles? Virgile mourut hydrocephal[ique]. Je le crois fort[ement]. La même ppe. parrait faire sentir ses effets à Mini."

Conclusion

The French surgeon Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard belonged to a generation of learned men who gave their own interpretation to the eighteenth-century intellectual tradition. Pamard's image as a learned man in the early nineteenth century shows the blending of old and new elements, some of which some can certainly be called 'Romantic'. The way Pamard constructed such an identity seems typical of the changing circumstances of intellectual life in the first decade of the nineteenth century.

Pamard built his image as a learned man upon older intellectual traditions. Just like his father Pierre Pamard, whose career formed a model for his own professional development, Pamard stressed the engagement of the ideal 'physician-savant' in the local community. In such a view, the learned man should 'serve the community' and be part of it by keeping close relations with the political leaders and working within the community's religious – in Avignon: Christian – framework. This ideology certainly fits with the research of historian Elizabeth Williams on the local embedment of physicians who worked in the intellectual tradition of Montpellier medicine. Pamard's image as a learned man was also in line with the standards of the eighteenth-century Republic of Letters. In establishing himself as a learned man, he followed the behavioral rules of learned correspondence, showing his literary interests and qualities and sharing personal news to strengthen friendly ties. Similarly, he fit his studies in the intellectual framework of institutions such as the Académie de Vaucluse by presenting them as broad literary works.

Pamard's self-fashioning efforts also demonstrate the changing circumstances of career development in the intellectual community in the 1800s. The public health movement of the early nineteenth century called for a more public role of the locally embedded physician. To position himself as a locally engaged health expert, Pamard needed to translate scientific knowledge to a broad audience and enter Avignon's public scene. His promotional efforts also show the necessity of being able to talk to various audiences and frame one's studies accordingly. In the learned community after the revolutionary period, in which institutional affiliation became increasingly important, Pamard needed to be flexible in the way he presented his studies. Pamard's promotion of his medical topography of Avignon illustrates this. He indeed skillfully presented the work in a way that met the expectations of various audiences; stressing the advisory component to the political establishment, the literary value to the members of learned societies, and the exemplary role as a work of 'local knowledge' to younger colleagues.

Some of the elements, typical of the early nineteenth century, that Pamard accentuated in his image of a learned man, can be characterized as 'Romantic'. The way Pamard, for example, presented himself as an intermediary between the scientific world and the broad audience and used literary forms to convey scientific knowledge resonates with the emphasis on the development of expertise and the forms of knowledge production in the scholarship on 'Romantic science'. Pamard's self-image was also 'Romantic' because of the way he tried to fit his parental emotions into his broader identity. He not only integrated an image of a caring father into the way he presented himself to his colleagues, but also dealt with emotions more privately in his notebook,

constructing a mutually constitutive image of a responsible physician and a caring father. Such efforts fit in with the research on 'Romantic medicine' and its emphasis on the early nineteenth century as an important period for the development of medical ethics. Pamard's notebook indeed shows the struggles with the subjectivity of observations in doing medical research, requiring Pamard to position himself more carefully as a parent and physician.

Although Pamard thus seems typical of a generation of men who built their careers in the intellectual culture of the early nineteenth century and displayed an increased self-awareness and interest in emotions, there were also some peculiarities to Pamard's situation. First, Pamard was highly aware of his 'responsibility' to secure the continuation of the surgical tradition of the Pamard family. He seems almost obsessed with living up to the standards of his father and making sure he would have a son that would also become a surgeon of some reputation. Second, Pamard's efforts were also characterized by his position as a medical man in the small town of Avignon. He occupied a position in the middle between physicians and surgeons who practiced in the countryside and prominent medical men in Paris and Montpellier. Both peculiarities of Pamard's situation certainly influenced the way he presented himself a learned man, making him a somewhat less typical member of the learned community. However, when these peculiarities are taken into account, this study nevertheless provides an insightful perspective into the changes in the intellectual culture of the early nineteenth century, showing how Pamard blended old and new elements in constructing an identity as a

learned man, and indeed gave his own ‘Romantic interpretation to the eighteenth-century intellectual tradition.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Pamard Family Archive, Wangensteen Library at the University of Minnesota

(unpublished)

2, S-18, “De l’électricité.”

4, S-30, “Son Excellence Monsieur Durini.”

5, S-32, “Eloge de mon père.”

5, S-38, “Avis au public. Sur le danger des inhumations précipitées.”

6, S-43, “Records of Lithotomies.”

6, S-44, “Vaccination records.”

9, S-47, “Records of Cataract Operation.”

12 and 14, S-50, “Case Records.”

15, S-51, “Lecture notes ‘course de médecine pratique’.”

15, S-52, “Lecture notes on anatomy & surgery (surgery lectures of Philippe Jean Pelletan).”

15, S-53, “Draft of opening lecture of anatomy course.”

15, S-54, “Journal d’ observations sur moi-même.”

15 and 16, S-55, “Météorology.”

17, S-56, "Secretarial copy of Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet Pamard, *Topographie Physique et Médical d'Avignon et de son territoire accompagnée de quelques réflexions politiques et économiques à mesure que le sujet les fournira* (Avignon: 1802)."

18, S-61 and S-62, "Literary notes."

18, S-63, "Correspondence."

19, S-64, "Correspondence."

19, S-66, "Lettre du Citoyen Pamard."

19, S-69, "Ordre de la Séance publique de l'Institut de Santé de Gard."

Published Sources

Addison, Joseph. "Nullum numen abest si sit Prudentia -Juv. Sat. x. 365. Prudence supplies the want of every good." *The Spectator* (17 Nov. 1711).

Biographie universelle et portative des contemporains ou dictionnaire historique des hommes vivants et morts depuis 1788 jusqu'à nos jours, edited by Vieille de Boisjollin, Alphonse Rabbe, and Charles Augustin Sainte-Beuve. Paris: 1836.

Centenaire de l'Académie de Vaucluse, 1801-1901, Mémoires et Comptes Rendus. Avignon: François Seguin, 1901.

Colon, François. *Histoire de la vaccine en France*. Paris: 1801.

Dictionnaire de Médecine et de Chirurgie Pratique, edited by Andral et. al. Paris: Méquignon-Marvis, J.B. Baillière, 1831.

Lessere, P. “Coup d’Oeil Générale Sur les Sensations et les Idées qui en sont la suite; conséquences qu’on peut en tirer relativement à l’éducation.” In *Les Maladies des Yeux*. Paris: 1809.

Mémoires de l’Athenée de Vaucluse contenant le compte rendu des travaux de cette Société depuis son institution; et le Recueil des ouvrages en prose et en vers, lu à la séance publique le 2 Brumaire an xii. Avignon: Alph. Berenguier, 1804.

Michaud, Louis Gabriel. *Biographie universelle ancienne et moderne ou histoire, par ordre alphabétique, de la vie publique et privée de tous les hommes qui se sont fait remarquer de leurs écrits, leurs actions, leurs talents, leurs vertus or leur crimes*. Paris: 1855.

Pamard, Jean-Baptiste Antoine Bénézet. “Eloge de M. Pamard. Lu à la Séance publique de l’Athenée de Vaucluse le 5 Vendémiaire an XI (September 27, 1802).” In *Un contemporain de Daviel. Les Oeuvres de Pierre-François Bénézet Pamard, Chirurgien et Oculist 1728-1793*, edited by Alfred Pamard and Pierre Pansier, 397-409. Paris: Masson et C., 1900.

Idem. “Observation sur une tumeur rare et singulière située sous la langue et s’étendant beaucoup au-dessus du menton avec la description du procédé et l’histoire du traitement.” *ASMPM* (1805): 156.

Idem. “Observation sur une tumeur singulière de la mâchoire inférieure.” *ASMPM* (1807): 416-419.

Idem. “Mémoire sur quelques tumeurs de la tête et notamment sur celles qui portent le nom de taupe ou de tortue.” *ASMPM* 9(1808): 201-334.

Pamard, Paul Antoine Marie. *De la cataracte et de son extraction par un procédé particulier*. Paris: 1825.

Pazzis, Maxime. *Mémoire Statistique sur le Département de Vaucluse*. Carpentras: D.G. Quenin, 1808.

Secondary Sources

Allard, James Robert. *Romanticism, Medicine, and the Poet's body*. Aldershot and Burlington: Ashgate, 2007.

Bercé, Yves-Marie. *Le Chaudron et la Lancette: Croyances Populaires et Médecine Préventive, 1798-1830*. Paris: Presses de la Renaissance, 1984.

Brockliss, Laurence. *Calvet's Web: Enlightenment and the Republic of Letters in Eighteenth-Century France*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.

Brockliss, Laurence and Colin Jones. *The Medical World of Early Modern France*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997.

De Almeida, Hermione. *Romantic Medicine and John Keats*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991.

Deming, Alison Hawthorne. "Science and Poetry: A View from the Divide." In *The Measured Word: on Poetry and Science*, edited by Kurt Brown, 181-197. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2001.

Durban, Robert G. "The Introduction of the Practice of Vaccination into Napoleonic France." *Bulletin of the History of Medicine* 5(1941): 635-650.

- Goldbarth, Albert. "Introduction." in *The Measured Word: on Poetry and Science*, edited by Kurt Brown, IX-XII. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2001.
- Hannaway, Caroline. "Medicine, Public Welfare and the State in Eighteenth Century France: The Société Royale de Médecine of Paris (1776-1793)." PhD diss., Johns Hopkins University, 1976.
- Heringman, Noah. "Introduction: The Commerce of Literature and Natural History." In *Romantic Science: The Literary Forms of Natural History*, edited by Noah Heringman, 1-19. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2003.
- Hirschberg, Julius. *The History of Ophthalmology*. 11 vols. Bonn: Verlag J.P. Wayenborgh, 1982.
- Holub, Miroslav. "The Science of Poetry/The Poetry of Science." In *The Measured Word: on Poetry and Science*, edited by Kurt Brown, 47-68. Athens: University of Georgia Press, 2001.
- Jannetta, Ann. *The Vaccinators: Smallpox, Medical Knowledge, and the Opening of Japan*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2007.
- Jones, Colin. *The Charitable Imperative: Hospitals and Nursing in Ancien Regime and Revolutionary France*. London and New York: Routledge, 1989.
- Jordonova, Ludmilla. *Languages of Nature: Critical Essays on Science and Literature*. London: Free Association Books, 1986.
- Kuhn, Bernhard. *Autobiography and Natural Science in the Age of Romanticism: Rousseau, Goethe, Thoreau*. Farnham and Burlington: Ashgate, 2009.

- La Berge, Ann F. *Mission and Method: The Early Nineteenth-Century French Public Health Movement*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
- Midgley, Mary. *Science and Poetry*. London and New York: Routledge, 2001.
- Morel, Marie-France. "City and Country in Eighteenth-Century Medical Discussions about Early Childhood." In *Medicine and Society in France* (Selections from the *Annales. Economies, Sociétés, Civilisations*: 6), edited by Robert Forster and Orest A. Ranum, 48-65. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980.
- Pamard, Alfred, and Pierre Pansier. *Un contemporain de Daviel. Les Oeuvres de Pierre-François Bénézet Pamard, Chirurgien et Oculist 1728-1793*. Paris: Masson et C., 1900.
- Pansier, Pierre. *Les médecins d'Avignon à l'Académie de Vaucluse en 1801*. s.d. [ca. 1901]. Pansier, Pierre. "Les Médecins de l'Académie de Vaucluse en 1801." In *Centenaire de l'Académie de Vaucluse, 1801-1901, Mémoires et comptes rendus*, 24-67. Avignon: 1901.
- Ramsey, Matthew. *Professional and Popular Medicine in France, 1770-1830. The Social World of Medical Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Richardson, Alan. *British Romanticism and the Science of the Mind*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
- Smeaton, William Arthur. *Fourcroy: Chemist and Revolutionary, 1755-1809*. Cambridge: Heffer and Sons, 1962.
- Williams, Elizabeth Ann. "The French revolution: Anthropological Medicine, and the Creation of Medical Authority." In *Re-creating Authority in Revolutionary France*, edited by Bryant T. Ragan and Elizabeth Ann Williams, 79-97. New Brunswick: Rutgers

University Press, 1992. Idem. *The Physical and the Moral: Anthropology, Physiology, and Philosophical Medicine in France, 1750-1850*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994.

Idem. *A Cultural History of Montpellier Vitalism in Enlightenment Montpellier*. Aldershot and Burlington: Ashgate, 2003.